



VISION IAS

www.visionias.in

30 NOV 2015

GENERAL STUDIES (TEST CODE : 634)

Name of Candidate	TINA	Registration Number	13773
Medium Hindi/Eng.	ENGLISH	Date	30-11-15
Center	R. N .		

INDEX TABLE

Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained
1(a)	10	
1(b)	10	
2(a)	10	
2(b)	10	
3(a)	10	
3(b)	10	
4(a)	10	
4(b)	10	
5(a)	10	
5(b)	10	
6	10	
7	10	
8	10	
9	20	
10	20	
11	20	
12	20	
13	20	
14	20	

Total Marks Obtained:

Remarks:

Signature of Examiner

INSTRUCTIONS

- Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, Registration Number and Test Code).
उत्तर पुस्तिका में सूचनाएं भरना आवश्यक है (नाम, प्रश्न-पत्र कोड, विद्यार्थी क्रमांक आदि)।
- There are FOURTEEN questions printed in HINDI and ENGLISH. इसमें चौदह प्रश्न हैं तथा हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी दोनों में छपे हैं।
- All questions are compulsory.
सभी प्रश्न अनिवार्य हैं।
- The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.
प्रत्येक प्रश्न/भाग के अंक उसके सामने दिए गए हैं।
- Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one.
प्रश्नों के उत्तर उसी माध्यम में लिखे जाने चाहिए जिसका उल्लेख आपके प्रवेश पत्र में किया गया है और उस माध्यम का स्पष्ट उल्लेख प्रश्न-सह-उत्तर (क्यूसीए) पुस्तिका के मुख्य पृष्ठ पर अंकित निर्दिष्ट स्थान पर किया जाना चाहिए। उल्लिखित माध्यम के अतिरिक्त अन्य किसी माध्यम में लिए गए उत्तर पर कोई अंक नहीं मिलेंगे।
- Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to.
प्रश्नों में शब्द सीमा, जहाँ विनिर्दिष्ट है, का अनुसरण किया जाना चाहिए।
- Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.
उत्तर पुस्तिका में खाली छोड़ा हुआ पृष्ठ या उसके अंश को स्पष्ट रूप से काटा जाना चाहिए।

75, 3rd Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi – 110060

103, 1st Floor, B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi – 110009

EVALUATION INDICATORS

1. Alignment Competence
2. Context Competence
3. Content Competence
4. Language Competence
5. Introduction Competence
6. Structure - Presentation Competence
7. Conclusion Competence

Overall Macro Comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

6.

All the Best

SECTION - A

Answer the following questions in not more than 150 words each:

1. (a) Even though women may have equal skills, qualifications and commitment as men, they face much more difficulty in rising up the leadership hierarchy. Discuss the reasons for the same. Also, explain the importance of having gender parity in positions of leadership. 10

पुरुषों के समान कुशलता, योग्यता और प्रतिबद्धता जैसे गुणों से युक्त होने के बावजूद भी महिलाओं को नेतृत्व श्रृंखला में उच्च सोपानों तक पहुँचने के लिए अपेक्षाकृत अधिक कठिनाई का सामना करना पड़ता है। समस्या की पृष्ठभूमि में निहित कारणों पर चर्चा कीजिये। इसके साथ ही नेतृत्व के विविध स्तरों पर नैतिक समानता के महत्व का उल्लेख कीजिए।

Women often face more difficulty than men in moving up the leadership hierarchy because of the deep rooted patriarchal biasedness that prevails in the country.

Indian society due to its patriarchal mindset views women as secondary to men. This discrimination and subordination is justified by biological differences. However, Feminists argue that while 'sex' is a biological fact, 'gender' is a social and cultural fact. Thus, discrimination on the basis of gender is flawed that there is no real biological difference which makes women inferior to men in intellect and capability. As Simon de Beauvoir said, "one is not born

a woman, one is made a woman⁹⁷.

We require more and more women in leadership positions because :

- (i) Women provide a unique perspective and worldview. Women bring in 'CARE ETHICS' in work culture, i.e., emphasis on values of compassion, tolerance and empathy, which are extremely important to tackle contemporary problems.
- (ii) Women represent 50% of the population, and thus it is only logical to even them being in charge of taking decisions for the welfare of society and ensure that women concerns are not neglected.
- (iii) More and more women in power would break the 'glass ceiling'. It will attack the patriarchal mindset and bring about attitudinal changes to treat women as equal to men.

1. (b) All correct decisions are honest and all incorrect decisions are dishonest. Do you agree? How should the correctness and incorrectness of a decision be decided? 10

सभी सही निर्णय ईमानदारी भरे होते हैं और सभी गलत निर्णय बेईमानी भरे होते हैं। क्या आप सहमत हैं? किसी निर्णय के सही होने और गलत होने का निर्धारण किस प्रकार किया जाना चाहिए।

No, all correct decisions are not always honest and not all incorrect decisions are dishonest. For instance, WHISTLEBLOWING is against organizational rules however it exposes bad & or unethical practices for greater public good. Therefore, there may be actions/decisions incorrect from a legal point of view, but may be ethical and honest in terms for the greater public good. Similarly, Section 377 ~~pro~~ criminalizes homosexuality, thus decisions taken in accordance with this law might be legally permissible but not necessarily morally defensible.

To decide the correctness or incorrectness of a decision, the best approach is the Gandhian way. A correct decision should not never

compromise the 'means' for the 'end'. For instance, Gandhiji said, we cannot "expect a rose ~~tree~~ by sowing the seeds of a babool tree". Thus, any 'correct' action has to be based on the purity of means. No matter how noble the ends, ends can never justify the means.

2. (a) Should birth control be a voluntary exercise or a government policy in a country? In this regard, examine the ethical dimensions of having a One Child Policy in India. 10

किसी राष्ट्र में जन्म पर नियंत्रण, स्वैच्छिक प्रयास के माध्यम से होना चाहिए या सरकारी नीति के माध्यम से होना चाहिए? इस संबंध में, भारत में एक बच्चे की नीति के नैतिक आयामों का परीक्षण कीजिए।

Birth control should be both a voluntary exercise as well as a governmental policy as long as it is not coercive but only prescriptive.

while having birth control^{al} as a voluntary exercise will give the maximum freedom to citizens, the citizens might become lackadaisical in their approach and not take any serious efforts to achieve the objectives. A Government policy of birth control has to ensure that it doesn't involve coercive measures like forced sterilization. Such a policy may be counter productive. It may generate resentment among the people and if not carried out properly may adversely impact their health.

Thus, if India goes for a 'ONE

CHILD POLICY', many ethical concerns may ^{need to} be taken into consideration:

1. It cannot be coercive so that people retain the freedom of choice.
2. India, which has age old tradition of having large families might find it difficult to shift to a policy of just having one child. It might hurt cultural sensibilities of the people, so a gradual approach is recommended along with mass awareness programmes on its benefits.
3. India being a patriarchal society might experience rise in incidents of female foeticide if only one child per family is allowed. This will have dangerous repercussion on the sex ratio of the country which has preference for the male child.

2. (b) An organisation consists of a variety of individuals with varying values and degrees of motivation. What challenges do leaders face when forging a harmonious work culture in such an organisation? How can leaders engender a sense of inclusion in face of such diversity? 10

एक संगठन का निर्माण अलग-अलग मूल्यों और अलग-अलग अभिप्रेरणा स्तर वाले विविध प्रकार के व्यक्तियों से होता है। इस प्रकार के संगठन में सामंजस्यपूर्ण कार्य-संस्कृति के विकास के मार्ग में नेतृत्व के द्वारा किन चुनौतियों का सामना किया जाता है? इस प्रकार की विविधतापूर्ण स्थिति में नेतृत्व के द्वारा कार्य करने वाले व्यक्तियों में समावेशिता की अनुभूति किस प्रकार समाविष्ट की जा सकती है?

In the face of diversity, team work becomes difficult if leaders are unable to create intra group harmony among individuals of different religions, castes and culture. The leaders in absence of harmonious work culture will face problems of poor performance, lack of progress in work, intra group conflicts, low productivity, ineffective intra group communication and ultimately poor worker satisfaction.

Leaders can promote inclusiveness in face of such diversity by :

- (i) Leaders should use their EMOTIONAL INTELLIGENCE SKILLS to promote better communication within the organization. This can be done by

conducting trust-building exercises among team members and through techniques improving communication skills both verbal and non verbal.

(ii) The leader should promote holding informal meeting from time to time for workers to socialize and develop inter personal relationships. Elton Mayo in his Hawthorne studies demonstrated how these relationships were the best factor to promote productivity.

(iii) The leader can give financial & incentives to the workers to cooperate with each other to work better as a team, ~~to~~ and by working as a team, getting to know each other, and thereby reduce relationship barriers.

3. (a) Notwithstanding compassion and morality, it is national interest that ultimately determines a country's decisions in international relations. Discuss this statement in the context of the current refugee crisis. 10

दया और नैतिकता जैसे मूल्यों का महत्वपूर्ण स्थान होते हुए भी, अंतर्राष्ट्रीय संबंधों के परिप्रेक्ष्य में अंततः राष्ट्र के निर्णयों को राष्ट्रिय हितों के आधार पर ही निर्धारित किया जाता है। वर्तमान शरणार्थी संकट के संदर्भ में इस कथन पर चर्चा करें।

In international relations often national aspirations prevail over international interest, often at the expense of international peace and harmony. However, with increasing areas of global cooperation — economic, environment and security — it cannot be said that states are only interested in pursuing their own concerns. Increasingly we find global cooperation where nations are working for the betterment of mankind as a whole.

While some countries have sealed their borders to the ensuing ~~regu~~ refugee crisis, there are a greater number of nations welcoming these refugees from trouble stricken West Asia with open arms. The European Union is considering better organized

and effective refugee policy to prevent any humanitarian crisis.

Thus, we can observe the evolution of global ethical values in International Relations. Though national interest still remains important, we do find nations rising above narrow national interest and embracing highest ethical values of 'morality', 'compassion', 'empathy' on a global scale.

3. (b) What are the ethical issues involved in climate change negotiations? Suggest some strategies to address the divergence in ethical positions of different nations. 10

जलवायु परिवर्तन पर होने वाली वार्ताओं में समाहित नैतिक मुद्दे क्या हैं? विभिन्न राष्ट्रों के नैतिक मुद्दों से संबंधित दृष्टिकोण में जो भिन्नता है, उसके का समाधान के लिए अपनाई जा सकने वाली रणनीतियों का नुस्खा दीजिये।

The ethical issues involved in climate change negotiations are as follows;

(i) HISTORICAL RESPONSIBILITY

Developed and industrialized nations want that developing countries should share the burden of reducing carbon emissions. However, such a position disregards the historical MORAL RESPONSIBILITY these nations have towards the developing countries. Since the carbon emissions are due to industrialization of the developed countries over the past 200 years, it is unfair that these nations shift the burden to developing countries and prevent the developing countries from pursuing their own development.

(ii) COMMON BUT DIFFERENTIATED RESPONSIBILITY

The developed nations have to recognize that though the responsibility of reducing carbon emissions falls on all, greater responsibility lies on the developed nations than developing nations.

Strategies to redress this ethical dilemma :

1. The developed nations have to understand and imbibe the values of working for the greater good. They have to rise above petty national interests.
2. The developing nations to supplement the efforts of the developed nations should be given financial aid and technology transfers from the developed nations, to adopt sustainable development approaches.

4. (a) Why is there a need for Performance Management System in an outcome oriented government? Evaluate the feasibility of peer review in context of Indian civil services. 10

एक परिणामोन्मुख सरकार में "कार्यनिष्पादन प्रबंधन प्रणाली" की आवश्यकता क्यों है? भारतीय लोक सेवाओं के संदर्भ में "सहकर्मि समीक्षा" (peer review) के औचित्य का मूल्यांकन कीजिए।

Performance Management System is a critical component of an outcome oriented government. If there is no critical appraisal of the performance then there is no way to ensure that output is bringing the desired outcomes. Only an outcome oriented government can lead to good governance, people citizen engagement and improve public service delivery. Without monitoring the performance of officials, desired outcomes cannot be guaranteed.

Peer Review System can be introduced in Indian Civil Services through with proper guidelines and grievance redressal mechanisms. It will encourage greater peer interaction and bring out a system of checks.

It will improve organizational communication and even give a boost to ~~group~~ harmonious inter personal relations .

4. (b) Discretionary power in the hands of public servants is a necessary evil. Discuss. 10

लोक सेवकों के हाथों में विवेकाधीन शक्तियाँ एक आवश्यक बुराई हैं। चर्चा कीजिए।

discretionary power is sometimes required when laws, rules and regulations create rigidity in the face changing needs of the time. In such situations, discretionary power enables public servants to ~~create~~ ^{apply} innovative and creative solutions to problems.

However, discretionary power can be also be misused by dishonest officials for furthering their private interests.

Thus, while the ~~by~~ discretionary power can be abused, the dynamic nature of administration requires that some amount of discretionary power ~~has~~ to be given to public officials. Thus, it is called "necessary evil".

To prevent misuse of discretionary power, there has to be an elaborate operational framework. - Public officials

should be made to follow a code of conduct and a code of ethics so that the limitations of discretionary power can be eliminated and at the same time, public officials get the flexibility to take decisions according to changing needs of the time.

5. (a) The landmark judgment by the Supreme Court of India recognized the transgender as a third sex. What attitudes do you notice towards the transgender people in India? Discuss some steps to facilitate a dignified life for the transgender people. 10

भारत के सर्वोच्च न्यायालय द्वारा दिए गए ऐतिहासिक निर्णय से ट्रांसजेंडर्स को तृतीय लिंग के रूप में मान्यता दी गई है। आप भारतीय परिस्थितियों में ट्रांसजेंडर्स समुदाय के लोगों के प्रति किन अभिवृत्तियों की अनुभूति करते हैं। ट्रांसजेंडर्स के लिए गरिमापूर्ण जीवन निर्माण की दिशा में उठाए जा सकने वाले कदमों के संबंध में चर्चा कीजिए।

Despite various campaigns and even a recent supreme court ruling in favour of transgenders, the ^{dominant} attitude ⁱⁿ among the Indian society towards transgenders continues to be negative. It can be considered akin to 'untouchability'. The transgender people are discriminated against in all walks of life. They are denied education, employment, recognition and respect by society and are rendered destitute.

Steps to facilitate a dignified life for transgenders :

- (i) Set up employment exchanges exclusively for catering employment needs of the transgenders.

- (ii) Reserving certain percentage of seats in education and government employment for transgenders (affirmative action)
- (iii) offer counselling and ~~ment~~ emotional support to transgender victims of trauma or aggression.
- (iv) Massive public awareness programs emphasizing on the equality of transgenders, to change societal attitudes towards them.
- (v) Bring forth a proper legislation protecting them against atrocities.

5. (b) What key characteristics of a person conveying a message make it more persuasive? When celebrities endorse a product, they do so knowing that their endorsement will persuade people to buy it. What duty do they have towards the consumers? 10

संदेश देने वाले व्यक्ति की कौन-सी महत्वपूर्ण विशेषताएँ संदेश को और अधिक आग्रहपूर्ण बनाती हैं? जब ख्याति प्राप्त व्यक्ति किसी उत्पाद का विज्ञापन करते हैं, तो वे ऐसा यह जानते हुए करते हैं कि उनके द्वारा किसी वस्तु का किया गया विज्ञापन, लोगों को वह वस्तु खरीदने हेतु प्रेरित करेगा। इस सन्दर्भ में उपभोक्ताओं के प्रति उनके क्या दायित्व हैं?

characteristics of the Persuader :

1. Credibility

Persuasion is effective only when the source ~~for~~ is considered credible. Credibility is established by expertness and ~~creditworthiness~~. trustworthiness.

2. Power

persuasion is effective if the persuader is in some position of power or authority over the target group being persuaded.

3. Attractiveness

Persuasion is effective when the persuader seems attractive with respect to :

- value compatibility
- attitudinal similarity
- interest overlap
- Familiarity

Since celebrities enjoy power over the masses due to their appeal and attractiveness, it is their duty to ensure that they don't endorse unethical practices or bad products, since they would mislead the masses who look up to these celebrities.

6. It is said that child labor cannot be ethical at all. Do you agree? Discuss with respect to the proposed amendments to the Child Labour Act. 10

यह कहा जाता है कि बाल-श्रम किसी भी परिस्थिति में नैतिक नहीं हो सकता। क्या आप सहमत हैं? बाल-श्रम अधिनियम में प्रस्तावित संशोधनों के संदर्भ में चर्चा कीजिए।

Yes, child labour is unethical in all its forms and manifestations and this is because childhood is a time of nurturing and educating the child. If this does not happen then a child cannot develop his mental faculties fully and cannot develop holistically.

However, a distinction needs to be made between child labour and when child help their family members in a family enterprise. ~~or~~ However, even assisting ^{the} family needs to ensure that it does not affect the child's study and play hours.

The proposed amendments to the Child Labour Act are in consonance with the above

line of thinking. The ban all kinds of labour - hazardous and non hazardous upto 14 years of age, but allow children to help their families in their family enterprise if does not affect their education.

7. Are emotions an inhibiting factor in effective decision-making? Discuss in the context of public services. 10

क्या भावनाएं प्रभावपूर्ण निर्णय लेने के मार्ग में बाधक तत्व हैं? लोक सेवाओं के संदर्भ में चर्चा कीजिए।

No, emotions are no longer considered an inhibiting factor in effective decision making. Traditionally, emotions were considered as interfering in rational judgement and as a sign of weakness. However, now, after the researches of Mayer and Salovey and Daniel Goleman, it has been established that emotions enable better performance.

In the context of public services, the performance of an official depends not only on technical proficiency, but how effectively he or she can use emotional intelligence to deal with peers, superiors and public. Emotions and emotional quotient lead to trusting relations, motivate creative expressions and enhance self understanding.

In fact, Daniel Goleman asserts that 80% of success at workplace is due to emotional quotient, and 20% due to intelligence quotient. While IQ can get one selected, only emotional quotient can get one promoted.

8. What do you understand by the Sarvodaya philosophy of Gandhiji? Why is Sarvodaya relevant for civil servants in India? 10

गांधीजी के सर्वोदय दर्शन से आप क्या समझते हैं? भारत में लोक सेवकों के लिए सर्वोदय क्यों प्रासंगिक है?

Sarvodaya Philosophy of Gandhiji speaks about 'UNIVERSAL UPLIFTMENT OF ALL'. It was borrowed by him from John Ruskin 'Unto the Last'. His philosophy implies that all policies should be such that promote the welfare of all and not a few, especially of those who are the least advantaged.

Sarvodaya Philosophy is very relevant for civil servants in India because civil servants must ensure implementation of government policies in such a way that they reach the weakest of all. This philosophy must be ingrained in the minds of all

public officials so that while
~~at~~ discharging their duties
they are always conscious
of welfare of the poor masses.

SECTION – B

In the following questions, carefully study the cases presented and then answer the questions that follow (in around 250 words):

9. You are the leader of a 5 member team that has been assigned to carry out social impact assessment of a project proposed in a Naxal area. Members have been allotted a remote village each to conduct surveys and ascertain views of local people. You are under strict instructions not to disclose the identity of respondents outside the project. While compiling data, you are puzzled by the responses from one of the villages. You accompany the point-person for that village next day for verification. You randomly pick a person from the list of respondents and ask her for clarification of the response she had given earlier. She seems confused and denies any knowledge of the survey being conducted, let alone she being questioned. You try to verify this from other respondents and get similar replies. This raises serious doubts about the integrity and credibility of the survey process.

(a) What are the ethical issues involved in the situation?

(b) As a team leader accountable for credibility of the survey and working on a hard timeline, what are the possible options before you? List their merits and demerits.

(c) Giving reasons, state the course of action you would follow.

20

आप एक पांच सदस्यीय टीम के नेतृत्वकर्ता हैं, जिसे नक्सल क्षेत्र में प्रस्तावित एक परियोजना के सामाजिक प्रभाव आंकलन का कार्य सौंपा गया है। सर्वेक्षण करने और स्थानीय लोगों के दृष्टिकोण का पता लगाने के लिए प्रत्येक सदस्य को एक सूरूरवर्ती गांव आवंटित किया गया है। आपको सख्त निर्देश दिए गए हैं कि उत्तरदाताओं की पहचान को परियोजना से बाहर प्रकट नहीं किया जाए। आंकड़ों को संकलित करते समय, आप एक गाँव से प्राप्त उत्तरों से उलझन में पड़ जाते हैं। आप उस गाँव हेतु नियुक्त व्यक्ति (प्वाइंट पर्सन) के साथ अगले दिन सत्यापन करने जाते हैं। आप उत्तरदाताओं की सूची में से बावृच्छिक रूप से एक व्यक्ति का चयन करते हैं और उससे कहते हैं कि वह पहले दिए गए अपने उत्तरों का स्पष्टीकरण करें। वह कुछ भ्रमित प्रतीत होती है और न केवल स्वयं से प्रश्न पूछे जाने, बरन् सर्वेक्षण किए जाने के संबंध में जानकारी होने तक की बात भी नकारती है। आप इस तथ्य को अन्य उत्तरदाताओं से सत्यापित करने का प्रयत्न करते हैं और एक समान उत्तर प्राप्त करते हैं। यह सर्वेक्षण प्रक्रिया की सत्यनिष्ठा और विश्वसनीयता पर गंभीर संदेह पैदा करता है।

(a) इस परिस्थिति से सम्बंधित नैतिक मुद्दे क्या हैं?

(b) आप इस टीम के नेतृत्वकर्ता के रूप में सर्वेक्षण की विश्वसनीयता हेतु और निश्चित समय-सीमा के अंतर्गत कार्य पूर्ण करने हेतु उत्तरदायी हैं। ऐसे में आपके सामने संभावित विकल्प क्या हैं? उन विकल्पों के लाभ और हानियों को सूचीबद्ध कीजिए।

(c) इस संबंध में आपके द्वारा की जाने वाली कार्यवाही का उल्लेख करें। इसके साथ ही कारण को भी स्पष्ट करें।

The ethical issue involved in the case is that of lack of integrity in work. From the responses of the respondents, it is clear that they are fake statements. It may point towards nexus towards the survey officials and the project proponents. Moreover, the project is of a Naxal area and thus sensitive. The case also speaks about the possibility of a poor social Impact Assessment (SIA) Report which bring a bad name to the team leader as well.

As the team leader is accountable for the survey plus has a pressing timeline to follow, he/she has the following options.

- (i) Go ahead with the report without making changes.

Merits: It will save time and since identity of respondents will not be disclosed, the leader will not be held accountable.

Demerits :

It is morally and ethically wrong move. It will be akin to cheating the government and the public, and hence can be ruled out.

(ii) conduct a fresh survey on your own

Merits :

The leader then can ensure that the report is credible.

Demerits :

conducting a fresh survey will push the time limits and the leader will fail to submit the report on time.

(iii) Appeal to the government to change the team members on account of fudging the survey and report. Also ask the government for an extension due to the unfortunate circumstances.

Merits : It will enable the leader to conduct a proper survey with assistance and without the fear of credibility of the team members.

Demerits : It may exceed the time limit.

However, the third option is most feasible since on requesting the government for an extension of deadline after properly making the government aware of the poor credibility of the previous report, the time limit problem will be solved. Moreover, with government replacing the old team members, better credibility of SIA Report can be expected.

10. Gajendra, once a struggling film actor, was accused and later exonerated of rape charges, which the jury found out to be motivated and fake. Not able to cope up with the situation, he changed profession and moved on. Thirty years later, while his closest friends know about the incident but his co-workers do not. One day, out of curiosity, he searches for his name on the internet, and to his surprise, finds that the third entry that comes up is an old report in a local newspaper about the rape charges he faced. Gajendra is upset; after all these years, he would like to be able to disclose the event only to whomever he wants. He has heard about the decision of European Court of Justice which allows individuals to submit requests to a search engine to remove certain results from searches on their names, and citing the same, requests the search engine and media outlet to remove the results.

Valid arguments can be advanced for making the Right to be Forgotten a fundamental right? What those arguments could be? What limitations, if any, can it be subjected to? Should there be any obligations on the search engines regarding cases which are no longer relevant, as the one mentioned above?

20

गजेन्द्र एक संघर्षरत फिल्म अभिनेता था। पहले तो उसे अभियुक्त बनाया गया और फिर बाद में उसे बलात्कार के आरोपों से मुक्त कर दिया गया। इन आरोपों को न्यायिक पीठ ने दुर्भावना से अभिप्रेरित और झूठा पाया। इस स्थिति का सामना न कर पाने के कारण उसने अपने पेशे में परिवर्तन करते हुए आगे का जीवन निर्वाह किया। तीस वर्ष पश्चात्, उसके घनिष्ठतम मित्रों को इस घटना के बारे में पता है किन्तु उसके सहकर्मी इस बात को नहीं जानते हैं। एक दिन उत्सुकतावश वह इंटरनेट पर अपने नाम की खोज करता है और आश्चर्यजनक रूप से यह पाता है दृष्टिगत तीसरी प्रविष्टि एक स्थानीय समाचारपत्र में उसके द्वारा सामना किए गए बलात्कार के आरोपों के बारे में एक पुराने रिपोर्ट की है।

गजेन्द्र परेशान है; इतने वर्षों के बाद, वह इस घटना को केवल अपनी पसंद के लोगों के समक्ष प्रकट करना चाहेगा। उसने यूरोपीय न्यायालय के उस निर्णय के बारे में सुना है, जो व्यक्तियों को अपने नाम से की जाने वाली खोज संबंधी कुछ परिणामों को हटाए जाने हेतु सर्च इंजन को निवेदन प्रस्तुत करने की अनुमति प्रदान करता है और उसी का उद्धरण देते हुए, सर्च इंजन और मीडिया आउटलेट को परिणामों को हटाए जाने हेतु निवेदन करता है।

क्या "भुला दिए जाने के अधिकार" को मौलिक अधिकार बनाने हेतु वैध तर्क दिए जा सकते हैं? वे तर्क क्या हो सकते हैं? यदि उनकी कोई सीमाएं हैं तो वे सीमाएं क्या होंगी? ऊपर उल्लिखित प्रकरण की भांति अन्य अप्रसंगिक प्रकरणों के संबंध में क्या सर्च इंजनों का कोई दायित्व होना चाहिए?

Right to ^{be} Forgotten can be made a fundamental right, but such an initiative has to be tread on carefully. It

should hamper the administration of justice or public welfare.

Merits :

It will be useful for cases like that of Gajendra, where information which is no longer relevant is only bringing public shame.

Demerits :

It might hamper future research on issues if past records, even if false are erased.

Moreover, an IT infrastructure needed for this task is missing in India.

If search engines are allowed to erase such data, it cannot be done on whims and fancies. A proper system has to be adopted whereby only on

government request should
information be removed
and not arbitrarily.

11. You are the officer in charge of overseeing refugees' related issues in a multilateral humanitarian organisation. There is an ethnicity based civil war going on in a region and as a result, many people are being displaced. Hitherto, the economically better-off neighbouring countries have accommodated the streams of migrants with financial support from your organisation. The violence in the region has increased recently and the flux of people seeking refuge has grown substantially. With countries sealing their borders, the refugees are left in a vulnerable situation. You are sent to negotiate for humanitarian settlement of refugees with the neighbouring countries, who also happen to be a powerful economic bloc. However, they refuse any more accommodation on the following grounds:

- (a) Drainage of resources in face of subdued economic conditions.
- (b) Domestic political repercussions.
- (c) Rehabilitation will encourage more influx and indirectly fuel the persecutors.

(d) Permanency of settlement in face of better prospects than at home. What are the counter-arguments that can be cited to convince the countries for an immediate solution? Suggest some long term measures as well that should be followed to address the problem. 20

आप एक बहुपक्षीय मानवतावादी संगठन में शरणार्थियों से संबंधित मुद्दों के निरीक्षण हेतु प्रभारी अधिकारी हैं। एक क्षेत्र में नस्ल आधारित गृहयुद्ध छिड़ा हुआ है, परिणामस्वरूप अनेक लोग विस्थापित हो रहे हैं। अभी तक, आर्थिक रूप से बेहतर स्थिति वाले पड़ोसी देशों ने आपके संगठन से प्राप्त वित्तीय सहायता से ब्रवास करने वाले लोगों के जत्थों को स्थान दिया है। हाल ही में क्षेत्र में हिंसा बढ़ गयी है और शरण चाहने वाले लोगों का प्रवाह अत्यधिक बढ़ गया है। देश अपनी सीमाओं को सील कर रहे हैं, जिससे शरणार्थी सुभेद्य स्थिति में हैं। आपको उन पड़ोसी देशों से शरणार्थियों हेतु मानवतावादी आधार पर रहने की व्यवस्था करने हेतु वार्ता के लिए भेजा गया है। वे पड़ोसी देश आर्थिक रूप से शक्तिशाली गुट हैं। हालांकि वे निम्नलिखित आधारों पर और अधिक शरणार्थियों को स्थान देने से मना कर सकते हैं:

- (a) गिरती हुई आर्थिक स्थिति करने के कारण संसाधनों की कमी।
- (b) घरेलू राजनैतिक प्रभाव।
- (c) पुनर्वास और अधिक अंतर्वाह को प्रोत्साहित करेगा और अप्रत्यक्ष रूप से उत्पीड़कों या अत्याचारियों को उत्तेजित करेगा।
- (d) अच्छी संभावनाओं के कारण अपने मूल देश की अपेक्षा यहीं पर स्थायी रूप से बस जाना। इन विकल्पों के विपक्ष में दिए जाने वाले तर्क कौन से हैं, जिनके माध्यम से राष्ट्रों को तत्काल समाधान के लिए राजी किया जा सकता है। कुछ दीर्घावधिक उपायों का सुझाव भी दीजिए जिनका समाधान के लिए पालन किया जाना चाहिए।

The counter arguments to each of the grounds of refusal are as follows

(a) DRAINAGE OF RESOURCES IN FACE OF SUBDUED ECONOMIC CONDITIONS.

The nations need to be reminded that for the greater interest of humanity at large, economic concerns have to be put aside. It is the ^{responsibility of} international community in general, and the neighbouring nations in particular, to come to aid during a humanitarian crisis.

(b) DOMESTIC POLITICAL REPERCUSSIONS.

while ^{influx of} refugees may create certain domestic problems, the neighbourhood regions need to realize that if they do not accommodate the refugees then the resulting humanitarian crisis would create problems for their internal and external security thereby impacting domestic stability.

Moreover, refusal to ~~prove~~ undertake humanitarian measure might even create a negative domestic public opinion against the governments.

(c) REHABILITATION WILL ENCOURAGE MORE INFLUX

while rehabilitation may encourage more influx, non rehabilitation will lead to illegal ~~or~~ immigration, which will come with its own set of problems. It may lead to cross border human trafficking and even more serious problems.

(d) PERMANENCY OF SETTLEMENTS

while some refugees might settle down permanently, it cannot be said that the majority will since people have strong affinity to their cultural roots. They have a strong sense of belonging to their own land, and thus, they will not overstay their welcome.

Long term measures to address the problem:

1. The International community should negotiate a global convention on Refugees and Refugee settlement under the ~~so~~ aegis of United Nations. Such a treaty should be binding so that member

nations cannot escape their responsibility later.

2. ~~Proper~~ steps to be taken to ensure that political stability is maintained in nations having history of ethnic civil wars. The international community should provide all possible moral and material support for the same.
3. There should be setting up of more humanitarian work related NGOs to tackle such crisis.

12. You are a Divisional Forest Officer (DFO) in an urban district. The forest cover in the district is as low as 11% and it needs to be increased as per government guidelines. By ecological and environmental perspective also it is imperative that more trees should be planted.

However, you find out that while there is a grant of Rs. 1.5 crore for your division to plant trees under the Hariyali Scheme, most of this fund is lying unused. Since, it is December and as per government rules all the unused grant should be returned to the government as the financial year closes, it seems you will have to return the money completely.

Also, there are strong indications from the ministry that government is mulling over a budgetary cut on Hariyali mission because most of the funds go unused. There is a strong possibility that if you return the money in this financial year you won't get it in the next financial year and even if you get, it will be a very insignificant amount.

Indicate various options that you think are available in this situation. Evaluate these options and choose the most appropriate path to be adopted?

20

आप एक शहरी जिले में मंडल वन अधिकारी (डी.एफ.ओ.) हैं। जिले में वनाच्छादन 11 प्रतिशत कम है और इसे सरकारी दिशा-निर्देशों के अनुसार बढ़ाया जाना है। पारिस्थितिकीय एवं पर्यावरणीय दृष्टिकोण से भी अधिक संख्या में वृक्षारोपण किया जाना अनिवार्य है।

यद्यपि आप यह पाते हैं कि आपके मंडल (डिवीजन) में हरियाली योजना के अधीन वृक्षारोपण हेतु 1.5 करोड़ रुपये का अनुदान है, लेकिन इस फंड का अधिकांश भाग अप्रयुक्त है। चूंकि यह दिसंबर का महीना है और सरकारी नियमों के अनुसार, समस्त अप्रयुक्त अनुदान सरकार को लौटा दिया जाना चाहिए क्योंकि वित्तीय वर्ष समाप्त हो जाता है। ऐसा प्रतीत होता है कि आपको पूरी राशि लौटानी होगी।

साथ ही, मंत्रालय से इस बात के निश्चित संकेत हैं कि सरकार हरियाली योजना के अंतर्गत बजट कम करने पर विचार कर रही है क्योंकि फंड का अधिकांश भाग अप्रयुक्त रह जाता है। इस बात के निश्चित संकेत हैं कि यदि आप वित्तीय वर्ष में राशि लौटाते हैं तो अगले वित्तीय वर्ष में यह आपको नहीं मिलेगा और यदि मिल भी जाता है तो वह राशि बहुत कम होगी। स्वयं के अनुसार इस स्थिति में उपलब्ध विभिन्न विकल्पों के संबंध में बताएं। इन विकल्पों का मूल्यांकन करें और अपनाए जा सकने वाले सर्वाधिक उपयुक्त मार्ग का चयन करें।

In the above situation, the ethical dilemma faced is how to ensure the planting of trees in the district in a legally permissible way before funding cuts are made in the Hariyali scheme.

The following options are available in the case:

- (i) spend all the funds before the financial ~~end~~ year ends (March 31st).

~~However~~ while this will ensure some planting of trees, such a skewed expenditure will more or less be mis-spent due to the time constraints. It might even lead to many loopholes in the implementation of the scheme, and result in corruption at the lower levels of administration.

- (ii) Don't spend the funds and wait for the reformed Haryali Policy in the next financial year.

This option while legally permissible, will be lackadaisical in its approach. It is imperative to plant trees in the district not only from the policy point of view, but also from the ecological and environmental perspective since the district has forest cover as low as 11%. Moreover, not taking any action might be ethically non responsive, since the officer is anticipating a cut in funds in the revamped scheme in the next financial year, which will bring

less opportunities to increase forest cover in the district.

- (iii) use some of the funds properly to kickstart planting of trees in the district, while appeal to the Government to not cut funding to the Haryali Scheme.

This option appears to be the best course of action. Limited utilization of funds, as the financial year is ending, will be appropriate. There will be less chances of them being mismanaged or misutilized, while at the same time planting of trees would have been started in the district and there would be some improvement in the forest cover of the district.

Appealing to the government to reconsider their proposal of reducing funding to the scheme by highlighting the need to increase forest cover, might also work in favour. The government may even sanction a special release of funds exclusively for that district due to its low forest cover.

13. You, an anthropologist, have developed cordial relations with a tribal community which was hitherto isolated from rest of the humanity. Notwithstanding increased interest of researchers and media for the newly discovered tribe, you are the only person from outside whom they trust. They are ardent believers in their goddess and, trusting you, take you to her abode on a holy mountain. To your surprise, you find that the mountain is a reservoir of Uranium that can be used in your power-starved country's nuclear power plants. Besides, you are aware that Uranium being radioactive, it is highly risky to go near the mountain. You try to convince the people about harmful effects it can have and the utilitarian value that it possess for the country. However, they are in no mood to argue and politely ask you to leave. You fear that very soon the outside world will find about this and the vulnerable tribe would be displaced from their land.

(a) Evaluate the following courses of action which you can take for their ethical merits and demerits:

- You would continue to convince the people yourself about the possible consequences and urge them to relocate.
- You would call in local and national NGOs for protecting the rights of the people against the State and file a PIL in Supreme Court if the State proceeds with dispossession.
- You would yourself tell the government and the scientific community about the reserves and let them proceed in their own way.

(b) Without restricting yourself to the above options, state the course of action that you would take and why? 20

आप एक नृविज्ञानी हैं और आपने वैसे जनजातीय समुदाय के साथ मधुर संबंध बनाए हैं जो अब तक शेष मानवजाति से पृथक् था। नई खोजी गई जनजाति में मीडिया और शोधकर्ताओं की बढ़ती रुचि के पश्चात् भी आप अकेले ऐसे बाहरी व्यक्ति हैं जिन पर वे विश्वास करते हैं। वे अपनी देवी के अनन्य उपासक हैं और आप पर विश्वास करते हुए एक दिन वे आपको एक पवित्र पहाड़ पर स्थित उसके वास स्थल पर ले जाते हैं। आप इस बात से आश्चर्यचकित हो जाते हैं कि वह पहाड़ यूरेनियम का भंडार है जिसका उपयोग ऊर्जा की कमी से जूझते आपके देश के नाभकीय ऊर्जा संयंत्रों में किया जा सकता है। साथ ही, आप इस बात से भी अवगत हैं कि यूरेनियम के रेडियोधर्मी होने के कारण पहाड़ के निकट जाना अत्यधिक संकटपूर्ण है। आप लोगों को इसके क्षतिकारक प्रभावों और राष्ट्र के लिए इसकी उपयोगिता के मूल्य के संबंध में समझाने का प्रयास करते हैं। चूंकि वे अभी किसी तर्क-वितर्क की मुद्रा में नहीं हैं और आपसे सविनय चले जाने को कहते हैं। आपको इस बात का भय है कि शीघ्र ही बाह्य जगत इस संबंध में जान जाएगा और सुभेद्य जनजातीय लोग अपनी भूमि से विस्थापित हो जाएंगे।

(a) नैतिक औचित्य और अनौचित्य के आधार पर आपके द्वारा उठाए जाने वाले कदम का मूल्यांकन करें:

- आप लोगों को संभावित परिणामों के संबंध में समझाना जारी रखेंगे और उन्हें पुनर्स्थापित होने को प्रेरित करेंगे।
- आप राज्य के विरुद्ध निवासियों के अधिकारों की रक्षा के लिए स्थानीय एवं राष्ट्रीय गैर-सरकारी संगठनों को आमंत्रित करेंगे और यदि राज्य निर्वासन की दिशा में बढ़ता है तो आप सर्वोच्च न्यायालय में एक जनहित याचिका प्रस्तुत करेंगे।
- आप स्वयं सरकार एवं विज्ञान जगत को भंडार के संबंध में बताएंगे तत्पश्चात् उन्हें उनकी इच्छानुसार कार्यवाही के लिए स्वतंत्र छोड़ देंगे।

(E) अपने आपको उपर्युक्त विकल्पों तक सीमित न करते हुए, उन उपायों को बताएं जिन्हें आप अमल में लाना चाहेंगे। ऐसा करने का कारण भी बताएं।

The above case presents the ethical dilemma of how the tribe can be convinced to stay away from the mountain due to its radioactive radiations while at the same time not hurting her cultural sensibilities. It also contains the dilemma of how to prevent the displacement of the tribe when it comes to light that the region occupied by them is rich in Uranium. Such a displacement will result in the tribe losing trust in mainstream society and will generate resentment in the tribe.

(i) Merits :

continue to convince people about the possible consequences ~~is~~ can work since the tribal people trust the anthropologist. Repeated persuasions might make them think if they have been facing any negative impact due to the radiations already.

Demerits :

The tribe is unlikely to shed its years

old cultural beliefs just for the sake of one person. It might even be counter productive that they become wary of any outsiders, including the anthropologist.

(ii) Merits :

calling in the local and national NGOs for campaigning for rights of the tribe as well as filing a PIL may prove to be favourable. Mainstream society fighting for tribal rights might create trusting relationships between the tribe and mainstream society. A favourable supreme court verdict may prevent snatching away of their rights.

Demerits :

However, greater the campaigning, greater will be media attention on the issue. It might work negatively. It may increase the attempts of other people to take over the tribal land. Filing a PIL will result into a long, tedious legal struggle, which may even give an unfavourable verdict.

(iii) Merits :

Trust is reposed in the government that it will take the best decision for

public interest .

Demerits :

This would be running away from one's moral responsibility . As the anthropologist is the only person trusted by the tribe , leaving the responsibility to the government would mean forsaking his responsibility .

Moreover, the government has a bad track record with respect to ensuring welfare of tribals . Letting the government have its way without even advocating tribal concerns may adversely affect the tribals .

The ~~state~~ course of action to be taken has to take into account tribal concerns along with larger public interest . The ^{best} course of action is that the anthropologist continues to win the trust of the tribe and gradually ~~be~~ tells them about the dangers of the mountain . At the same time , the anthropologist should write to the government to explaining the vulnerable position of the tribe . He/she should explain how an immediate snatching away of land would impact their cultural

sensibilities, make them mistrust the government and mainstream society and generate hostility and resentment. The anthropologist should ask the state to first win the trust of the tribe, involve them in deciding their relocation and only then go for land acquisition.

14. A junior member of staff has just returned to work after taking special leave to care for her elderly mother. For financial reasons she needs to work full-time. She has been having difficulties with her mother's home care arrangements, causing her to miss a number of team meetings (which usually take place at the beginning of each day) and to leave work early. She is very competent in her work but her absences are putting pressure on her and her overworked colleagues. You are her manager, and you are aware that the flow of work through the practice is coming under pressure. One of her male colleagues is beginning to make comments such as "a woman's place is in the home", and is undermining her at every opportunity, putting her under even greater stress.

What possible steps can you take to ensure that the work of the team does not suffer while also taking other humanitarian considerations into account.

20

अपनी बुजुर्ग मां की देखभाल के लिए विशेष छुट्टी पर रहने के पश्चात् एक कनिष्ठ कर्मि कार्य पर लौटी है। वित्तीय कारणों से उसे पूरे समय कार्य करने की आवश्यकता है। उसे अपनी मां के लिए घर पर देखभाल की व्यवस्था करने में कठिनाई आ रही है जिस कारण वह कई टीम बैठकों (जो प्रायः प्रति दिन, दिन के आरंभ में होते हैं) में उपस्थित नहीं हो पा रही है और वह कार्यालय से घर भी जल्दी चली जाती है। वह अपने कार्य में बहुत ही सक्षम है, लेकिन उसकी अनुपस्थिति उसके ऊपर और काम के बोझ तले दबे उसके सहकर्मियों के ऊपर दबाव का कार्य कर रही है। आप एक प्रबंधक हैं और आप इस बात से अवगत हैं कि इस चलन से कार्य प्रवाह पर दबाव पड़ रहा है। उसके एक पुरुष सहकर्मि ने "एक महिला का स्थान घर में होता है" जैसे ताने भी मारने आरंभ कर दिये हैं और वह उसे प्राप्त हो सकने वाले प्रत्येक अवसर के संबंध में कमजोर बना रहा है जिससे वह और भी गहन तनाव का अनुभव कर रही है। सभी मानवीय पहलुओं का ध्यान रखते हुए, इन परिस्थितियों में टीम का कार्य प्रभावित न हो, यह सुनिश्चित करने के लिए आप कौन से कदम उठावेंगे?

In the above case, the following ethical concerns are at stake :

1. PUNCTUALITY AND DEDICATION TO WORK

The woman employee due to an ailing elderly mother is prevented from working to her fullest capacity. She is unable to come on time in the morning to attend a number of team meetings and has to leave work early in the evening as well before completing the said office hours.

This is setting a bad precedent as well as hampering the progress of the work of the organization. Personal considerations are outweighing professional obligations.

2. WEAKENING OF TEAM SPIRIT

Due to the woman employee's frequent absences, pressure is being put on her other colleagues, which is resulting in undermining of team spirit and intergroup harmony.

3. GENDER BIAS AT WORKPLACE

Due to her absence at work and reduced capacity to work to her full potential, one of her male colleague is even beginning to make comments such as "a woman's place is in the home." Such an attitude, if not discouraged would lead to gender discrimination at workplace. Her male colleagues will see her as not an equal and undeserving for the position.

Thus, possible measures that can be taken to tackle the situation are as follows :

1. As the Manager of the organization, I can call the woman employee for a meeting to discuss what possible arrangements can be made such that she is able to take care of her mother and at the same time not neglect her work. I can recommend the employee to locate the nearest Old Age Persons Care Centre so that she can find a place where her mother will be taken care of properly while she is away at work.
2. ~~I can~~ As the manager of the organization, I can promise her a bonus if she works to her fullest capacity. Such a financial incentive will propel her to work with full dedication and also assure her some financial supplement to help her take care of her mother.
3. Office Meetings should be organized to condemn any sexist remarks to prevent any patriarchal mindset and

attitudes .

4. Also, the woman employee has to be given strong warning regarding punctuality. Digresses should be allowed only ~~on~~ in exceptional cases and not on daily basis .

