



VISION IAS

www.visionias.in

VISION IAS
14 NOV 2015
SUBMITTED IN 3 HOURS
RECEIVED

GENERAL STUDIES (TEST CODE : 634)

Name of Candidate	RULU GARG		
Medium Hindi/Eng.	ENGLISH	Registration Number	4546
Center	RAS. NAGAR	Date	14-11-15

INDEX TABLE			INSTRUCTIONS
Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained	
1(a)	10		
1(b)	10		
2(a)	10		
2(b)	10		
3(a)	10		
3(b)	10		
4(a)	10		
4(b)	10		
5(a)	10		
5(b)	10		
6	10		
7	10		
8	10		
9	20		
10	20		
11	20		
12	20		
13	20		
14	20		
Total Marks Obtained:			
Remarks:			
Signature of Examiner			

- Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, Registration Number and Test Code).
उत्तर पुस्तिका में सूचनाएं भरना आवश्यक है (नाम, प्रश्न-पत्र कोड, विद्यार्थी क्रमांक आदि)।
- There are FOURTEEN questions printed in HINDI and ENGLISH.
इसमें चौदह प्रश्न हैं तथा हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी दोनों में छपे हैं।
- All questions are compulsory.
सभी प्रश्न अनिवार्य हैं।
- The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.
प्रत्येक प्रश्न/भाग के अंक उसके सामने दिए गए हैं।
- Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one.
प्रश्नों के उत्तर उसी माध्यम में लिखे जाने चाहिए जिसका उल्लेख आपके प्रवेश पत्र में किया गया है और उस माध्यम का स्पष्ट उल्लेख प्रश्न-सह-उत्तर (क्यूसीए) पुस्तिका के मुख्य पृष्ठ पर अंकित निर्दिष्ट स्थान पर किया जाना चाहिए। उल्लिखित माध्यम के अतिरिक्त अन्य किसी माध्यम में लिए गए उत्तर पर कोई अंक नहीं मिलेंगे।
- Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to.
प्रश्नों में शब्द सीमा, जहाँ विनिर्दिष्ट है, का अनुसरण किया जाना चाहिए।
- Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.
उत्तर पुस्तिका में खाली छोड़ा हुआ पृष्ठ या उसके अंश को स्पष्ट रूप से काटा जाना चाहिए।

75, 3rd Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi – 110060

103, 1st Floor, B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi – 110009

EVALUATION INDICATORS

1. Alignment Competence
2. Context Competence
3. Content Competence
4. Language Competence
5. Introduction Competence
6. Structure - Presentation Competence
7. Conclusion Competence

Overall Macro Comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

6.

All the Best

SECTION - A

Answer the following questions in not more than 150 words each:

1. (a) Even though women may have equal skills, qualifications and commitment as men, they face much more difficulty in rising up the leadership hierarchy. Discuss the reasons for the same. Also explain the importance of having gender parity in positions of leadership. 10

पुरुषों के समान कुशलता, योग्यता और प्रतिबद्धता जैसे गुणों से युक्त होने के बावजूद भी महिलाओं को नेतृत्व श्रृंखला में उच्च सोपानों तक पहुँचने के लिए अपेक्षाकृत अधिक कठिनाई का सामना करना पड़ता है। समस्या की पृष्ठभूमि में निहित कारणों पर चर्चा कीजिये। इसके साथ ही नेतृत्व के विविध स्तरों पर लैंगिक समानता के महत्व का उल्लेख कीजिए।

The reason - fundamental in the problem is patriarchal mindset. Men at work refuse to acknowledge that women could have equal skills as men at work at leadership positions.

This leads to discrimination against women in allocation of duties, promotions, salaries etc.

- Maternity leave during pregnancy also causes ~~disadvantage~~ comparative disadvantage to women, due to lost months of experience.

- Traditional allocation of jobs -
women - house work - also
cause many to leave their jobs
after childbirth - ~~fewer~~
fewer women in leadership
positions
- Unsupportive workplace -
no provision for crèches or
for work at home.

Importance of gender parity in position of leadership :

1. Women are equal to men in
efficiency - ensure only best
reach to top - irrespective
of gender.
2. • Bring more sensitivity &
compassion to decisions - more
diverse views & possibilities
- hence best decision could
be taken.

1. (b) All correct decisions are honest and all incorrect decisions are dishonest. Do you agree? How should the correctness and incorrectness of a decision be decided? 10

सभी सही निर्णय ईमानदारी भरे होते हैं और सभी गलत निर्णय बेईमानी भरे होते हैं। क्या आप सहमत हैं? किसी निर्णय के सही होने और गलत होने का निर्धारण किस प्रकार किया जाना चाहिए।

Honesty is a fundamental positive
virtue of human beings.

However, as it the most important,
trustable puts justice only
honesty.

As per utilitarian ethics, maximum
good for maximum number is
the correct decision.

Hence, for some, speaking a lie,
i.e. dishonesty - if it saves
someone's life or leads to
economic benefits might be
justified.

i.e. not necessarily correct
decisions are honest & all
incorrect decisions are dishonest.

Correctness or incorrectness is
of an action is decided differently
by different schools of thinking.

For Kant, any person who does
his duty, or 'categorical imperative'
is correct - no matter what
the result - he would support
honesty, no matter what the cost.

For Utilitarian - only max good
for max people is correct action.

An individual decides about the
correctness of an action on
the basis of his conscience -
intellectual activity based on his
personal experience, innate
characteristics and value system.

2. (a) Should birth control be a voluntary exercise or a government policy in a country? In this regard, examine the ethical dimensions of having a One Child Policy in India. 10

किसी राष्ट्र में जन्म पर नियंत्रण, स्वैच्छिक प्रयास के माध्यम से होना चाहिए या सरकारी नीति के माध्यम से होना चाहिए? इस संबंध में, भारत में एक बच्चे की नीति के नैतिक आयामों का परीक्षण कीजिए।

Birth control must be a
voluntary exercise in a country.

- As it ensures that people have Right to Reproduction, according to their own economic, needs & Psychological needs of happiness.
- It also ensures that state does not intervene in the personal sphere of individual.
- Birth control must be based on information & awareness, not on coercion.

Ethical dimensions - One child
Policy in India

1. It violates the right of choice

to people of India - for having as many children as - they like - to satisfy their happiness or economic needs.

2. Would lead to huge gender imbalance - due to prevalent preference of son.

3. Would put huge pension burden on country at a later stage.

Hence, one child policy is not justified based on any grounds of either rights based or utilitarian based.

2. (b) An organisation consists of a variety of individuals with varying values and degrees of motivation. What challenges do leaders face when forging a harmonious work culture in such an organisation? How can leaders engender a sense of inclusion in face of such diversity? 10

एक संगठन का निर्माण अनग-अलग मूल्यों और अलग-अलग अभिप्रेरणा स्तर वाले विविध प्रकार के व्यक्तियों से होता है। इस प्रकार के संगठन में सामंजस्यपूर्ण कार्य-संस्कृति के विकास के मार्ग में नेतृत्व के द्वारा किन चुनौतियों का सामना किया जाता है? इस प्रकार की विविधतापूर्ण स्थिति में नेतृत्व के द्वारा कार्य करने वाले व्यक्तियों में समावेशिता की अनुभूति किस प्रकार समाविष्ट की जा सकती है?

Challenges that leaders face in building harmonious work culture :

(a) Conflicts among individuals

- leads to wastage of energy & potential of people.

(b) More time spent by people in office politics - pulling and pushing each other down.

(c) Lack of alignment of personal values with organisational values

(d) Irrational demands on leader for rewards / penalties on non-objective criteria

leaders could engender a sense of inclusion by :

1. strict adherence to merit based system & objectivity
 - those who perform get rewarded - those who don't get punished
 - promotes objective oriented work culture
2. Clear elucidation of organizational values & their mass publicity
 - so that employees know what values are expected out of them
3. Dissent channels - to enable employees to speak up & to listen to their grievances & tackle them before they become too big to handle.

3. (a) Notwithstanding compassion and morality, it is national interest that ultimately determines a country's decisions in international relations. Discuss this statement in the context of the current refugee crisis. 10
- दया और नैतिकता जैसे मूल्यों का महत्वपूर्ण स्थान होते हुए भी, अंतर्राष्ट्रीय संबंधों के परिप्रेक्ष्य में अंततः राष्ट्र के निर्णयों को राष्ट्रिय हितों के आधार पर ही निर्धारित किया जाता है। वर्तमान शरणार्थी संकट के संदर्भ में इस कथन पर चर्चा करें।

International relations are governed normally by real politics. i.e. only rational interest is dominating factor over values such as compassion, human rights etc.

Present refugee crisis epitomises this, where countries of European Union refuse to take persecuted refugees and provide them shelter. They have closed their borders citing:

- (a) Drainage of resources
- (b) domestic political repercussions
- (c) That rehabilitation would only encourage more influx
- (d) Refugees would settle permanently

However, some countries have bucked the trend eg. Germany which has opened its borders, welcoming refugees with open arms - providing them shelter, food & water.

Thus it has upheld compassion, dignity of human beings, respect for human rights.

However, this is because it realises its rational interests are aligned with such compassionate action &

not divorced from it.

Thus, rational interest along with compassion must be derived values in international relations.

3. (b) What are the ethical issues involved in climate change negotiations?
Suggest some strategies to address the divergence in ethical positions of different nations. 10

जलवायु परिवर्तन पर होने वाली वार्ताओं में समाहित नैतिक मुद्दे क्या हैं? विभिन्न राष्ट्रों के नैतिक मुद्दों से संबंधित दृष्टिकोण में जो भिन्नता है, उसके का समाधान के लिए अपनाई जा सकने वाली रणनीतियों का नुस्खा दीजिये।

Climate change negotiations must
be based on CBDR - Common
But Differentiated responsibilities.
The ethical issues involved are
justice, equity and right
to development for developing
countries.

As developed countries have
been historically responsible
for present global situation of
warming - must take greater
responsibility for correcting
it. They also have greater
resources to take this
problem - financial, technological

support must be provided to
developing countries to give
them the space to grow.

To address disparity in
ethical positions of different
nations :

- (1) INDCs - best possible way
 - as not forced from above
 - upholds democratic values
 - as per country's ability.
- (2) Greater recognition of need
for international partnership
 - to deal with challenge
- (3) Global fund & transfer of
technology mechanism -
to support developing countries
on a carbon-neutral pathway
of development

4. (a) Why is there a need for Performance Management System in an outcome oriented government? Evaluate the feasibility of peer review in context of Indian civil services. 10

एक परिणामोन्मुख सरकार में "कार्यनिष्पादन प्रबंधन प्रणाली" की आवश्यकता क्यों है? भारतीय लोक सेवाओं के संदर्भ में "नहकर्मि समीक्षा" (peer review) के औचित्य का मूल्यांकन कीजिए।

In outcome oriented government, achievement of goals means more than blind adherence to rules. This effectiveness is pursued with more vigour by some civil servants than others.

Hence, we need performance mgmt system to :

1. For periodic review of performance of civil servants
2. As an instrument of accountability
3. For objective promotions & postings
4. For objective awards & recognition
5. For weeding out those who are not performing
6. Would lead to better outcomes

Peer review - refers to monitoring and examination of one's ~~peer~~ performance by a peer at the same hierarchical level & service. eg - the work of a PM could be reviewed by another PM from a different district.

Feasibility : It provides the benefit of realistic assessment, someone who is aware of challenges at the level of job being performed - and of pitfalls & opportunities.

However challenges:

- (1) Might lead to collusion among officials
- (2) Ground level realities are strikingly different in lot of districts.

Hence could be introduced first on pilot basis to check effectiveness.

4. (b) Discretionary power in the hands of public servants is a necessary evil. Discuss.

10

लोक सेवकों के हाथों में विवेकाधीन शक्तियाँ एक आवश्यक बुराई हैं। चर्चा कीजिए।

The role of government has
widened significantly in the
present times, from ensuring
safety, security of people to
economic growth of country &
protecting the rights of vulnerable.

It has become almost
impossible to write down
rules & regulations for each
& every situation & necessary
consequent course of action.

Each situation is different
& has different content &
ground realities.

There are limits on
the number of rules &
regulations which a civil
servant could know & learn

to discharge his duty hence not practical to have rules for every situation.

- Hence, the need is to imbibe values in civil servants to take the right course of action upholding public good, in cases of discretion.
- It is also necessary that a swift & effective system of justice is available for punitive action against mala fide decisions of civil servants. This would discourage them from taking wrong decisions and encourage & promote decisions in public good.

5. (a) The landmark judgment by the Supreme Court of India recognized the transgender as a third sex. What attitudes do you notice towards the transgender people in India? Discuss some steps to facilitate a dignified life for the transgender people.

10
भारत के सर्वोच्च न्यायालय द्वारा दिए गए ऐतिहासिक निर्णय से ट्रांसजेंडर्स को तृतीय लिंग के रूप में मान्यता दी गई है। आप भारतीय परिस्थितियों में ट्रांसजेंडर्स समुदाय के लोगों के प्रति किन अभिवृत्तियों की अनुभूति करते हैं। ट्रांसजेंडर्स के लिए गरिमापूर्ण जीवन निर्माण की दिशा में उठाए जा सकने वाले कदमों के संबंध में चर्चा कीजिए।

In India, people have a heavily coloured attitude towards transgenders.

Transgenders are looked down upon & treated with contempt and disrespect wherever they go. This is a clear case violation of their human dignity.

They are also refused admission in schools, refused jobs and accommodation facilities.

This also leads to their social & economic marginalisation leaving them with the

only option to keep for survival
Hence, human rights & values of
equity, compassion, empathy
are routinely sacrificed
while dealing with them.

To facilitate a dignified life
for them :

1. Need for recognizing them
as 3rd gender - as done by SC
at the ground level.
2. Reservation in jobs & educational
institutions
3. Making discrimination & violation
of dignity against them a
criminal offence - stringent
punishment - as with SC
& ST laws.
4. Wide awareness & sensitization
campaigns, specially among
police & civil servants.

5. (b) What key characteristics of a person conveying a message make it more persuasive? When celebrities endorse a product, they do so knowing that their endorsement will persuade people to buy it. What duty do they have towards the consumers? 10

संदेश देने वाले व्यक्ति की कौन-सी महत्वपूर्ण विशेषताएँ संदेश को और अधिक आग्रहपूर्ण बनाती हैं? जब ख्याति प्राप्त व्यक्ति किसी उत्पाद का विज्ञापन करते हैं, तो वे ऐसा यह जानते हुए करते हैं कि उनके द्वारा किसी वस्तु का किया गया विज्ञापन, लोगों को वह वस्तु खरीदने हेतु प्रेरित करेगा। इस संदर्भ में उपभोक्ताओं के प्रति उनके क्या दायित्व हैं?

A person / messenger could come across as more persuasive when

(a) Credibility - when people feel that messenger knows what he is talking about - i.e. an expert in field
eg. Toothpaste - often advertised using dentists in ads.

(b) Trustworthiness - that a person would not be to serve his interests

(c) Likeability - halo effect
- i.e. good looks, smart, attractive; people think if good in one thing, he

must be good in others too.

(d) Position of influence

- If at a higher position -
better chance of persuasion.

When celebrities endorse a product,
would persuade people to buy it due
to their Credibility & attractiveness

Their duty towards consumers is:

1. Ensure that what is being
portrayed is true - i.e. nothing
false is being said.
2. Product has undergone necessary
checks & clearances from
regulatory authorities.

eg - As in recently Maggi
endorsement by Amitabh
Bachchan, where Maggi was
found unsuitable for
consumption.

6. It is said that child labor cannot be ethical at all. Do you agree? Discuss with respect to the proposed amendments to the Child Labour Act. 10

यह कहा जाता है कि बाल-श्रम किसी भी परिस्थिति में नैतिक नहीं हो सकता। क्या आप सहमत हैं? बाल-श्रम अधिनियम में प्रस्तावित संशोधनों के स्दर्भ में चर्चा कीजिए।

Child labour refers to involvement of children in economic activities.

It is considered totally unethical due to :

1. Child is ~~also~~ deprived of opportunity to education & hence to a better life.
2. Child would see at significant occupational risk; - ~~which~~ ~~is~~ much higher than adults.
3. Childhood is a tender age - where children deserve love, care & protection - not harsh working environments which are target oriented.

Hence, it is totally unethical,
to allow child labour.

Proposed amendments to Child Labour Act :

1. ~~For~~ children below 14
banned from all industries
2. Children above 14 and below
18 allowed to work only in
some industries - a positive list,
shift from a negative list.

Regulation of children has always
been a conflicting issue at it
age - 14 or 18.

However, considering India's economic
situation, widespread poverty, it is
~~see~~ economically sensible to
allow above 14 to work to
gain skills and experience - to
support their family.

7. Are emotions an inhibiting factor in effective decision-making? Discuss in the context of public services. 10

क्या भावनाएं प्रभावपूर्ण निर्णय लेने के मार्ग में बाधक तत्व हैं? लोक सेवाओं के संदर्भ में चर्चा कीजिए।

Emotions can be inhibiting or facilitating factors in decision making. It depends purely on how they are managed and used. Hence, emotional intelligence is crucial in public service.

That is, a civil servant must know how to manage and regulate emotions of himself and understand and respond to emotion of others to achieve best outcomes.

The possible benefits are:

1. Better understanding of concerns of public and

Their aspirations & ambitions

- lead to empathy & compassion
to work in their interests.

2. Better coordination and
bonding with political
leaders, seniors, peers
& juniors
3. Lead to a positive work
environment.
4. Would lead to better
motivation and handling
of crisis and conflict
situation
5. Better communication
with all concerned.

8. What do you understand by the Sarvodaya philosophy of Gandhiji? Why is Sarvodaya relevant for civil servants in India? 10

गांधीजी के सर्वोदय दर्शन ने आप क्या समझते हैं? भारत में लोक सेवकों के लिए सर्वोदय क्यों प्रासंगिक है?

~~Sarvodaya~~ Philosophy refers
to value of serving
everyone and not
leaving anyone behind
i.e. the person standing last
in line must also be
served.

Role of civil servants in
a developing economy like
India is to :

- (1) Protect & uphold
rights of most marginalised
- (2) Lead to their social
and economic
empowerment

To fulfill this duty, civil servants need to imbibe the value of lawodaya to serve the most marginalized sections such as Dalits, tribals, uphold women rights & those of disabled. This is accordance with the values of Constitution, & of our founding fathers.

SECTION – B

In the following questions, carefully study the cases presented and then answer the questions that follow (in around 250 words):

9. You are the leader of a 5 member team that has been assigned to carry out social impact assessment of a project proposed in a Naxal area. Members have been allotted a remote village each to conduct surveys and ascertain views of local people. You are under strict instructions not to disclose the identity of respondents outside the project. While compiling data, you are puzzled by the responses from one of the villages. You accompany the point-person for that village next day for verification. You randomly pick a person from the list of respondents and ask her for clarification of the response she had given earlier. She seems confused and denies any knowledge of the survey being conducted, let alone she being questioned. You try to verify this from other respondents and get similar replies. This raises serious doubts about the integrity and credibility of the survey process.

(a) What are the ethical issues involved in the situation?

(b) As a team leader accountable for credibility of the survey and working on a hard timeline, what are the possible options before you? List their merits and demerits.

(c) Giving reasons, state the course of action you would follow. 20

आप एक पांच सदस्यीय टीम के नेतृत्वकर्ता हैं, जिसे नक्सल क्षेत्र में प्रस्तावित एक परियोजना के सामाजिक प्रभाव आंकलन का कार्य सौंपा गया है। सर्वेक्षण करने और स्थानीय लोगों के दृष्टिकोण का पता लगाने के लिए प्रत्येक सदस्य को एक सूदूरवर्ती गांव आवंटित किया गया है। आपको सख्त निर्देश दिए गए हैं कि उत्तरदाताओं की पहचान को परियोजना से बाहर प्रकट नहीं किया जाए। आंकड़ों को संकलित करते समय, आप एक गांव से प्राप्त उत्तरों से उलझन में पड़ जाते हैं। आप उस गांव हेतु नियुक्त व्यक्ति (प्वॉइंट पर्सन) के साथ अगले दिन सत्यापन करने जाते हैं। आप उत्तरदाताओं की सूची में से यादृच्छिक रूप से एक व्यक्ति का चयन करते हैं और उससे कहते हैं कि वह पहले दिए गए अपने उत्तरों का स्पष्टीकरण करें। वह कुछ भ्रमित प्रतीत होती है और न केवल स्वयं से प्रश्न पूछे जाने, वरन् सर्वेक्षण किए जाने के संबंध में जानकारी होने तक की बात भी नकारती है। आप इस तथ्य को अन्य उत्तरदाताओं से सत्यापित करने का प्रयास करते हैं और एक समान उत्तर प्राप्त करते हैं। यह सर्वेक्षण प्रक्रिया की सत्यनिष्ठा और विश्वसनीयता पर गंभीर संदेह पैदा करता है।

(a) इस परिस्थिति से सम्बंधित नैतिक मुद्दे क्या हैं?

(b) आप इस टीम के नेतृत्वकर्ता के रूप में सर्वेक्षण की विश्वसनीयता हेतु और निश्चित समय-सीमा के अंतर्गत कार्य पूर्ण करने हेतु उत्तरदायी हैं। ऐसे में आपके सामने संभावित विकल्प क्या हैं? उन विकल्पों के लाभ और हानियों को सूचीबद्ध कीजिए।

(c) इस संबंध में आपके द्वारा की जाने वाली कार्यवाही का उल्लेख करें। इसके साथ ही कारण को भी स्पष्ट करें।

The stakeholders in this case are the leader of the team, the members of the team, ~~and~~ residents of rural area, proponents of project proposed.

Ethical issues involved

1. Upholding democratic values
 - public participation and eliciting opinions of affected people is a must in democracy
 - if no survey, / sham survey is done - it kills spirit of democracy.
2. Upholding the best interests of people in rural affected area

Through a sham survey, the project might get an undeserved approval - might not be in best interests of community.

3. Ensuring personal integrity, objectivity & accountability

- which could be done only by ensuring survey is actually truthfully and honestly done

4. Rule of law

- As rule & duty says that the survey must be conducted properly.

5. Viability of project

- If not checked / approval from villagers taken before - might lead to protests later
- delay the project.

6. Efficiency of team leader

- to finish the survey as per strict timeline given.

(b) Evaluating possible options

1. To go ahead with present survey & submit this data

Merit: (a) Ensures work done on time

Demerit (a) Does not ensure public participation

(b) Might be against interests of people

(c) Will show my lack of objectivity & dedication to public service.

2. To ask the team members to do the survey again randomly

Merit: (a) Might ensure credibility & integrity of survey data

Demerit: (a) As the point person - who took faulty data - but gets punished - sets a bad precedent - might do it again later.

(b) Take too much time

3. To ~~castigate~~ castigate the concerned
point - person, and allocating
the survey to another team
member of integrity

Merit : (a) Ensure objectivity of
data

(b) Repair trust in democracy
of people

(c) ~~could~~ be done on-line

~~more~~ (d) Set a good precedent
about those who don't
do their work well.

(C) In all above options,
3rd option seems to be
the most objective.

The point - person must be
called in to explain variation
in data. If he can't satisfactorily
explain variation, he must be
removed from the team.

This ensures objectivity, integrity on my part

10. Gajendra, once a struggling film actor, was accused and later exonerated of rape charges, which the jury found out to be motivated and fake. Not able to cope up with the situation, he changed profession and moved on. Thirty years later, while his closest friends know about the incident but his co-workers do not. One day, out of curiosity, he searches for his name on the internet, and to his surprise, finds that the third entry that comes up is an old report in a local newspaper about the rape charges he faced.

Gajendra is upset; after all these years, he would like to be able to disclose the event only to whomever he wants. He has heard about the decision of European Court of Justice which allows individuals to submit requests to a search engine to remove certain results from searches on their names, and citing the same, requests the search engine and media outlet to remove the results.

Valid arguments can be advanced for making the Right to be Forgotten a fundamental right? What those arguments could be? What limitations, if any, can it be subjected to? Should there be any obligations on the search engines regarding cases which are no longer relevant, as the one mentioned above?

20

गजेन्द्र एक संघर्षरत फिल्म अभिनेता था। पहले तो उसे अभियुक्त बनाया गया और फिर बाद में उसे बलात्कार के आरोपों से मुक्त कर दिया गया। इन आरोपों को न्यायिक पीठ ने दुर्भावना से अभिप्रेरित और झूठा पाया। इस स्थिति का सामना न कर पाने के कारण उसने अपने पेशे में परिवर्तन करते हुए आगे का जीवन निर्वाह किया। तीस वर्ष पश्चात्, उसके घनिष्ठ मित्रों को इस घटना के बारे में पता है किन्तु उसके सहकर्मी इस बात को नहीं जानते हैं। एक दिन उत्सुकतावश वह इंटरनेट पर अपने नाम की खोज करता है और आश्चर्यजनक रूप से यह पाता है दृष्टिगत तीसरी प्रविष्टि एक स्थानीय समाचारपत्र में उसके द्वारा सामना किए गए बलात्कार के आरोपों के बारे में एक पुरानी रिपोर्ट की है।

गजेन्द्र परेशान है; इतने वर्षों के बाद, वह इस घटना को केवल अपनी पसंद के लोगों के समक्ष प्रकट करना चाहेगा। उसने यूरोपीय न्यायालय के उस निर्णय के बारे में सुना है, जो व्यक्तियों को अपने नाम से की जाने वाली खोज संबंधी कुछ परिणामों को हटाए जाने हेतु सर्च इंजन को निवेदन प्रस्तुत करने की अनुमति प्रदान करता है और उसी का उद्धरण देते हुए, सर्च इंजन और मीडिया आउटलेट को परिणामों को हटाए जाने हेतु निवेदन करता है।

क्या "हटा दिए जाने के अधिकार" को मौलिक अधिकार बनाने हेतु वैध तर्क दिए जा सकते हैं? वे तर्क क्या हो सकते हैं? यदि उनकी कोई सीमाएं हैं तो वे सीमाएं क्या होंगी? ऊपर उल्लिखित प्रकरण की भांति अन्य अप्रसंगिक प्रकरणों के संबंध में क्या सर्च इंजनों का कोई दायित्व होना चाहिए?

Right to be forgotten refers to
the right which allows a
person to file a request for
removal of any information

which is false, malicious or the person does not want to disclose.

This Right could be supported on the basis of :

(a) Right to Privacy

(b) Truth - As the information might be false or malicious, it is only just that any such news/data is removed, once it has been proved to be false.

(c) Outdated - Any data, which is no longer relevant, could be expunged as well.

Limitations on Right to be Forgotten

(a) Any data which is truthful and objective, must not be expunged - as it is useful in future.

eg. criminal history of a person

who has been prosecuted / charged
for future prospective employers
is of utmost important.

(b) Limitation of Practicality

In such a vast internet, with
billions of web pages and
snippets of information, it is
practically impossible to implement
Right to be Forgotten.

(c) Search engines ^{should not} ~~be~~ ^{be}
mandated to remove data of
a person based on a request.

This is because :

1. Large discretion involved -
 - if it is irrelevant now
 - if it is truthful
 - or if it is written with
a malignant nature.

2. Practical limitation - to process requests and to execute them considering the volume & vastness - limitation of resource.

3. Upholding Right to Information

- people have a right to know about all view points & opinions - be smart enough to realise what is true & what is false.

In the mentioned case : ~~no~~ no

obligation should be there as

1. Report in newspaper - truthful

- objective as it talks only about charges pressed on him - does not say anything false - if he was guilty or not.

2. Irrelevant - after these many years, Gajendra should not be upset - is largely irrelevant - he must leave made a name for himself in integrity.

3. Unnecessary burden on search engine

4. Upholding the right of people to truthful information

- as it is only true that case was pressed against him.

The need here is to strengthen defamation law for filing of any incorrect piece of information

Hence, no obligations should be there on search engines.

11. You are the officer in charge of overseeing refugees' related issues in a multilateral humanitarian organisation. There is an ethnicity based civil war going on in a region and as a result, many people are being displaced. Hitherto, the economically better-off neighbouring countries have accommodated the streams of migrants with financial support from your organisation. The violence in the region has increased recently and the flux of people seeking refuge has grown substantially. With countries sealing their borders, the refugees are left in a vulnerable situation. You are sent to negotiate for humanitarian settlement of refugees with the neighbouring countries, who also happen to be a powerful economic bloc. However, they refuse any more accommodation on the following grounds:

- (a) Drainage of resources in face of subdued economic conditions.
 - (b) Domestic political repercussions.
 - (c) Rehabilitation will encourage more influx and indirectly fuel the persecutors.
 - (d) Permanency of settlement in face of better prospects than at home.
- What are the counter-arguments that can be cited to convince the countries for an immediate solution? Suggest some long term measures as well that should be followed to address the problem. 20

आप एक बहुपक्षीय मानवतावादी संगठन में शरणार्थियों से संबंधित मुद्दों के निरीक्षण हेतु प्रभारी अधिकारी हैं। एक क्षेत्र में नस्ल आधारित गृहयुद्ध छिड़ा हुआ है, परिणामस्वरूप अनेक लोग विस्थापित हो रहे हैं। अभी तक, आर्थिक रूप से बेहतर स्थिति वाले पड़ोसी देशों ने आपके संगठन से प्राप्त वित्तीय सहायता से प्रवास करने वाले लोगों के जत्थों को स्थान दिया है। हाल ही में क्षेत्र में हिंसा बढ़ गयी है और शरण चाहने वाले लोगों का प्रवाह अत्यधिक बढ़ गया है। देश अपनी सीमाओं को सील कर रहे हैं, जिससे शरणार्थी सुनियोजित स्थिति में हैं। आपको उन पड़ोसी देशों से शरणार्थियों हेतु मानवतावादी आधार पर रहने की व्यवस्था करने हेतु वार्ता के लिए भेजा गया है। वे पड़ोसी देश आर्थिक रूप से शक्तिशाली गुट हैं। हालांकि वे निम्नलिखित आधारों पर और अधिक शरणार्थियों को स्थान देने से मना कर सकते हैं:

- (a) गिरती हुई आर्थिक स्थिति करने के कारण संसाधनों की कमी।
- (b) घरेलू राजनैतिक प्रभाव।
- (c) पुनर्वास और अधिक अंतर्वाह को प्रोत्साहित करेगा और अप्रत्यक्ष रूप से उत्पीड़कों या अत्याचारियों को उत्तेजित करेगा।
- (d) अच्छी संभावनाओं के कारण अपने मूल देश की अपेक्षा यहीं पर स्थायी रूप से बस जाना। इन विकल्पों के विपक्ष में दिए जाने वाले तर्क कौन से हैं, जिनके माध्यम से राष्ट्रों को तत्काल समाधान के लिए राजी किया जा सकता है। कुछ दीर्घावधिक उपायों का सुझाव भी दीजिए जिनका समाधान के लिए पालन किया जाना चाहिए।

The stakeholders in this case are the officer, persecuted migrants & influx countries.

The values at conflict are
national interest, economic
prudence vs human rights
and compassion.

Counter Arguments

1. For Drainage of resources

The incoming migrants could in fact
boost the economy in short
& long term by :

- (a) Providing cheap labour, for
manual jobs initially
- (b) If skilled - could add value to
a country's economy.
- (c) Be a market for products
& enhance demand - and
thus lift shopping economy
- (d) Could correct demographic
imbalance - higher proportion
of younger people in migrants.

2. For Domestic Political repercussions

The act of providing relief and settlement - could be made into a national movement

- As based on values of human empathy, compassion and justice, it could be used positively in political affairs
- to show humane values of their culture.

3. Rehabilitation would encourage more influx

- no one willingly leaves his/her home place - unless forced to
- Process to ensure that only the most needy / persecuted communities are granted refugee status.

- (d) Permanency of settlements in
face of better prospects than at home
- Refugees could be allowed to stay
legally - for temporary period
 - till civil war stays
 - More skilled - might be permitted
by the destination country -
to boost value addition to economy.

Long Term Measures

1. Sharing of responsibility among
countries - migrants could
be redistributed among countries
based on their economy,
area & capacity to absorb -
in an objective way
2. Making the countries aware
and putting pressure from

international forums - such as UN, about the potential advantages of giving refugee status - and the dire humanitarian need for it.

3. Global partnership to bring the civil war in the source country to an end - to end refugee crisis.

4. Global mechanisms in place to prevent such a civil war in future which has such immense humanitarian costs.

12. You are a Divisional Forest Officer (DFO) in an urban district. The forest cover in the district is as low as 11% and it needs to be increased as per government guidelines. By ecological and environmental perspective also it is imperative that more trees should be planted.

However, you find out that while there is a grant of Rs. 1.5 crore for your division to plant trees under the Hariyali Scheme, most of this fund is lying unused. Since, it is December and as per government rules all the unused grant should be returned to the government as the financial year closes, it seems you will have to return the money completely.

Also, there are strong indications from the ministry that government is mulling over a budgetary cut on Hariyali mission because most of the funds go unused. There is a strong possibility that if you return the money in this financial year you won't get it in the next financial year and even if you get, it will be a very insignificant amount.

Indicate various options that you think are available in this situation. Evaluate these options and choose the most appropriate path to be adopted?

20

आप एक शहरी जिले में मंडल वन अधिकारी (डी.एफ.ओ.) हैं। जिले में वनाच्छादन 11 प्रतिशत कम है और इसे सरकारी दिशा-निर्देशों के अनुसार बढ़ाया जाना है। पारिस्थितिकीय एवं पर्यावरणीय दृष्टिकोण से भी अधिक संख्या में वृक्षारोपण किया जाना अनिवार्य है।

यद्यपि आप यह पाते हैं कि आपके मंडल (डिवीजन) में हरियाली योजना के अधीन वृक्षारोपण हेतु 1.5 करोड़ रुपये का अनुदान है, लेकिन इस फंड का अधिकांश भाग अप्रयुक्त है। चूंकि यह दिसंबर का महीना है और सरकारी नियमों के अनुसार, समस्त अप्रयुक्त अनुदान सरकार को लौटा दिया जाना चाहिए क्योंकि वित्तीय वर्ष समाप्त हो जाता है। ऐसा प्रतीत होता है कि आपको पूरी राशि लौटाने होगी।

साथ ही, मंत्रालय से इस बात के निश्चित संकेत हैं कि सरकार हरियाली योजना के अंतर्गत बजट कम करने पर विचार कर रही है क्योंकि फंड का अधिकांश भाग अप्रयुक्त रह जाता है। इस बात के निश्चित संकेत हैं कि यदि आप वित्तीय वर्ष में राशि लौटाते हैं तो अगले वित्तीय वर्ष में यह आपको नहीं मिलेगा और यदि मिल भी जाता है तो वह राशि बहुत कम होगी।

स्वयं के अनुसार इस स्थिति में उपलब्ध विभिन्न विकल्पों के संबंध में बताएं। इन विकल्पों का मूल्यांकन करें और अपनाए जा सकने वाले सर्वाधिक उपयुक्त मार्ग का चयन करें।

The stakeholders in this case are
DFO, government, environment
& people in general of the
urban city.

The values involved are
rule of law, efficiency, dedication
to public service, environmental

ethics & concern for people's
well being.

Various options available

1. To not do anything - let the grant lapse - wait for next year.
2. Request the government for an extension of the grant or for the same amount next year.
3. To take immediate action on planting - use all the fund

Evaluating options

1. Merit : (a) None

Demerit : (a) Would see dereliction of duty & evasion of responsibility

(b) Would adversely affect environment & hence public health.

2. Merit

- (a) Extension of same funds might
be given next year
- (b) more time to implement
scheme

Demerit

- (a) Request might not be granted
- very high chances
- (b) Would not solve the problem
of environment & planting

3. Merit

- (a) Would promote environmental
conservation
- (b) Would see as per rule of
law - as increase is mandated
by guideline of forest cover
- (c) Would reflect my dedication
to duty & environmental
concern

Demerit : might have to do
in huge hurry - lead to

non optimal allocation of
resources - even misappropriation
at the hand of agencies - in
a hurry to spend all

The most appropriate have
to be followed :

To recruit as many NGOs,
schools, colleges as possible
- collaborate with municipal
agencies

- explain urgency of situation

Through a blood based effort,
plant as many trees as possible

- However, ~~not~~ recourse to
illegal means or extra-legal
means should be used

Proper monitoring should be
done that the money
sanctioned is being used

- for the purpose it was sanctioned
- due diligence must be there.
- Even if fund not completely used, prepare a dossier - note down all facts and circumstances - as to why funds were not completely utilized - tell the ^{line} need for funds - to ensure that you get as much money sanctioned in next year to bring forest cover to required level.
 - This would reflect dedication to duty, commitment & respect for environment.

13. You, an anthropologist, have developed cordial relations with a tribal community which was hitherto isolated from rest of the humanity. Notwithstanding increased interest of researchers and media for the newly discovered tribe, you are the only person from outside whom they trust. They are ardent believers in their goddess and, trusting you, take you to her abode on a holy mountain. To your surprise, you find that the mountain is a reservoir of Uranium that can be used in your power-starved country's nuclear power plants. Besides, you are aware that Uranium being radioactive, it is highly risky to go near the mountain. You try to convince the people about harmful effects it can have and the utilitarian value that it possess for the country. However, they are in no mood to argue and politely ask you to leave. You fear that very soon the outside world will find about this and the vulnerable tribe would be displaced from their land.

(a) Evaluate the following courses of action which you can take for their ethical merits and demerits:

- You would continue to convince the people yourself about the possible consequences and urge them to relocate.
- You would call in local and national NGOs for protecting the rights of the people against the State and file a PIL in Supreme Court if the State proceeds with dispossession.
- You would yourself tell the government and the scientific community about the reserves and let them proceed in their own way.

(b) Without restricting yourself to the above options, state the course of action that you would take and why? 20

आप एक नृविज्ञानी हैं और आपने वैसे जनजातीय समुदाय के साथ मधुर संबंध बनाए हैं जो अब तक शेष मानवजाति से पृथक् था। नई खोजी गई जनजाति में मीडिया और शोधकर्ताओं की बढ़ती रुचि के पश्चात् भी आप अकेले ऐसे बाहरी व्यक्ति हैं जिन पर वे विश्वास करते हैं। वे अपनी देवी के अनन्य उपासक हैं और आप पर विश्वास करते हुए एक दिन वे आपको एक पवित्र पहाड़ पर स्थित उसके वास स्थल पर ले जाते हैं। आप इस बात से आश्चर्यचकित हो जाते हैं कि वह पहाड़ यूरेनियम का भंडार है जिसका उपयोग ऊर्जा की कमी से जूझते आपके देश के नाभकीय ऊर्जा संयंत्रों में किया जा सकता है। साथ ही, आप इस बात से भी अवगत हैं कि यूरेनियम के रोडियोधर्मी होने के कारण पहाड़ के निकट जाना अत्यधिक संकटपूर्ण है। आप लोगों को इसके क्षतिकारक प्रभावों और राष्ट्र के लिए इसकी उपयोगिता के मूल्य के संबंध में समझाने का प्रयास करते हैं। चूंकि वे अभी किसी तर्क-वितर्क की मुद्रा में नहीं हैं और आपसे सविनय चले जाने को कहते हैं। आपको इस बात का भय है कि शीघ्र ही बाह्य जगत इस संबंध में जान जाएगा और सुभेद्य जनजातीय लोग अपनी भूमि से विस्थापित हो जाएंगे।

(a) नैतिक औचित्य और अनौचित्य के आधार पर आपके द्वारा उठाए जाने वाले कदम का मूल्यांकन करें:

- आप लोगों को संभावित परिणामों के संबंध में समझाना जारी रखेंगे और उन्हें पुनर्स्थापित होने को प्रेरित करेंगे।
- आप राज्य के विरुद्ध निवासियों के अधिकारों की रक्षा के लिए स्थानीय एवं राष्ट्रीय गैर-सरकारी संगठनों को आमंत्रित करेंगे और यदि राज्य निर्वासन की दिशा में बढ़ता है तो आप सर्वोच्च न्यायालय में एक जनहित याचिका प्रस्तुत करेंगे।
- आप स्वयं सरकार एवं विज्ञान जगत को भंडार के संबंध में बताएंगे तत्पश्चात् उन्हें उनकी इच्छा अनुसार कार्यवाही के लिए स्वतंत्र छोड़ देंगे।

(b) अपने आपको उपर्युक्त विकल्पों तक सीमित न करते हुए, उन उपायों को बताएं जिन्हें आप अमल में लाना चाहेंगे। ऐसा करने का कारण भी बताएं।

The stakeholders in this case are
the anthropologists, tribal
community, country and its people.

The values at stake are
the tribal's community's
right to their native land
→ national interests, right
to safety, and honesty & compassion.

Evaluating the courses of action

1. Merits

- (a) If relocate, health benefits
to tribals
- (b) If voluntarily - would not
be suddenly forced by state
- (c) Uranium - could be used
for national interests

Demerits (a) would deprive them
of their land, nature.

(b) Might not be accepted assume
they relocate - the place might
not be suitable for them where
they relocate.

2. Merits

(d) would not have to relocate
- can stay at native land.

(b) Their rights would be protected
Demerits

(a) Economic loss to country
- uranium reserves could
not be used

(b) Health hazards - for tribals

3. Merits

(a) Economic benefit to nation

- use of ~~economic~~ uranium

(b) Health benefits
Demerit

(a) violation of rights of tribal

(b) Reflect ^{my} lack of compassion and
empathy for tribals

(c) Injustice to tribals.

(b) Course of Action to be taken

Due to :

- (a) Possible health concerns for tribals.
- (b) Immense economic benefit arising out of use of uranium

It is imperative, that tribals are relocated.

This could be done by :

- (a) May convincing - difficult
- as would not agree
- (b) Call in local NGOs and national NGOs

- to convince them about their own benefit in leaving the place & relocating

However, this should be done only after ascertaining the facts

Confirming Facts : Informing State

is my duty - force them to

conduct a scientific enquiry

- prepare a report - about

(a) available uranium reserves
which could be exploited

(b) health hazard it poses.

If reserves are rich & if health
hazard is significant - then
only relocation necessary.

• Relocation must be done along
with rehabilitation

- at a place of tribal's
choosing

- ensuring their land rights
over new area

This would ensure national
interests as well as right of
tribals to culture, land
& health

14. A junior member of staff has just returned to work after taking special leave to care for her elderly mother. For financial reasons she needs to work full-time. She has been having difficulties with her mother's home care arrangements, causing her to miss a number of team meetings (which usually take place at the beginning of each day) and to leave work early. She is very competent in her work but her absences are putting pressure on her and her overworked colleagues. You are her manager, and you are aware that the flow of work through the practice is coming under pressure. One of her male colleagues is beginning to make comments such as "a woman's place is in the home", and is undermining her at every opportunity, putting her under even greater stress.

What possible steps can you take to ensure that the work of the team does not suffer while also taking other humanitarian considerations into account.

20

अपनी वुजुर्ग मां की देखभाल के लिए विशेष छुट्टी पर रहने के पश्चात् एक कनिष्ठ कर्मी कार्य पर लौटी है। वित्तीय कारणों से उसे पूरे समय कार्य करने की आवश्यकता है। उसे अपनी मां के लिए घर पर देखभाल की व्यवस्था करने में कठिनाई आ रही है जिस कारण वह कई टीम बैठकों (जो प्रायः प्रति दिन, दिन के आरंभ में होते हैं) में उपस्थित नहीं हो पा रही है और वह कार्यालय से घर भी जल्दी चली जाती है। वह अपने कार्य में बहुत ही सक्षम है, लेकिन उसकी अनुपस्थिति उसके ऊपर और काम के बोझ तले दबे उसके सहकर्मीयों के ऊपर दबाव का कार्य कर रही है। आप एक प्रबंधक हैं और आप इस बात से अवगत हैं कि इस चलन से कार्य प्रवाह पर दबाव पड़ रहा है। उसके एक पुरुष सहकर्मी ने "एक महिला का स्थान घर में होता है" जैसे ताने भी मारने आरंभ कर दिये हैं और वह उसे प्राप्त हो सकने वाले प्रत्येक अवसर के संबंध में कमजोर बना रहा है जिससे वह और भी गहन तनाव का अनुभव कर रही है। सभी मानवीय पहलुओं का ध्यान रखते हुए, इन परिस्थितियों में टीम का कार्य प्रभावित न हो, यह सुनिश्चित करने के लिए आप कौन से कदम उठावेंगे?

The stakeholders concerned are the manager, junior staff member, ^{male} colleague, and company's performance in general.

The values at stake are compassion & empathy vs professional duties & performance for the company.

Facts of the case

1. Lady staff member - distressed
due to mother's poor health
- can't work with full time
dedication
2. Affecting flow of work -
overwork on colleagues.
3. Male colleague - sexist remark

Possible steps to be Taken

1. Strong reprimand to male
colleague - his sexist
comments are not justified
in any circumstances whatsoever
- stern warning
To show my seriousness,
ensure working of Sexual
Harassment Committee at
workplace - widely publicize
it - putting notice on
noticeboard

2. Talking to general member
of staff - as she is in
a genuine problem - my duty
to help her in all way possible
- as she is ~~so~~ very competent
in her work in general
- would see the compassionate
act to do.

Possible support are:

- (a) To talk to her, reaffirm
my support & assure her
colleague's support
- (b) To see if she could
work from home - if
any such possibility is there
- (c) To use emergency/contingency
fund of company to
financially support her
if needed - or I along

with her colleagues could
pool in with financial help.

3. Talking to her colleagues

Apprising her colleagues of her
present difficult situation

- of need to support her
- of working slightly more
in terms of difficult
- motivating them

4. Hire contractual employee

in the meanwhile -

to ensure that colleagues
are not too overworked

- flow of work is not
disturbed.
- company's performance is
not affected.

These actions would also
lead to increase in loyalty
of the junior staff member
when she overcomes her
family difficulties.

It would also set a good
precedent that company looks
after its employees in distress
and create greater employee
loyalty in general &
create a positive work
environment.