



VISION IAS

www.visionias.in

GENERAL STUDIES (TEST CODE : 634)

Name of Candidate	ASHISH TIWARI		
Medium Hindi/Eng.	English	Registration Number	15633
Center	Rajinder Nagar.	Date	02/12/15

INDEX TABLE

Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained
1(a)	10	
1(b)	10	
2(a)	10	
2(b)	10	
3(a)	10	
3(b)	10	
4(a)	10	
4(b)	10	
5(a)	10	
5(b)	10	
6	10	
7	10	
8	10	
9	20	
10	20	
11	20	
12	20	
13	20	
14	20	

Total Marks Obtained:

Remarks:

Signature of Examiner

INSTRUCTIONS

- Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, Registration Number and Test Code).
उत्तर पुस्तिका में सूचनाएं भरना आवश्यक है (नाम, प्रश्न-पत्र कोड, विद्यार्थी क्रमांक आदि)।
- There are FOURTEEN questions printed in HINDI and ENGLISH. इसमें चौदह प्रश्न हैं तथा हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी दोनों में छपे हैं।
- All questions are compulsory. सभी प्रश्न अनिवार्य हैं।
- The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.
प्रत्येक प्रश्न/भाग के अंक उसके सामने दिए गए हैं।
- Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one.
प्रश्नों के उत्तर उसी माध्यम में लिखे जाने चाहिए जिसका उल्लेख आपके प्रवेश पत्र में किया गया है और उस माध्यम का स्पष्ट उल्लेख प्रश्न-सह-उत्तर (क्यूसीए) पुस्तिका के मुख्य पृष्ठ पर अंकित निर्दिष्ट स्थान पर किया जाना चाहिए। उल्लिखित माध्यम के अतिरिक्त अन्य किसी माध्यम में लिए गए उत्तर पर कोई अंक नहीं मिलेंगे।
- Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to.
प्रश्नों में शब्द सीमा, जहाँ विनिर्दिष्ट है, का अनुसरण किया जाना चाहिए।
- Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.
उत्तर पुस्तिका में खाली छोड़ा हुआ पृष्ठ या उसके अंश को स्पष्ट रूप से काटा जाना चाहिए।

75, 3rd Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi – 110060

103, 1st Floor, B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi – 110009

EVALUATION INDICATORS

1. Alignment Competence
2. Context Competence
3. Content Competence
4. Language Competence
5. Introduction Competence
6. Structure - Presentation Competence
7. Conclusion Competence

Overall Macro Comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

6.

All the Best

SECTION - A

Answer the following questions in not more than 150 words each:

1. (a) Even though women may have equal skills, qualifications and commitment as men, they face much more difficulty in rising up the leadership hierarchy. Discuss the reasons for the same. Also, explain the importance of having gender parity in positions of leadership. 10

पुरुषों के समान कुशलता, योग्यता और प्रतिबद्धता जैसे गुणों से युक्त होने के बावजूद भी महिलाओं को नेतृत्व श्रृंखला में उच्च सोपानों तक पहुँचने के लिए अपेक्षाकृत अधिक कठिनाई का सामना करना पड़ता है। समस्या की पृष्ठभूमि में निहित कारणों पर चर्चा कीजिये। इसके साथ ही नेतृत्व के विविध स्तरों पर लैंगिक समानता के महत्व का उल्लेख कीजिए।

→ Our Society, both at global as well as at national level is biased towards men in terms of leadership positions, Reason of same being -

- (i) traditionally feminist value system of women like love, compassion, which are often seen as unwanted in leadership positions.
- (ii) Responsibilities of women in their personal life such as childcare, family pressure etc. hamper their growth.
- (iii) Patriarchal mindset of our society tends to avoid giving women any responsibility

(iv) organisational work culture is not too accomodative of women as a leader, as male dominance is challenged.

ex. Recently women collectors of district often face problem in gender equality while carrying out their duties.

Importance of Gender parity:

- (i) According to McKinsey global Institute, gender disparity reduces GDP of a nation by 3-4 %.
- (ii) In positions of leadership, the corruption, ~~efficiency~~ is reduced, because of generally ~~are~~ non-tolerance of women.

It is in this context, Govt. of India through recent amendment to Companies Act, has made position of one women director on Board a mandatory.

1. (b) All correct decisions are honest and all incorrect decisions are dishonest. Do you agree? How should the correctness and incorrectness of a decision be decided?

10

सभी सही निर्णय ईमानदारी भरे होते हैं और सभी गलत निर्णय बेईमानी भरे होते हैं। क्या आप सहमत हैं? किसी निर्णय के सही होने और गलत होने का निर्धारण किस प्रकार किया जाना चाहिए।

→ ~~At~~ Correctness and incorrectness of a decision shall be determined on the basis of-

- (i) Consequence of the action.
- (ii) Ethical Considerations (intention) involved. for example, whether touching a woman in to save her from falling the ladder or with wrong intention of molesting her.
- (iii) Equity approach — As Gandhiji has preached, whenever you doubt, think of poorest man, and decide whether your action is going to positively affect him or not.
- (iv) Virtue of person — the correctness of a decision by

virtue of person giving decision.
(Aristotelian ethical).

Thus, to determine ethicality
& correctness of a decision
above parameters must be
considered.

on similar lines, All correct
decisions can not be honest
for example - cheating in examination
though fulfill consequence of
passing but it can not be
held honest decision.

on other hand, all
Incorrect decisions can also not
be dishonest, for example
pragmatism (intent) demands that
tax be evaded, because it works
for benefit of company, but
it is dishonest decision.

Thus, Evaluation of correctness
& incorrectness must be ~~evaluated~~
done on basis of purpose.

2. (a) Should birth control be a voluntary exercise or a government policy in a country? In this regard, examine the ethical dimensions of having a One Child Policy in India.

10

किसी राष्ट्र में जन्म पर नियंत्रण, स्वैच्छिक प्रयास के माध्यम से होना चाहिए या सरकारी नीति के माध्यम से होना चाहिए? इस संबंध में, भारत में एक बच्चे की नीति के नैतिक आयामों का परीक्षण कीजिए।

One child policy is often aimed at reducing population of a nation and some nation such as china consider it as their genuine right on pretext of nation building.

Arguments for voluntary exercise:

- (i) It will give a sustainable policy, as conscience of a person will drive his desire for family and since law can not be enforced always, therefore conscience enforcer both spirit & letter of policy.
- (ii) Fundamental Rights of citizens are enshrined in our Constitution hold the Right to life & freedom, thus it would

be unethical going against collective will of the Society reflected through Constitution.

Government policy arguments:

- (i) Any fundamental right can be restricted on pretext of national welfare, thus policy can put reasonable restriction.
- (ii) In India, our democratic value as well as human values of Compassion, love will get undermined, because very few percentage of our population use Contraceptive and in presence of one child policy, there will be huge cases of abortion, thus exposing our society to fallacy of hypocrisy.

Thus, Individuals must be voluntarily choosing their children, although awareness may be spread.

2. (b) An organisation consists of a variety of individuals with varying values and degrees of motivation. What challenges do leaders face when forging a harmonious work culture in such an organisation? How can leaders engender a sense of inclusion in face of such diversity? 10

एक संगठन का निर्माण अलग-अलग मूल्यों और अलग-अलग अभिप्रेरणा स्तर वाले विविध प्रकार के व्यक्तियों से होता है। इस प्रकार के संगठन में सामंजस्यपूर्ण कार्य-संस्कृति के विकास के मार्ग में नेतृत्व के द्वारा किन चुनौतियों का सामना किया जाता है? इस प्रकार की विविधतापूर्ण स्थिति में नेतृत्व के द्वारा कार्य करने वाले व्यक्तियों में समावेशिता की अनुभूति किस प्रकार समाविष्ट की जा सकती है?

Indian Society particularly is a mix of diverse culture, language, value system, thus in organizations, there are always human elements at work, which drive the success or failure of organisation. It is the capability of a leader as to how to channelise this polynormative assemblage assemblage of human towards success.

Challenges leaders face:

- Different ethical criterion of Individuals, thus lack of Consensus.
- Formation of sub-groupings

based on primordial identities,
thus separation of team spirit -
- leaders are not able to take
~~decision~~ disciplinary action
against any member, because
of resistance of group members.

What leaders should do :

- (i) All decisions shall be based on deliberation.
for ex. - when holidays are limited,
then, whether Diwali requires 3
days holiday or can be reduced
to 2 days to accommodate 1
day for Eid, thus consensus
will ensure success.
- (ii) leading changes in institutions
by virtue of rules, regulations, etc.
or to inculcate organisational
principles in humans.
- (iii) Assigning roles according to
value system & level of motivation.

3. (a) Notwithstanding compassion and morality, it is national interest that ultimately determines a country's decisions in international relations. Discuss this statement in the context of the current refugee crisis. 10

दया और नैतिकता जैसे मूल्यों का महत्वपूर्ण स्थान होते हुए भी, अंतर्राष्ट्रीय संबंधों के परिप्रेक्ष्य में अंततः राष्ट्र के निर्णयों को राष्ट्रिय हितों के आधार पर ही निर्धारित किया जाता है। वर्तमान शरणार्थी संकट के संदर्भ में इस कथन पर चर्चा करें।

In International Ethics, it is generally National interest that comes at top without any Rider. In context of Current refugee crisis, following ethical dimensions emerge -

- (i) National Interest often accuse refugees as taking their share of national resources.
- (ii) Right of non-retalment, non-discrimination as mandated by refugee Convention.
- (iii) mixing or invading of new culture on host nations, thus fear of Xenophobia drive hatred against refugees.

(iv) on the other hand, feeling of humanitarianism demand abode for refugee.

With current refugee entering Europe estimated to be of neary 5.5 million and many more to come, the Xenophobia is on the rise, but considering the desperate attempts made by refugee to flee persecution, they demand humanit as per Covenants of United Nations Human Rights Convention.

Thus, while National Interest is Sovereign, due deliberation and accomodating have been part of long human history, what is required is 'integration' of this history with current national interest by using prefegees as an asset.

3. (b) What are the ethical issues involved in climate change negotiations? Suggest some strategies to address the divergence in ethical positions of different nations.

10

जलवायु परिवर्तन पर होने वाली वार्ताओं में समाहित नैतिक मुद्दे क्या हैं? विभिन्न राष्ट्रों के नैतिक मुद्दों से संबंधित दृष्टिकोण में जो भिन्नता है, उसके का समाधान के लिए अपनाई जा सकने वाली रणनीतियों का सुझाव दीजिये।

— Climate change in long run is going to affect us all, the difference lies in the timing of impact, while Pacific Island Ocean nations are facing threat now, USA may face it later, thus it becomes our Common Responsibility.

Various Ethical Issues involved are :

(i) while developed nations have been responsible for most of GHG emission post Industrial Revolution, thus the impact on Island nations must be reduced with help from those responsible.

(ii) while emerging economies

like India, Africa are yet to provide fruits of growth to their population, ~~their~~ limitation on their growth will under in violation of principles of Natural Justice.

(iii) Adaptation & mitigation Capabilities differ from country to country.

(iv) If we go beyond humans, then animals, forests are already facing brunt of extinction due to climate change.

Strategies to address divergence:

- Deliberation on voluntary Commitment in form of INDC.
- Principle of Equity must be dubbed with CBDR.
- elaborate and progressive binding commitments can be taken, as Countries like India are poised to grow in future, thus limiting them.

4. (a) Why is there a need for Performance Management System in an outcome oriented government? Evaluate the feasibility of peer review in context of Indian civil services. 10

एक परिणामोन्मुख सरकार में "कार्यनिष्पादन प्रबंधन प्रणाली" की आवश्यकता क्यों है? भारतीय लोक सेवाओं के संदर्भ में "सहकर्मी समीक्षा" (peer review) के औचित्य का मूल्यांकन कीजिए।

— Performance management system helps (a) align the organizational requirements with Individual or desires.

(b) Judge the suitability of a candidate for a job.

(c) give a feedback to organization.

(d) promote ethical behaviour & commitment by rewarding performance.

When Governments responding to public demands and outcomes becoming more important than output, performance management gains significance.

for example - If performance of an employee, say teacher, is linked to his pay, then he

will give more efforts for improving learning outcome of children, rather than in a condition, when neither he is being individually monitored nor getting incentives for performance.

Thus, Performance management has gained importance and 2nd ARC recommended for linking Performance with Payment & Promotion.

Peer Review system is being followed in Indian Navy, whereby findings are validated using feedback of peers.

But peer review system requires objective evaluation parameters & revalidation, because Indian civil services are ridden with sub-groups, antagonistic behaviours, which may hurt whole system.

4. (b) Discretionary power in the hands of public servants is a necessary evil. Discuss.

10

लोक सेवकों के हाथों में विवेकाधीन शक्तियाँ एक आवश्यक बुराई हैं। चर्चा कीजिए।

— Since law can not specify each & every aspect of an application, thus discretionary powers are required.

The application of a law & rule formed by civil servants in view of delegated legislation requires subjective evaluation of situation and thus discretion becomes prominent feature of civil service.

For example - In case of Uttarakhand flood disaster, Indian Air force choppers were put into service for lifting people, but since law can not specify, who should be rescued first, if old citizens, are to be lifted then what about a pregnant woman, leaving her would be a travesty of

Justice, thus discretionary Powers are given.

— In a Riot affected area, whether to use force or not is a discretion of DM, if rigid laws are made, he may face problems in curbing riot.

But on the other hand, it is an evil because, if not used objectively, it can create havoc. for example- whether to impose Section 144 of Crpc is discretion of DM, but if he does so on pretext of political rally of opposition party on direction of government, it would circumvent the democratic feature of nation.

Thus, Discretion along with necessary oversight by civil society is required.

5. (a) The landmark judgment by the Supreme Court of India recognized the transgender as a third sex. What attitudes do you notice towards the transgender people in India? Discuss some steps to facilitate a dignified life for the transgender people.

10

भारत के सर्वोच्च न्यायालय द्वारा दिए गए ऐतिहासिक निर्णय से ट्रांसजेंडर्स को तृतीय लिंग के रूप में मान्यता दी गई है। आप भारतीय परिस्थितियों में ट्रांसजेंडर्स समुदाय के लोगों के प्रति किन अभिवृत्तियों की अनुभूति करते हैं। ट्रांसजेंडर्स के लिए गरिमापूर्ण जीवन निर्माण की दिशा में उठाए जा सकने वाले कदमों के संबंध में चर्चा कीजिए।

- In NALSA v/s Union of India

Supreme Court recognized the transgender as a third sex and thus directed government to do necessary amendment in its proceedings, it marks a history in democratic ideals of nation.

This was required, because transgender often faced bias towards them by well-offs of society, ~~because~~
Such as -

- (i) Separate homes & areas of cities were marked for them.
- (ii) Even government had bias towards them since it forced them to identify them as

one of the genders either male or female, thus circumventing their Fundamental Rights.

(iii) Transgender children used to be ~~decreased~~ by left by their parents only to be helped by transgenders.

While we saw their presence in holy functions such as marriage or auspicious but we did not want them in our social mainstream.

Steps:

- Awareness campaign.
- Empowerment of them through Renovation or remarked by SC in Jat renovation case.
- Involving them in various societal gathering.

As Gandhiji has said - "An eye for an eye will make whole world blind", thus mainstreaming is required.

5. (b) What key characteristics of a person conveying a message make it more persuasive? When celebrities endorse a product, they do so knowing that their endorsement will persuade people to buy it. What duty do they have towards the consumers?

10

संदेश देने वाले व्यक्ति की कौन-सी महत्वपूर्ण विशेषताएँ संदेश को और अधिक आग्रहपूर्ण बनाती हैं? जब ख्याति प्राप्त व्यक्ति किसी उत्पाद का विज्ञापन करते हैं, तो वे ऐसा यह जानते हुए करते हैं कि उनके द्वारा किसी वस्तु का किया गया विज्ञापन, लोगों को वह वस्तु खरीदने हेतु प्रेरित करेगा। इस सन्दर्भ में उपभोक्ताओं के प्रति उनके क्या दायित्व हैं?

Persuasion is a process of conveying one's belief system to others in a voluntary manner by way of dialogue, role playing, negotiation. It plays an important role in changing one's value system & behaviour. In this process persuader's following characteristics facilitate message -

- (i) Personality of person.
- (ii) His virtues and past record.
- (iii) His alignment with message, he is conveying. for example - a terrorist persuading people regarding peace might not go well with audience.

Since ~~set~~ celebrities endorse a product on pretext of their acceptance in masses and that's why they charge hefty price for it, because they carry that appeal among masses. But they have following duties:

- (i) As a responsible citizen, they must endorse a product based on merit only. for example - An actor vouching for smoking is against ethical norms.
 - (ii) they must work for greater cause i.e. on utilitarian principle when maximum good for maximum people can be ensured. for example - Kareena Kapoor acting as Brand ambassador of UNICEF is ethical, as it promotes humanity.
- Thus, they must endorse a product after due evaluation.

6. It is said that child labor cannot be ethical at all. Do you agree? Discuss with respect to the proposed amendments to the Child Labour Act. 10
यह कहा जाता है कि बाल-श्रम किसी भी परिस्थिति में नैतिक नहीं हो सकता। क्या आप सहमत हैं? बाल-श्रम अधिनियम में प्रस्तावित संशोधनों के संदर्भ में चर्चा कीजिए।

— Saying that child labor is unethical would be to see it through prism of deontological ethics, whereby an act is unethical, if it can't be performed always.

on the other hand, the children ~~is~~^{are} an asset to family and if poor families, if take help of their work in household matters, then it can not be treated as unethical, because child also has certain duties towards his/her family.

It is in this grey area, conflict arise, whereby quantification of work as domestic help or exploitation

in factories & mines demand
due deliberation.

Recent Amendment to
child labour Act puts forward
that a child may be allowed
to work for family help, if
he is doing such work after
completing schooling in the day.

while Act continues to
prohibit work in mines/hotels
until he attains an age of
14 years, this act strikes a
Balance between the Right to
education of child and his
Right to work.

In India, when more
than 30% of families are below
poverty line, child's help, if taken
after due consideration to schooling,
must be allowed, even rich families
children sit in shops, ~~so allow~~

7. Are emotions an inhibiting factor in effective decision-making? Discuss in the context of public services. 10

क्या भावनाएं प्रभावपूर्ण निर्णय लेने के मार्ग में बाधक तत्व हैं? लोक सेवाओं के संदर्भ में चर्चा कीजिए।

→ Emotions are our attributes, ~~we~~ which assign on the basis of our value system in a situation. for example- fear, anger, Patience etc.

Traditionally, it was held that emotions are inhibiting factor in decision making, but it was goleman, who established that Emotional Intelligence can lead to success more than Intelligence alone.

Emotions are inhibitory, when not managed effectively.
for example- In a Riot, if someone abuses DM and DM by virtue of his anger orders fire, then it will only aggravate

the situation.

on the contrary, if emotions are managed successfully, then they can act as a boon for organization. for example - In an situation, where demolition of temple is being carried out to widen a road, if DM/public servant understands the emotions of crowd, which truly revere the shrine, then he can offer solutions such as relocation of temple, narrowing of area to give way ~~of~~ for road, thus may diffuse the situation, But if he changes violently, he may create a riot.

Thus, public services are today getting complex day by day, thus, use of emotions in an effective way helps public servants.

8. What do you understand by the Sarvodaya philosophy of Gandhiji? Why is Sarvodaya relevant for civil servants in India? 10

गांधीजी के सर्वोदय दर्शन से आप क्या समझते हैं? भारत में लोक सेवकों के लिए सर्वोदय क्यों प्रासंगिक है?

Gandhiji's Sarvodaya philosophy believed in welfare for all & welfare of all, he believed that our actions must be guided in such a way that everyone, particularly the poorest of the poor gets benefitted out of it.

His philosophy of Sarvodaya envisaged establishment of Dharm-raja, where everyone is driven by his duties, rather than enforcement of duties by state.

Relevance for civil servants:

- (i) India is a poor country, with highly unequal society, (for example 1% of Indians

hold 49% of wealth), this inequality can be removed by following principle of Sarodaya & following progressive taxation for Indians.

(ii) State must act for welfare of those who are poor, and our administrative actions are driven by welfare orientation of policies.

(iii) Discretion of civil servants must be used only for help of poor and impartiality of civil servants must enshrine in itself the upliftment of poor.

for example- while allocating home under Housing for all, we are allocating it in name of female head to prosper her welfare in line with concept of Sarodaya of Gandhiji

SECTION – B

In the following questions, carefully study the cases presented and then answer the questions that follow (in around 250 words):

9. You are the leader of a 5 member team that has been assigned to carry out social impact assessment of a project proposed in a Naxal area. Members have been allotted a remote village each to conduct surveys and ascertain views of local people. You are under strict instructions not to disclose the identity of respondents outside the project. While compiling data, you are puzzled by the responses from one of the villages. You accompany the point-person for that village next day for verification. You randomly pick a person from the list of respondents and ask her for clarification of the response she had given earlier. She seems confused and denies any knowledge of the survey being conducted, let alone she being questioned. You try to verify this from other respondents and get similar replies. This raises serious doubts about the integrity and credibility of the survey process.

(a) What are the ethical issues involved in the situation?

(b) As a team leader accountable for credibility of the survey and working on a hard timeline, what are the possible options before you? List their merits and demerits.

(c) Giving reasons, state the course of action you would follow. 20

आप एक पांच सदस्यीय टीम के नेतृत्वकर्ता हैं, जिसे नक्सल क्षेत्र में प्रस्तावित एक परियोजना के सामाजिक प्रभाव आंकलन का कार्य सौंपा गया है। सर्वेक्षण करने और स्थानीय लोगों के दृष्टिकोण का पता लगाने के लिए प्रत्येक सदस्य को एक सूदूरवर्ती गांव आवंटित किया गया है। आपको सख्त निर्देश दिए गए हैं कि उत्तरदाताओं की पहचान को परियोजना से बाहर प्रकट नहीं किया जाए। आंकड़ों को संकलित करते समय, आप एक गाँव से प्राप्त उत्तरों से उलझन में पड़ जाते हैं। आप उस गाँव हेतु नियुक्त व्यक्ति (प्वाइंट पर्सन) के साथ अगले दिन सत्यापन करने जाते हैं। आप उत्तरदाताओं की सूची में से यादृच्छिक रूप से एक व्यक्ति का चयन करते हैं और उससे कहते हैं कि वह पहले दिए गए अपने उत्तरों का स्पष्टीकरण करें। वह कुछ भ्रमित प्रतीत होती है और न केवल स्वयं से प्रश्न पूछे जाने, बल्कि सर्वेक्षण किए जाने के संबंध में जानकारी होने तक की बात भी नकारती है। आप इस तथ्य को अन्य उत्तरदाताओं से सत्यापित करने का प्रयास करते हैं और एक समान उत्तर प्राप्त करते हैं। यह सर्वेक्षण प्रक्रिया की सत्यनिष्ठा और विश्वसनीयता पर गंभीर संदेह पैदा करता है।

(a) इस परिस्थिति से सम्बंधित नैतिक मुद्दे क्या हैं?

(b) आप इस टीम के नेतृत्वकर्ता के रूप में सर्वेक्षण की विश्वसनीयता हेतु और निश्चित समय-सीमा के अंतर्गत कार्य पूर्ण करने हेतु उत्तरदायी हैं। ऐसे में आपके सामने संभावित विकल्प क्या हैं? उन विकल्पों के लाभ और हानियों को सूचीबद्ध कीजिए।

(c) इस संबंध में आपके द्वारा की जाने वाली कार्यवाही का उल्लेख करें। इसके साथ ही कारण को भी स्पष्ट करें।

Social Impact Assessment of a Project is aimed at identifying possible negative fallout of a project and thus giving due consideration for minimizing their impact while designing the project & executing it.

It requires genuine participation of citizens and any fake survey, such as one highlighted in mentioned case would raise severe ethical

(a) questions like —

(i) Integrity of my subordinate
is in doubt and working
in public interest requires
one to be diligent and
true to the cause, which
unfortunately my colleague
has not turned out to
be.

- (ii) As a team leader, it raises serious questions on my leadership capabilities.
- (iii) The Genuine right of being heard of naxal affected area people is compromised, thus running counter to value premises of Indian Constitution.
- (iv) Since, I am running against timeline, therefore I am stuck in an ethical dilemma, ~~whether~~ whether to continue with this survey or scrap it.

(b) Possible options before Me :

- (i) Going Ahead with the Survey

Merit : - timeline is met.
- Genuine effort of

other surveyor of my firm team
may get ~~compromised~~ or saved.

Demerits:

- Against ethical norms and my value system, thus causing ethical cognitive dissonance in me.
- Against spirit of survey.

(ii) Cancelling whole survey:

- Merit: — timeline is not met.
- Integrity can be ensured next time.

Demerit:

- project may get hampered.

(iii) Sacking the employee & informing my superior:

Merit:

- Survey is saved and I have fulfilled my

responsibility as part of the team.

Demerit:

- My leadership as well as Integrity may be doubtful as my seniors may think of me as running away from timeline.

(iv) Verifying the survey on Sample Basis and resolving Problems while holding correct areas as it is:

Merit:

- will help me meet timeline.
- Integrity of survey ensured.

Demerit:

- I am going against confidentiality clause of survey.

But, I will choose optimising for its

10. Gajendra, once a struggling film actor, was accused and later exonerated of rape charges, which the jury found out to be motivated and fake. Not able to cope up with the situation, he changed profession and moved on. Thirty years later, while his closest friends know about the incident but his co-workers do not. One day, out of curiosity, he searches for his name on the internet, and to his surprise, finds that the third entry that comes up is an old report in a local newspaper about the rape charges he faced.

Gajendra is upset; after all these years, he would like to be able to disclose the event only to whomever he wants. He has heard about the decision of European Court of Justice which allows individuals to submit requests to a search engine to remove certain results from searches on their names, and citing the same, requests the search engine and media outlet to remove the results.

Valid arguments can be advanced for making the Right to be Forgotten a fundamental right? What those arguments could be? What limitations, if any, can it be subjected to? Should there be any obligations on the search engines regarding cases which are no longer relevant, as the one mentioned above?

20

गजेन्द्र एक संघर्षरत फिल्म अभिनेता था। पहले तो उसे अभियुक्त बनाया गया और फिर बाद में उसे बलात्कार के आरोपों से मुक्त कर दिया गया। इन आरोपों को न्यायिक पीठ ने दुर्भावना से अभिप्रेरित और झूठा पाया। इस स्थिति का सामना न कर पाने के कारण उसने अपने पेशे में परिवर्तन करते हुए आगे का जीवन निर्वाह किया। तीस वर्ष पश्चात्, उसके घनिष्ठतम मित्रों को इस घटना के बारे में पता है किन्तु उसके सहकर्मी इस बात को नहीं जानते हैं। एक दिन उत्सुकतावश वह इंटरनेट पर अपने नाम की खोज करता है और आश्चर्यजनक रूप से यह पाता है दृष्टिगत तीसरी प्रविष्टि एक स्थानीय समाचारपत्र में उसके द्वारा सामना किए गए बलात्कार के आरोपों के बारे में एक पुरानी रिपोर्ट की है।

गजेन्द्र परेशान है; इतने वर्षों के बाद, वह इस घटना को केवल अपनी पसंद के लोगों के समक्ष प्रकट करना चाहेगा। उसने यूरोपीय न्यायालय के उस निर्णय के बारे में सुना है, जो व्यक्तियों को अपने नाम से की जाने वाली खोज संबंधी कुछ परिणामों को हटाए जाने हेतु सर्च इंजन को निवेदन प्रस्तुत करने की अनुमति प्रदान करता है और उसी का उद्धरण देते हुए, सर्च इंजन और मीडिया आउटलेट को परिणामों को हटाए जाने हेतु निवेदन करता है।

क्या "भुला दिए जाने के अधिकार" को मौलिक अधिकार बनाने हेतु वैध तर्क दिए जा सकते हैं? वे तर्क क्या हो सकते हैं? यदि उनकी कोई सीमाएं हैं तो वे सीमाएं क्या होंगी? ऊपर उल्लिखित प्रकरण की भांति अन्य अप्रासंगिक प्रकरणों के संबंध में क्या सर्च इंजनों का कोई दायित्व होना चाहिए?

— Right to be forgotten can also be clubbed with Right to Privacy for protecting the right to dignified life.

In this case, Gajendra even though, he had not committed any wrong, but his name was reflecting giving bad name to him, thus it demands the right to be forgotten.

Arguments for making it a Fundamental Right:

- (i) Indian criminal justice system works on principle of innocent until proven guilty, then exonerated later on show the innocence of person, but the sensational media tend to highlight the case, thus

giving bad name to a person,
thus his dignified life requires
Right to be forgotten a fundamental
Right.

- (ii) Even if a person is convicted,
and given sentence for say
3 years, after he comes out
of rehabilitation period, his
name still on news hampers
his chances of mainstreaming
into society.

Since, purpose of criminal
justice system is to rehabilitate
the person, and for such
thing to happen, mainstreaming
is required, which can not
happen without forgotten.

- (iii) Trauma of such fake case
will continue to haunt the
person, if he is not forgotten
on media, as has happened

with Gajendra.

Limitations:

- (i) For convicted persons, the name should flash on the news, for atleast period of his conviction.
- (ii) if the nature of person does not improve and based on his behaviour, he is ~~expect~~ feared to behave ~~rationaly~~ in criminal intent as example of a terrorist freed from a jail, then on pretext of national security & social order, it must flash to have people an informed choice, before relying on such person.

→ Search engines are not criminally liable for such cases under Section 70 of Indian Information ^{tech.} Act, 2000, but to protect the dignity of person, they must remove it after an order by Court comes or a government agency clears his name.

Similar case has happened on content blocking by Intermediaries, where SC directed to private citizens to come through Government.

11. You are the officer in charge of overseeing refugees' related issues in a multilateral humanitarian organisation. There is an ethnicity based civil war going on in a region and as a result, many people are being displaced. Hitherto, the economically better-off neighbouring countries have accommodated the streams of migrants with financial support from your organisation. The violence in the region has increased recently and the flux of people seeking refuge has grown substantially. With countries sealing their borders, the refugees are left in a vulnerable situation. You are sent to negotiate for humanitarian settlement of refugees with the neighbouring countries, who also happen to be a powerful economic bloc. However, they refuse any more accommodation on the following grounds:

- (a) Drainage of resources in face of subdued economic conditions.
 - (b) Domestic political repercussions.
 - (c) Rehabilitation will encourage more influx and indirectly fuel the persecutors.
 - (d) Permanency of settlement in face of better prospects than at home.
- What are the counter-arguments that can be cited to convince the countries for an immediate solution? Suggest some long term measures as well that should be followed to address the problem. 20

आप एक बहुपक्षीय मानवतावादी संगठन में शरणार्थियों से संबंधित मुद्दों के निरीक्षण हेतु प्रभारी अधिकारी हैं। एक क्षेत्र में नस्ल आधारित गृहयुद्ध छिड़ा हुआ है, परिणामस्वरूप अनेक लोग विस्थापित हो रहे हैं। अभी तक, आर्थिक रूप से बेहतर स्थिति वाले पड़ोसी देशों ने आपके संगठन से प्राप्त वित्तीय सहायता से प्रवास करने वाले लोगों के जत्थों को स्थान दिया है। हाल ही में क्षेत्र में हिंसा बढ़ गयी है और शरण चाहने वाले लोगों का प्रवाह अत्यधिक बढ़ गया है। देश अपनी सीमाओं को सील कर रहे हैं, जिससे शरणार्थी सुभेद्य स्थिति में हैं। आपको उन पड़ोसी देशों से शरणार्थियों हेतु मानवतावादी आधार पर रहने की व्यवस्था करने हेतु वार्ता के लिए भेजा गया है। वे पड़ोसी देश आर्थिक रूप से शक्तिशाली गुट हैं। हालांकि वे निम्नलिखित आधारों पर और अधिक शरणार्थियों को स्थान देने से मना कर सकते हैं:

- (a) गिरती हुई आर्थिक स्थिति करने के कारण संसाधनों की कमी।
 - (b) घरेलू राजनैतिक प्रभाव।
 - (c) पुनर्वास और अधिक अंतर्वाह को प्रोत्साहित करेगा और अप्रत्यक्ष रूप से उत्पीड़कों या अत्याचारियों को उत्तेजित करेगा।
 - (d) अच्छी संभावनाओं के कारण अपने मूल देश की अपेक्षा यहीं पर स्थायी रूप से बस जाना।
- इन विकल्पों के विपक्ष में दिए जाने वाले तर्क कौन से हैं, जिनके माध्यम से राष्ट्रों को तत्काल समाधान के लिए राजी किया जा सकता है। कुछ दीर्घावधिक उपायों का सुझाव भी दीजिए जिनका समाधान के लिए पालन किया जाना चाहिए।

The Case highlights the prevailing situation in Europe, whereby migrants from conflict areas are entering the continent & European nations are reluctant to admit them. I, being officer-in-charge, for refugees need to balance the concerns of refugees as well as the right of sovereignty of the nations, thus situation requiring handling & analysis of various value systems at conflict and then coming out with a viable solution.

Counter-arguments:

- (a) Although drainage of resources is a promising ground for their refusal, but such economic conditions are often cyclical in nature and economy might improve few months down the line, but refugees may not survive till then,
at the same time, since

my organisation has provided financial support earlier as well, therefore, I will ensure sufficient funding to address such humanitarian grounds.

(b) Political Compulsions driven by Xenophobia are prevalent in almost all the nations, these repercussions are often driven by value system of nation, In this context, the idea of Vasudhaiva Kutumbakam may be put forward and at the same, Projection of refugees as an economic asset can help counter this argument.

(c) Rehabilitation may fuel the crisis, but the resettlement of refugees demand immediate attention, even if the refugees are not rehabilitated, they might create ruckus in society or persecution will even be committed.

more atrocities, if they are returned home, thus Based on non-refoulement principle of UN refugee Convention, they can not be sent back because they face persecution, this demands even more desire & commitment for rehabilitation.

(d) The Refugees do seek permanent settlement, but this influx is not because of better conditions here, rather due to increased violence at home, thus prompting them to flee, therefore, even if good opportunities are available, this powerful economic block must consider it as a complement. therefore, In line with Gandhian dictum of Sarvodaya, this inequality needs to be minimised & benevolence should drive the policies.

Long-term measures:

- ① UNSC sanctioned armed intervention must be done, to avoid this persecution on humanitarian ground.
- ② there should be necessary consultation by involving all stakeholders in home country of refugee, & to arrive at a political ~~at~~ solution.
- ③ Neighbouring countries must try to restore the peace through involvement of regional blocks, as they are more affected.
- ④ Long-term treaties such as strengthening of Refugee Convention to distinguish between a Migrant & Refugee must be done, where refugees must be rehabilitated on grounds of global human values.

12. You are a Divisional Forest Officer (DFO) in an urban district. The forest cover in the district is as low as 11% and it needs to be increased as per government guidelines. By ecological and environmental perspective also it is imperative that more trees should be planted.

However, you find out that while there is a grant of Rs. 1.5 crore for your division to plant trees under the Hariyali Scheme, most of this fund is lying unused. Since, it is December and as per government rules all the unused grant should be returned to the government as the financial year closes, it seems you will have to return the money completely.

Also, there are strong indications from the ministry that government is mulling over a budgetary cut on Hariyali mission because most of the funds go unused. There is a strong possibility that if you return the money in this financial year you won't get it in the next financial year and even if you get, it will be a very insignificant amount.

Indicate various options that you think are available in this situation. Evaluate these options and choose the most appropriate path to be adopted?

20

आप एक शहरी जिले में मंडल वन अधिकारी (डी.एफ.ओ.) हैं। जिले में वनाच्छादन 11 प्रतिशत कम है और इसे सरकारी दिशा-निर्देशों के अनुसार बढ़ाया जाना है। पारिस्थितिकीय एवं पर्यावरणीय दृष्टिकोण से भी अधिक संख्या में वृक्षारोपण किया जाना अनिवार्य है।

यद्यपि आप यह पाते हैं कि आपके मंडल (डिवीजन) में हरियाली योजना के अधीन वृक्षारोपण हेतु 1.5 करोड़ रुपये का अनुदान है, लेकिन इस फंड का अधिकांश भाग अप्रयुक्त है। चूंकि यह दिसंबर का महीना है और सरकारी नियमों के अनुसार, समस्त अप्रयुक्त अनुदान सरकार को लौटा दिया जाना चाहिए क्योंकि वित्तीय वर्ष समाप्त हो जाता है। ऐसा प्रतीत होता है कि आपको पूरी राशि लौटानी होगी।

साथ ही, मंत्रालय से इस बात के निश्चित संकेत हैं कि सरकार हरियाली योजना के अंतर्गत बजट कम करने पर विचार कर रही है क्योंकि फंड का अधिकांश भाग अप्रयुक्त रह जाता है। इस बात के निश्चित संकेत हैं कि यदि आप वित्तीय वर्ष में राशि लौटाते हैं तो अगले वित्तीय वर्ष में यह आपको नहीं मिलेगा और यदि मिल भी जाता है तो वह राशि बहुत कम होगी।

स्वयं के अनुसार इस स्थिति में उपलब्ध विभिन्न विकल्पों के संबंध में बताएं। इन विकल्पों का मूल्यांकन करें और अपनाए जा सकने वाले सर्वाधिक उपयुक्त मार्ग का चयन करें।

— Even National Forest Policy
requires forest cover of
Camby to increase upto 33%,
while forests are required for
Sustainable development of
Nation as a whole, thus a
Scheme such as Hariyali must

be welcomed and to ensure efficient utilization of funds as well as for sustainable development, I have following options -

① Use all Funds immediately and start plantation:

Merit: - Funds will not be returned.
- Forentation will get a push.

Demerits:

- it is impossible for a tree to grow in 3 months, thus wastage will be there.
- December month is not for plantation and, No plant will be ~~sucess~~ prospered till Spring in february.

② Waiting till Decemb February and then starting plantation Drive.

Merit:

- Plants will see growth

and may prosper in future.
— Funds will be utilised.

Demerits:

— Since it is humanly impossible to plant trees worth ₹1.5 crore in a month and also it may give rise to corruption.

③ Float tender for plant procurement and start awareness campaign by meetings with local communities, at the same time, ensure the delivery of plants by February and then disbursement of plants to local people, so that they work in parallel to Forest department and a successful plantation drive may start.

Merit: plantation will be completed by the march end.

- Communities will be aware about need for environment.
- Being an urban area, the pollution is generally high on side, thus people will participate.
- tender will involve objective evaluation & disbursement of public fund.

Demerit: - All funds may not get utilized & some might need to be surrendered.

Thus, the purpose of plantation is to increase green cover by sustainable drive and merely spending the money will not serve any purpose.

Thus, option (3) is the one which I will choose along with

effective & scientific feasibility of plantation in locality. also I will request my superior to reconsider the proposal for next year, Since forentation is required to have a sustainable future and also it is ethical & imperative for a civil servant to provide their future.

13. You, an anthropologist, have developed cordial relations with a tribal community which was hitherto isolated from rest of the humanity. Notwithstanding increased interest of researchers and media for the newly discovered tribe, you are the only person from outside whom they trust. They are ardent believers in their goddess and, trusting you, take you to her abode on a holy mountain. To your surprise, you find that the mountain is a reservoir of Uranium that can be used in your power-starved country's nuclear power plants. Besides, you are aware that Uranium being radioactive, it is highly risky to go near the mountain. You try to convince the people about harmful effects it can have and the utilitarian value that it possess for the country. However, they are in no mood to argue and politely ask you to leave. You fear that very soon the outside world will find about this and the vulnerable tribe would be displaced from their land.

(a) Evaluate the following courses of action which you can take for their ethical merits and demerits:

i. You would continue to convince the people yourself about the possible consequences and urge them to relocate.

ii. You would call in local and national NGOs for protecting the rights of the people against the State and file a PIL in Supreme Court if the State proceeds with dispossession.

iii. You would yourself tell the government and the scientific community about the reserves and let them proceed in their own way.

(b) Without restricting yourself to the above options, state the course of action that you would take and why?

20

आप एक नृविज्ञानी हैं और आपने वैसे जनजातीय समुदाय के साथ मधुर संबंध बनाए हैं जो अब तक शेष मानवजाति से पृथक् था। नई खोजी गई जनजाति में मीडिया और शोधकर्ताओं की बढ़ती रुचि के पश्चात् भी आप अकेले ऐसे बाहरी व्यक्ति हैं जिन पर वे विश्वास करते हैं। वे अपनी देवी के अनन्य उपासक हैं और आप पर विश्वास करते हुए एक दिन वे आपको एक पवित्र पहाड़ पर स्थित उसके वास स्थल पर ले जाते हैं। आप इस बात से आश्चर्यचकित हो जाते हैं कि वह पहाड़ यूरेनियम का भंडार है जिसका उपयोग ऊर्जा की कमी से जूझते आपके देश के नाभकीय ऊर्जा संयंत्रों में किया जा सकता है। साथ ही, आप इस बात से भी अवगत हैं कि यूरेनियम के रेडियोधर्मी होने के कारण पहाड़ के निकट जाना अत्यधिक संकटपूर्ण है। आप लोगों को इसके क्षतिकारक प्रभावों और राष्ट्र के लिए इसकी उपयोगिता के मूल्य के संबंध में समझाने का प्रयास करते हैं। चूंकि वे अभी किसी तर्क-वितर्क की मुद्रा में नहीं हैं और आपसे सविनय चले जाने को कहते हैं। आपको इस बात का भय है कि शीघ्र ही बाह्य जगत इस संबंध में जान जाएगा और सुभेद्य जनजातीय लोग अपनी भूमि से विस्थापित हो जाएंगे।

(a) नैतिक औचित्य और अनौचित्य के आधार पर आपके द्वारा उठाए जाने वाले कदम का मूल्यांकन करें:

- आप लोगों को संभावित परिणामों के संबंध में समझाना जारी रखेंगे और उन्हें पुनर्स्थापित होने को प्रेरित करेंगे।
- आप राज्य के विरुद्ध निवासियों के अधिकारों की रक्षा के लिए स्थानीय एवं राष्ट्रीय गैर-सरकारी संगठनों को आमंत्रित करेंगे और यदि राज्य निर्वासन की दिशा में बढ़ता है तो आप सर्वोच्च न्यायालय में एक जनहित याचिका प्रस्तुत करेंगे।
- आप स्वयं सरकार एवं विज्ञान जगत को भंडार के संबंध में बताएंगे तथात्त उन्हें उनकी इच्छानुसार कार्यवाही के लिए स्वतंत्र छोड़ देंगे।

(b) अपने आपको उपर्युक्त विकल्पों तक सीमित न करते हुए, उन उपायों को बताएं जिन्हें आप अमल में लाना चाहेंगे। ऐसा करने का कारण भी बताएं।

The case represents development-
environment dilemma, where the
tribals treat the godden as a
part of culture and as a
sacred grove and thus are
willing to protect their culture,
on the contrary, the nation is a
starved of energy resources,
thus being a nationalist, I
need to respond to the call
of ~~the~~ national duty to
contribute towards national
growth as a part of my
fundamental duties.

Evaluation of options:

① Merit:

— Convincing the people myself
will have greater chances of
success, as they have trusted

me for long, they might follow my advice and since I understand their concern as an anthropologist, therefore I will be in better condition to convince them.

- Also, their health needs to be taken care of, since tribals are already dwindling in numbers, therefore, their protection from ill-effects of uranium is required.

Demerit:

- they might loose their trust in me and their only opportunity to interact with world may get vanished.
- what if, they dont get convinced, then they can not be left to fend for themselves.

(ii)

Merit:

- calling NGOs & filing PIL may get their grievances heard and ~~if~~ their Right to livelihood may get protected.
- Since Supreme Court will evaluate a matter objectively, therefore, there are better chances of a fair package.

Demerit:

- NGOs might highlight the case & hitherto unknown people might force state to proceed with possession of land.

(iii)

Merit: - telling government about the case & letting them proceed will ensure that law has its course & I will be out of my dilemma.

Demerit:

- Government might compromise their Rights on advent of modernization & desire for fuel.

(b) Being an anthropologist, I can not abrogate my duty to protect tribal's way of living and at the same time, as held by Hon'ble Supreme Court in Samantha Judgement, people's right must be considered & due hearing must be given.

Thus, my course of action.

- (i) Inform State Government.
- (ii) Request to form a Committee to negotiate with me as a member.
- (iii) alienating areas as go and no-go with utmost concern for tribal health & developmental

needs of country.

14. A junior member of staff has just returned to work after taking special leave to care for her elderly mother. For financial reasons she needs to work full-time. She has been having difficulties with her mother's home care arrangements, causing her to miss a number of team meetings (which usually take place at the beginning of each day) and to leave work early. She is very competent in her work but her absences are putting pressure on her and her overworked colleagues. You are her manager, and you are aware that the flow of work through the practice is coming under pressure. One of her male colleagues is beginning to make comments such as "a woman's place is in the home", and is undermining her at every opportunity, putting her under even greater stress.

What possible steps can you take to ensure that the work of the team does not suffer while also taking other humanitarian considerations into account.

20

अपनी बुजुर्ग मां की देखभाल के लिए विशेष छुट्टी पर रहने के पश्चात् एक कनिष्ठ कर्मि कार्य पर लौटी है। वित्तीय कारणों से उसे पूरे समय कार्य करने की आवश्यकता है। उसे अपनी मां के लिए घर पर देखभाल की व्यवस्था करने में कठिनाई आ रही है जिस कारण वह कई टीम बैठकों (जो प्रायः प्रति दिन, दिन के आरंभ में होते हैं) में उपस्थित नहीं हो पा रही है और वह कार्यालय से घर भी जल्दी चली जाती है। वह अपने कार्य में बहुत ही सक्षम है, लेकिन उसकी अनुपस्थिति उसके ऊपर और काम के बोझ तले दबे उसके सहकर्मियों के ऊपर दबाव का कार्य कर रही है। आप एक प्रबंधक हैं और आप इस बात से अवगत हैं कि इस चलन से कार्य प्रवाह पर दबाव पड़ रहा है। उसके एक पुरुष सहकर्मि ने "एक महिला का स्थान घर में होता है" जैसे ताने भी मारने आरंभ कर दिये हैं और वह उसे प्राप्त हो सकने वाले प्रत्येक अवसर के संबंध में कमजोर बना रहा है जिससे वह और भी गहन तनाव का अनुभव कर रही है। सभी मानवीय पहलुओं का ध्यान रखते हुए, इन परिस्थितियों में टीम का कार्य प्रभावित न हो, यह सुनिश्चित करने के लिए आप कौन से कदम उठायेंगे?

In this situation, there are overlaps between private life and professional life and which is hampering my staff member's morale as well leading to her other colleague's sense of diligence & work culture hampering.

In this context, while being a human, she needs to take care of her mother well, which is her duty and as Kant has professed that duty is to performed because it ought to be, thus her sense of duty towards work as well as home will need to be balanced, also she can't be asked to take leave again, because of financial reasons.

Thus, I will choose following steps—

- ① I will talk to her about growing problems in her personal life and will try to listen to her concerns, so as to have an empathic

decision, also I will also ask her about possible roles that she can be reallocated to so as to have her flexible working hours.

(ii) I will give a stern warning to her male colleague about such derogatory remarks, In this age of women empowerment, such remarks spoil the morale of whole team and the patriarchal mindset that he has.

(iii) I will ensure that her colleague i.e. my whole team is on same page regarding treatment that is to be given to her considering her situation.

(iv) Since, I may not be in situation to grant her any big concessions, therefore, I along with her, will talk to HR and other seniors, regarding her rehabilitation in some other work having flexible timings or I will request management to consider her for slight lesser timing, as she is very competent and I will assure management about work and will take full responsibility for any delay.

(v) If management does not relax it, then I will let them have a call on this, because it will go against organization, if I don't

follow their advice.

Thus, a Balance of
practically with Comparison is
required and considering her
Competency, both can be
balanced well.