



PHILOSOPHY (Test Code : 577)

Name of Candidate **ABHINAV SHUKLA** Registration No. **2098**
 Schedule **B** Module
 Place **MUMBAI** Time **2:30 p.m.** Date **18/11/2014**
 Classroom Distance Learning Classroom & Distance Learning

INDEX TABLE

Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained
1.	50	
2.	50	
3.	50	
4.	50	
5.	50	
6.	50	
7.	50	
8.	50	

Maximum Marks : 250

Remarks:

Signature of Examiner

EVALUATION INDICATORS

1. Alignment Competence
2. Context Competence
3. Content Competence
4. Language Competence
5. Introduction Competence
6. Structure - Presentation Competence
7. Conclusion Competence

INSTRUCTIONS

1. Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, ID Number and Test Code).
2. Candidates should attempt answer to the part/sub-part of a question strictly within the pre-defined space. Any attempt outside the pre-defined space shall not be evaluated.
3. The candidate need not write anything in his/her answer that derogates the dignity of an individual or an organization.
4. Candidates should attempt all questions strictly in accordance with the instruction given under each question.
5. The candidate should respect the instructions, given by the invigilator.

103, 1st Floor B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi-09

75, 3rd Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi - 110060

Overall Macro comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

All The Best

1. (a) Equality does not mean uniformity. Equality means to remove inequality or discrimination which is unreasonable and illogical. Explain? 10
समानता का अभिप्राय एकरूपता नहीं है। समानता का अभिप्राय असमानता और विभेद को दूर करना है, जो कि अतार्किक और अबौद्धिक है। व्याख्या करें।

Equality is an important social political ideal which has been defined by R H Tawney as bridging the gap between the peak and the valley.

The above definition itself makes it clear that equality is not uniformity ~~it~~ and it allows for those types of discriminations that lessen the gap between haves and have nots.

Discriminations are of two types - natural and conventional. Natural discrimination is due to inherent features at birth. E.g. - ~~gender~~ sex. Conventional discriminations are created by the society and are further of two types - positive and negative. Negative discriminations favor the rich and the powerful while positive discrimination is aimed at upliftment of marginalised sections.

Equality aims to eliminate negative discrimination but it supports positive discrimination till the weaker sections attain a certain level of parity in the society. This is also evident in Indian Constitution's article 14 which provides for equality before law as well as equal protection of law to all citizens.

Thus, equality doesn't imply uniformity but tries to reduce illogical discrimination.

1. (b) Justice means to give each individual his right place in society. Define? 10
न्याय के अभिप्राय प्रत्येक व्यक्ति को उसका उचित स्थान समाज में देने से है। व्याख्या करें।

Justice is an important social political ideal which synthesizes different conflicting claims and ideals while trying to give an individual what is due to him.

This can be seen through different theories of justice.

Rawls' theory of justice is a liberal, procedural and distributive theory of justice which aims at distribution of primary goods in such

a manner that every section in the society gets what is due to him.

Nozick's theory of justice defines justice as entitlement or valid legal claim over goods of the natural world, or those created by men themselves by use of natural world. Thus, here also the sense of giving rightful due is evident.

Plato's theory of justice defines justice as the right state of the human soul for an individual. For a society, justice is secured when each of the classes perform their duties and do not interfere in each others' work i.e. rulers, soldiers and producers restrict themselves to their work. It is quite similar to the idea of 'svadharmafalana' of Geeta.

Thus, the above theories show that justice is about giving an individual his rightful place in society.

1. (c) Sovereignty is the supreme power of state over its citizens and which is express by law. Explain?

10

सम्राज्यता अपने नागरिकों पर राज्य की सर्वोच्च शक्ति है, जो कानून के रूप में व्यक्त होती है?

The above statement supports a legal and monistic theory of sovereignty. Such a theory was supported by philosophers like Bodin, Hobbes and Austin.

Bodin was the progenitor of the concept of sovereignty and defined it as absolute power of state over its subjects and citizens unrestrained by law. However, he imposed certain restrictions on sovereignty ~~and~~ like natural law, divine law, salic law etc.

The faults of his theory were corrected by Austin who conferred supreme power in the true sense upon the state. The features of sovereignty according to Austin are - absolute, universal, permanent, non-transferable, exclusive and indivisible. The powers are expressed by the state through the laws it

makes. Thus, Austin said that law is the command of the sovereign.

Austin is sometimes criticised for laying too much emphasis on power which can even reduce liberty of individuals. But he should be credited for developing the idea of sovereignty to its logical culmination.

1. (d) Individual and state also depends on the notion of social unity. Discuss.

10

व्यक्ति और राज्य सामाजिक एकता पर निर्भर करते हैं। चर्चा करें।

Social unity refers to the quality that different elements in the society agree upon a certain set of ideals and principles and work together to achieve them.

An individual's existence is dependent on the notion of social unity and so is that of the state. This idea can be best illustrated through the philosophies of Kautilya and Hobbes.

Hobbes proffounds that without a state an individual would exist in a 'state of nature' which would be frightful as everyone would try to exert his freedom at the cost of others. Thus, an individual and the society needs to surrender some of their rights to the sovereign who will bring order to the society. Thus, state comes into existence and individual is also protected.

Similarly, Kautilya says that to avoid a situation of Matya nyaya where the strong devours the weak, the society needs a king. This brings saptanga state into existence.

Also, the individual and the state are dependent on the society for fulfillment of its duties and holding the individuals accountable for their duties.

Thus, individuals and state also depend on social unity.

1. (e) State is a necessary evil. Discuss.

10

राज्य एक आवश्यक बुराई है। चर्चा करें।

There are a number of relationships propounded by various philosophical schools regarding the nature of relation between an individual and the state. One of them which is held by the likes of ^{negative} positive liberals, ^{libertarians} egalitarians etc. is that state is a necessary evil.

This view stems from their interpretation of liberty. ^{Negative} Positive liberals and egalitarians libertarians believe in the centrality of human individual liberty which they define as absence of restraints. Any presence of state will increase restraints because of commission or omission by law or by trying to bring equality among different sections of the society. These irreconcilable differences between the nature of law and liberty as well as equality and liberty make the state evil.

However, state is necessary to maintain order in the society and therefore these thinkers support a limited state. Thus, state becomes a necessary evil.

This view is opposed by positive liberals and egalitarians who view state as a positive good because it provides opportunities for maximum development of personality of an individual.

2. (a) Punishment is external negative sanction of morality. Define.
दण्ड नैतिकता के लिए बाह्य नकारात्मक स्वीकृति है। व्याख्या करें।

20

2. (b) He who is unable to live in society or who has no need to do so because he is self-sufficient for he must be either a beast or god. Discuss. 15
वह जो समाज में रहने के लिए योग्य नहीं है या जिसे समाज की कोई आवश्यकता नहीं है, क्योंकि वह आत्मनिर्भर है, तब वह या तो जानवर है या भगवान। चर्चा करें।

2. (c) In a democracy the poor will have more power than the rich, because there are more of them, and the will of the majority is supreme (Aristotle). Discuss. 15

लोकतंत्र में निर्धन के पास अमीर से ज्यादा शक्ति है, क्योंकि वे उनसे अधिक हैं और बहुमत की इच्छा ही सर्वोच्च होती है। चर्चा करें।

Don't write
anything this
margin
(यह भाग में
कुछ न लिखें)

Call us : 9650617807, 9968029039
Blog : www.visionias.wordpress.com

Visit us : www.visionias.in
Email : ajay.visionias@gmail.com

3. (a) Essential conditions for successful working of democracy. Explain. 20
लोकतंत्र की कार्यप्रणाली की सफलता की आवश्यक शर्तें क्या हैं? व्याख्या करें।

Don't write anything this margin
(इस मरग में कुछ न लिखें)

3. (b) Individual is an end in itself, state and society are the means for the welfare of individual. Discuss. 15

व्यक्ति स्वतः साध्य है, राज्य और समाज व्यक्ति के कल्याण के साधन हैं। चर्चा करें।

3. (c) Democracy is road to socialism. Explain.
लोकतंत्र समाजवाद का मार्ग प्रशस्त करता है।

15

Call us : 9650617807, 9968029039
Blog : www.visionias.wordpress.com

Page 20 of 52

Visit us : www.visionias.in
Email : ajay.visionias@gmail.com

This document is personalised for Abhijit Shukla(abhijitshuklano1@gmail.com)

4. (a) Nehru scientific humanism was reflected in his support for democracy. Explain.

20

नेहरू का वैज्ञानिक मानववाद लोकतंत्र का समर्थन करता है। व्याख्या करें।

Humanism is a school of thought that recognizes and appreciates the centrality of human beings in all spheres of life.

Nehru was a scientific humanist. This means that he recognized the importance of human beings and was more focused on improving the conditions of 'this-world' rather than harboring 'other-worldly' concerns. This

view was based on this scientific and rational temper. Nehru believed in scientific knowledge based on experience and reason ~~was~~ developed on experience as the highest form of knowledge. He supported secular morality and was an agnostic i.e. he did not affirm or deny the existence of transcendental reality like God.

These beliefs made him support democracy as the optimal form of government because of the following reasons:

Firstly, democracy being a government of the people, by the people and for the people recognizes the centrality of people. It allows them to express their concerns openly and choose their actions boldly.

Secondly, democracy allows for free thinking and open discussion which

promotes scientific temper and rationality among the citizens. Thirdly, democracy, unlike theocracy or monarchy has the potential to end exploitation of one human being by another. Fourthly, democracy upholds the values of liberty, equality and justice. Nehru was also a supporter of socialistic ideas. He also supported democracy as he saw it as the only way to bring about socialism in a progressive society.

Thus, Nehru's humanistic beliefs & made him favor democracy

4. (b) Multiculturalism is that, individual identity is culturally embedded. Explain?

15

बहुसंस्कृतिवाद में व्यक्तिगत पहचान अन्तर्निहित होती है। व्याख्या करें।

Multiculturalism is a thought that recognizes the centrality of culture in the life of an individual.

An individual is a culturally conditioned being. His rationality, his emotions, his thoughts, his beliefs and ultimately his identity are derived from his culture. Multiculturalism recognizes the importance of this culture by accepting that an individual's happiness itself is a function of ~~his~~ the expression and acceptance of his culture.

Thus, multiculturalism becomes both a factual as well as a normative term. As a fact, it refers to the existence of a variety of cultures in the society. As a normative term it calls for recognizing these varieties of culture in public space as well

as in policies.

The main features of multiculturalism, as given by Bhabhu Parekh, are:

Firstly, culture shapes human nature.

Secondly, the differences in various cultures do not make some culture inferior and others superior.

Thirdly, if cultures are allowed to interact then all cultures get enriched because cultures are dynamic systems.

However, multiculturalism has been criticised by thinkers like Amartya Sen who says that an individual has multiple identities but multiculturalism emphasises on only a single identity i.e. culture.

Despite this, multiculturalism can be said to have brought to the fore an important issue of modern times - cultural injustice.

4. (c) Radical humanism (Explain)
उग्रमानववाद (व्याख्या करें।)

15

Radical humanism or new humanism was a philosophy given by M.N. Roy based on the latest researches in the field of sociology and biology.

Being a form of humanism, it also believes in centrality of human beings. It supports scientific knowledge as the ^{highest} best form of knowledge. It conclusively rejects transcendental entities like God. However, the most important features are - rationality, morality and freedom.

Reason, as per Roy, developed in human beings during the course of evolution and it is this reason that helps him evaluate his relations within the society.

Morality has been explained by Roy on the basis of the urge to exist in social units, which can be

seen in all animals. Humans are also animals and since they are the most developed among them, this urge is particularly strong in them. To fulfill this urge, humans use their reason to determine what is right and wrong conduct in a social context. This gives rise to morality. Thus, Roy says that, "I want to be moral, ^{not} to please God, but to please myself."

Freedom has been explained on the basis of desire to exist ^{among the animals}. Humans, being the most developed animals, have this desire as well as a desire to exist at a higher level. This desire to exist at a higher level manifests itself when we fight against tyranny, slavery etc.

Roy has been criticised for bringing nothing new to the table in new humanism but his contribution to novel explanation of humanism has earned him the title of genuine Indian philosopher.

5. (a) Religion is a matter of knowledge only. (Criticism)

12.5

धर्म केवल ज्ञान का विषय है। (आलोचना करें।)

Religion can be seen as an area of human enquiry where which provides us theories regarding the origin and purpose of the universe as well as a study of ends of human values and ethical conduct. In this sense it can be accepted as a matter of knowledge only.

But religion transcends the boundaries of mere knowledge and helps the followers to apply this knowledge in their lives. Galloway has defined religion as man's belief in a power beyond himself which provides him stability in life and fulfills his emotional needs and is expressed through acts of worship and service. If we analyse this definition then religion is concerned not only with knowledge but also emotions

moral considerations cease to be of importance because they act without any motive and as an instrument in the hands of the divine. Thus, their actions have no moral significance.

E.g:- Kierkegaard talks of suspension of morality in the case of Abraham who accepted to kill his own son on the divine command.

However, in commonly accepted sense every religion is associated with a moral code which it promotes for the welfare of its followers and for happiness of society. It so also gives an objective framework to morality. Thus, the above described instances are exceptions at best and it can be said that religion without morality is empty as it would remain only a set of rituals and practices.

5. (c) Can Atheism satisfy our heart and intellect? Explain.

12.5

क्या नास्तिकता हमारे हृदय और बुद्धि को संतुष्ट दे सकती है। व्याख्या करें।

Atheism can be any discipline which does not believe in the existence of God. It can be of any of the two types - spiritual or materialistic.

Human heart and intellect has an ever curious disposition to understand the meaning and the end of universe and human life. It also needs a set of principles to follow which impart utility and a sense of rightness to his life and without which his life would seem like the myth of Sisyphus who was destined to roll a stone on top of a mountain forever, only to see it stumble back again.

Materialistic atheism can provide answers to the above questions but leaves us wanting for more and more material pleasures because they become the ultimate goal of life. E.g. - Charvaka

However, spiritual atheism can provide us these answers and show us a way of life which can be appealing to our head as well as our hearts. E.g:- Buddhism and Jainism do not believe in the existence of God but provide a solid comprehensive explanation about meaning and end of universe as well as a purpose of life.

5. (d) God is no shadowy absolute but a determine being in determinate relations to world and man. Explain. 12.5

ईश्वर अस्पष्ट परमतत्व नहीं है, लेकिन ईश्वर को एक निश्चित व्यक्ति माना गया है, जिसका मानव तथा विश्व के साथ एक निश्चित सम्बन्ध है। व्याख्या करें।

The above statement expresses its approval for personalistic notion of God which accepts God as having a personality.

The meaning of God having a personality is that God is full of metaphysical attributes (omnipresence, omnipotence, omniscience), moral attributes (love, goodness, truth etc), has freedom of will and is a

self conscious entity. This concept is opposed to the idea of an impersonalistic god whose characteristic cannot be defined. E.g:- Shankaracharya says "neti neti" about Brahman.

Accepting a personalistic notion of god is essential to explain feelings of love, devotion and surrender towards god. It is also important to see god as the creator, preserver and regulator of this universe. It helps us make sense of religious activities like prayer.

The personalistic notion is criticised for having anthropomorphic error i.e.:- human beings treat god as having a ^{human like} personality because they are humans.

Despite this criticism, it is an important notion for sustaining devotion and religion.

6. (a) Theologians are chiefly interested in the study of the particular religion to which they adhere and beliefs connected with it. Discuss. 20
धर्मशास्त्री मुख्यतः एक विशेष धर्म के अध्ययन में रुचि रखते हैं, जिससे वह उसका
पूर्णतः अनुपालन कर सकें और उसके विश्वासों के साथ जुड़े रहें। (चर्चा करें।)

6. (b) Religion is the sob of the oppressed creatures, the heart of the heartless world, the spirit of condition utterly unspiritual. Is it is the opium of the poor. Discuss.

15

धरु सताए हुए प्राणी की सिसकी है, निर्दयी विशु का हृदय है, नितान्त ही अध्यात्म विरोधी परिस्थितियों की भावना है। यह गरीबों की अफीम है। चर्चा करें।

6. (c) Science without religion is lame, religion without science is blind. Discuss.

15

वरुनरुन के बनरु धरुड लंगडरु है, धरुड के बनरु वरुनरुन अंधरु है। चरुचरु करुं।

Don't write
anything this
margin
(इस भाग में
कुछ ना लिखें)

7. (a) The thought of god in the mind demonstrates his being. (Criticism) 12.5
मन में ईश्वर का विचार उसके होने को प्रदर्शित करता है। आलोचना करें।

This statement pertains to ontological proof for existence of god which is an a priori proof i.e. - it doesn't depend on experience.

The proof was accepted by Anselm and Descartes among others. It says that the idea of god is that of a perfect being but a being can be perfect if his existence not only mental but also real. Thus, god's existence is deduced.

This proof was criticised by Kant who said that existence was not a predicate. It means that all qualities require a substratum for their existence. This substratum was existence. If we consider existence as a quality or a predicate then it will also require a substratum which will lead to infinite regress.

Quariton has also criticised it by saying that if the idea of a perfect God proves his existence then an idea of a perfect island should also prove its existence.

The ontological argument was revived in modern times by the thought that God is not a contingent being and for him existence is a predicate. This is refuted by modern philosophers by saying that this ~~is~~ statement proves that God's existence is necessary but not that he exists.

7. (b) What is cosmological argument? Cosmological argument is completely refuted by Hume? Explain. 12.5

सृष्टिमूलक तर्क क्या है? ह्यूम सृष्टिमूलक तर्क का पूर्णतया खण्डन करता है। चर्चा करें।

Cosmological argument refers to any argument that proves the existence of God based on the existence of world. It was given most clearly in Summa Theologiae. Its three important forms are:

Firstly, God's existence can be proved based on the need of an unmoved prime mover of this world. This, mover was God.

Secondly, the objects of this world are contingent but we do not see the world destroying on itself. This can only happen if there is a necessary ground. This necessary ground is God.

Thirdly, God has been accepted as the first cause in the series of cause-effect chain of the world to avoid infinite regress.

The three proofs are based on causal theory and Hume refutes

them based on his refutation of causal theory. Hume says that causality is not a necessary principle i.e.:- there is no necessary relation between cause and effect. It is mere conjunction. Thus, the above three proofs of existence of god cannot be accepted.

7. (c) God wants to spiritual fruit, not religious nuts. Explain.

12.5

ईश्वर आध्यात्मिक फल चाहता है न कि धार्मिक पागलपन। व्याख्या करें।

Religion and the idea of god were propagated in the society to further its well being, promote love, harmony and peace among its members and to lead them on the right path.

Despite these noble intentions, religion in many cases breeds hatred in the form of intolerance, anger and resentment in the form of communalism and even violence and murder in the form of fundamentalist terrorism.

This is because of separation of what Gandhiji called the internal aspect of religion from its structural aspect. The internal aspect of all religions, as per Gandhiji, promoted human values like co-operation, brotherhood, love etc while structural aspects comprised of rituals and outward practices.

The true essence of religion is its internal aspect and if we accept the notion of a God with moral attributes, it would be these values that he would wish humans to uphold and not become extremists by focusing on structural aspects only.

Therefore, God would want religious spiritual fruits and not religious nuts.

7. (d) Religious statements are emotive. Discuss.

12.5

धार्मिक कथन संवेगात्मक होते हैं। चर्चा करें।

Religious statements like, "god is great" pose a challenge in front of philosophers about their meaning. One of the meanings assigned to them by philosophers, particularly the logical positivists is that they are emotive statements. It is a non-cognitivist view of religious language.

This conclusion is based on verification theory of meaning of the logical positivists. A. J. Ayer says that a statement is meaningful if it is analytical or empirically verified. Since religious statements are neither analytical, nor empirically verified, they are meaningless. They are statements of emotion. E.g.:- saying "god is great" means that the speaker "feels" that god is great.

This view was opposed by the cognitivists like John Hick who

profounds that religious statements are verifiable based on post mortem experience. This view is criticised for being unscientific and arbitrary.

A middle ground to accept the meaning of religious statements would be that as suggested by Wittgenstein that religious statements have meaning in religious context.

8. (a) A paradise which is all roses without thorns, all sweetness without an ingredient of sorrow, world seem to be too insipid for human beings to enjoy for any length of time. (Criticism) 12.5

ऐसा स्वर्ग जहाँ कटकहीन गुलाब ही गुलाब हों, जहाँ दुःख शोक निरपेक्ष माधुर्य ही माधुर्य हो, मानव समुदाय को इतना सारहीन प्रतीत होता है कि वह किसी लम्बी अवधि तक शायद ही इसका आनन्द उपभोग कर सके।

The above statement supports an instrumentalist view for explanation of evil in this universe.

Problem of evil is a problem for religious persons. It questions that how could an omnipotent and benevolent god allow evil in this universe. Existence of evil shows that either world was not created by god or he is not omnipotent or benevolent.

The ~~and~~ instrumentalist view or Irenaean theodicy says that evil has some value and utility in this world. It allows human beings to become more mature by facing difficulties in life. Man was created in the "image" of God but his progression to "likeness" of God is facilitated by evil.

This view is criticised on following accounts:

Firstly, if evil is here to promote good then why does it promote more evil.

Secondly, why is the quantity of evil so much more than good.

Thirdly, can evils like the slavery, holocaust etc. be justified for "soul building".

Fourthly, in the presence of evil, absolute good loses its relevance.

Thus, the instrumentalist view doesn't satisfactorily solve the problem of evil.

8. (b) Our most holy religion is founded on faith and not on reason. Explain.

12.5

धर्म आस्थापरक है न कि बुद्धिपरक। व्याख्या करें।

Faith and reason are two prominent pillars of religious knowledge but in the arena of religion reason comes after faith.

Reason helps us to know religion by interpreting religious texts. It also helps in making transitory religious experiences permanent. It helps defend our beliefs against criticisms of others. It also separates religion from superstition and blind faith.

However, reason ^{stands} comes secondary to faith in religion. Religion is associated with transcendental entities and their knowledge. E.g.- soul, god, rebirth. Reason cannot help in this. Faith is essential for the most sublime religious experiences like mystical experiences. Reason is of little importance there.

Because of the above differences

religion is often called accepted belief and not justified belief.

8. (c) "The only excuse for God is that he doesn't exist". (Friedrich Nietzsche)
Discuss.

12.5

ईश्वर के लिए एक ही बहाना है कि वह उपस्थित नहीं है। चर्चा करें।

The above statement explicates the stand taken by those thinkers who oppose the existence of God based on problem of evil.

The problem of evil says that God created a world which has evil. This means either God is not omnipotent or he is not benevolent or he did not create the world or, in other words, the only excuse for God is that he doesn't exist.

This problem has been attempted to be solved by theists through the following views:

- 1) Instrumentalist view - evil was created by god to promote good. This view is criticised because absolute good loses its relevance in an evil world.
- 2) Freedom of will view - evil is a result of misuse of free will of humans or a punishment thereof. It is criticised for giving unsatisfactory explanation for natural evil.
- 3) Illusion view - evil is only an illusion which occurs due to our lack of knowledge. This view is criticised for not attempting to circumvent the problem.
- 4) Non-traditional view - evil exists because god is not omnipotent but he has ensured enough good to outweigh evil. This view will not be acceptable to religious persons. It also has a sense of elitism.

8. (d) Conversion means change of faith, from one's own religion to another. Discuss. 12.5

धर्मान्तरण उस प्रक्रिया का नाम है, जिसमें व्यक्ति की आस्था का परिवर्तन होता है, जिसका वह अनुगामी होता है, को त्यागकर दूसरे नए धर्म का अंगीकार करता है। चर्चा करें।

Conversion from one religion to another represents a belief in the idea of religious exclusivism or that one particular path is the right path to reach the ultimate reality.

Religion comprises of doctrines related to entities which do not belong to this world and need faith for their acceptance. Similarly, the path one takes to reach them are goals set by religion are dependent on the religion.

Thus, when a person changes his religion it signifies that he is ~~not~~ believes that not all ways and not all religions lead to the ultimate end and he has lost faith in ~~the~~ his current religion.

A contrarian view is that of

religious inclusivism which believes that all religions lead to the same goal and such a person would not lose faith in his religion easily.

Apart from the above, there might be other practical considerations like societal conditions that may have affected such a choice even when the person might not have lost faith.