



# VISION IAS

www.visionias.in

## GENERAL STUDIES (TEST CODE : 873)

Name of Candidate

ABHIJEET SINHA

Medium Eng./Hindi

English

Center

Distant Learning  
→ Ranchi

Registration Number

22839

Date

29/9/12

### INDEX TABLE

Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained
1(a)	10	
1(b)	10	
2(a)	10	
2(b)	10	
3(a)	10	
3(b)	10	
4(a)	10	
4(b)	10	
5	10	
6	10	
7	10	
8	10	
9	20	
10	20	
11	20	
12	20	
13	25	
14	25	

Total Marks Obtained:

Remarks:

### INSTRUCTIONS

1. Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, Registration Number and Test Code).  
उत्तर पुस्तिका में सूचनाएं भरना आवश्यक है (नाम, प्रश्न-पत्र कोड, विद्यार्थी क्रमांक आदि)।
2. There are FOURTEEN questions printed in ENGLISH & HINDI  
इसमें चौदह प्रश्न हैं अंग्रेजी और हिन्दी में छपे हैं।
3. All questions are compulsory.  
सभी प्रश्न अनिवार्य हैं।
4. The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.  
प्रत्येक प्रश्न/भाग के अंक उसके सामने दिए गए हैं।
5. Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one.  
प्रश्नों के उत्तर उसी माध्यम में लिखे जाने चाहिए जिसका उल्लेख आपके प्रवेश पत्र में किया गया है और उस माध्यम का स्पष्ट उल्लेख प्रश्न-सह-उत्तर (क्यूसीए) पुस्तिका के मुख्य पृष्ठ पर अंकित निर्दिष्ट स्थान पर किया जाना चाहिए। उल्लिखित माध्यम के अतिरिक्त अन्य किसी माध्यम में लिए गए उत्तर पर कोई अंक नहीं मिलेंगे।
6. Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to.  
प्रश्नों में शब्द सीमा, जहाँ विनिर्दिष्ट है, का अनुसरण किया जाना चाहिए।
7. Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.  
उत्तर पुस्तिका में खाली छोड़ा हुआ पृष्ठ या उसके अंश को स्पष्ट रूप से काटा जाना चाहिए।

75, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi – 110060

103, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi – 110009

# EVALUATION INDICATORS

1. Alignment Competence
2. Context Competence
3. Content Competence
4. Language Competence
5. Introduction Competence
6. Structure - Presentation Competence
7. Conclusion Competence

Overall Macro Comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.
- 5.
- 6.

Answer the following questions in not more than 150 words each:

1. (a) The more remotely power is exercised from the people, the greater is the distance between authority and accountability. Discuss. 10

(a) जितना लोगों से मत्ता का प्रयोग दूर होगा, उतना ही अधिक प्राधिकारी और जवाबदेही के बीच अंतर होगा। चर्चा कीजिए।

The quote highlights the importance of devolution of power & enhancing subsidiary status of govt by delegating authority to local.

If power is centralised, distance between govt & local is not increased.

People have a limited say & they remain politically unempowered.

It also creates an attitude of subservience among the people & a 'mai-baap' attitude among those in power. Ultimately, sanctity of

govt may decline & people  
may exit from the state

It also reduces  
accountability as inadequate  
checks are present on the  
power of government.

Abuse of authority may  
magnify and corruption &  
Nepotism justifies.

Ultimately, the say of  
Citizens, the ultimate  
sovereign of a democracy  
becomes negligible & pressure  
on govt to perform decreases  
reducing accountability, as  
no revoking of authority  
takes.

Hence Decentralisation, &  
Political Empowerment by of

local government becomes  
crucial. Also, there is a  
need to involve people via  
Social Audits, RTI, etc.

1. (b) "If you want others to be happy, practice compassion. If you want to be happy, practice compassion". In what ways can a compassionate public official be more useful for realizing public service goals? 10

(b) "यदि आप दूसरों को प्रसन्न रखना चाहते हैं, तो करुणावान बनें। यदि आप प्रसन्न रहना चाहते हैं तो करुणा अपनाएं।" किस प्रकार से एक करुणावान लोक सेवक सार्वजनिक सेवा के लक्ष्यों को साकार करने के लिए अधिक उपयोगी हो सकता है?

Compassion is a pro-active approach to alleviate the concerns of others.

It helps in reducing rift between society and enhances cooperation, increasing satisfaction of both donor as well as receiver of compassion.

Compassion in public officials is a foundational value ~~for~~ because of :-

1. It helps to keep service before self and increases professionalisation & efficiency
2. It sheds the colonial attitude

of civil servants of ~~being~~ superlative & instead help to create Citizen Centricity

3. Compassion from public services enhances Dignity of the Vulnerable by empowering them economically & socially.

4. It acts as a preventive check against Corruption & abuse of power.

5. Pro-active approach helps in better Grievance Redressal

6. Compassion also helps in Congenial Work Environment & enhances Team Work ultimately helping people.

Thus, compassionate officials like P. Nair, Collector of Kozhikode Coimbatore, has received wide

applaud & has bridged gap between Govt & public.

we should recall Mark Twain's saying  
"Kindness is a language even blind can read & deaf can hear"

2. (a) The recent decision by the government to ban use of red beacons is only a symbolic gesture and a lot more needs to be done to end the VIP culture in India. Critically discuss. 10

(a) लाल बत्ती के प्रयोग पर प्रतिबन्ध सम्बन्धी सरकार का हालिया निर्णय केवल एक प्रतीकात्मक संकेत है और भारत में वीआईपी संस्कृति समाप्त करने के लिए बहुत कुछ किए जाने की आवश्यकता है। आलोचनात्मक रूप से चर्चा कीजिए।

'Red-light' was a colonial relic that epitomised asymmetry of power between govt & people. It was a tool for self gratification that became a weapon to satisfy personal ego. It also caused inconvenience to public and traffic woes. In this light, amending Motor Vehicles Act to ban red beacon is a positive step.

However, VIP culture in India manifests in various other ways such as inadequate Accountability of

government <sup>servants</sup> abuse of authorities and public services such as Police men by those in power & wielding disproportionate say on day to day activities. Ultimately, the VIP culture is present in the very attitude of government servants, who forgo citizen centricity & servitude in lieu of self gratification.

Hence, VIP culture needs various other steps like,

1. Legal → repealing Article 311  
→ Raising Right to Service Bill
2. Empowering people by delegation of power & raising Transparency.
3. Checking abuse of govt machinery by pro-active vigilant systems
4. Controlling discretionary powers as

Call us : 011-268022022

2nd ARC recommendation

Visit us : [www.visionias.in](http://www.visionias.in)

Page 6 of 56

Such holistic steps would be true equities.

2. (b) To what extent can financial incentives help shape attitude towards social issues? Discuss with relevant examples. 10\*

(b) किस हद तक आर्थिक प्रोत्साहन सामाजिक मुद्दों के प्रति अभिवृत्ति को आकार देने में सहायता कर सकते हैं? प्रासंगिक उदाहरणों सहित चर्चा कीजिए।

Financial incentives are a way to nudge people towards a particular cause. Similarly, this can be used to tackle many of the social issues facing today.

For e.g. financial incentives to people who reveal social crimes like Domestic Violence can help to reduce the malady. Similarly, incentives to reveal Benami properties can curb corruption to some extent.

Likewise, financial awards to people who act with Compassion towards vulnerable like Old people, Rehabilitated Manual scavengers may help to reduce their vulnerability of these people by mobilising an army of people.

Incentives for people bridging social gap between communities would ~~also~~ reduce polarisation & can help us to find role models.

The success of financial incentives has already been seen in the way it has reduced female foeticide under Beti Bachao, Beti Padhao, & has increased institutional delivery under Jarani.

Call us : 8468022022

Visit us : [www.visionias.in](http://www.visionias.in)

Kurakhe Yojana Page 8 of 56

Then, it should be used as a nudge. However, the a limit should be set to ensure no exploitation takes place.

3. (a) At times, moral behaviour can be constrained by the complexity of legal system. Explain. In this context, explain the purpose of legal protection for good samaritans in the case of road accidents.

10

(a) कई बार, नैतिक व्यवहार कानूनी प्रणाली की जटिलता के चलते निरुद्ध हो सकता है। व्याख्या कीजिये। इस संदर्भ में, सड़क दुर्घटनाओं के मामलों में संकट के समय सहायता देने वाले अच्छे व्यक्तियों (good samaritans) के लिए कानूनी संरक्षण के उद्देश्य को समझाएं।

Morality is a part and parcel of every person. The intensity may differ though. However, if a person fears about legal retribution or judicial and administrative challenges to him/her, he/she may not step forward to take up a cause.

This is seen in the way citizens shy away from helping an accident victim or to people who have suffered from cases like Domestic Violence; the reason being that they could themselves be

questioned which could impede their personal lives & may lead to framing charges against them as well.

Thus, legal protection for Samaritans is needed to :-

1. Incentivise them to help the accident victims.
2. Prevent the Samaritans from getting victimised & protects Privacy
3. It provides an assurance of no retribution & removes any anxiety increasing efficiency of help.

As Radhakrishnan Committee observed, 50% of road accident related deaths would have been saved had people & Samaritans come forward.

Call us : 8468022022

Visit us : [www.visionias.in](http://www.visionias.in)

Page 10 of 56

It is pertinent to recite Napoleon's <sup>statement</sup>  
"The world suffers more humans  
of the silence of good rather  
than the violence of bad"

3. (b) Examine the different ethical issues involved in the use of public shaming as a punitive measure. Do you think this is an appropriate measure to address the problem of rising crime rates.

10

(b) दंडात्मक उपाय के रूप में सार्वजनिक रूप में लज्जित करने (public shaming) जैसे उपायों से बड़े विभिन्न नैतिक मुद्दों का परीक्षण कीजिए। क्या आप मानते हैं कि बढ़ते अपराध दर की समस्या हल करने के लिए यह उपयुक्त उपाय है।

Public Shaming as a deterrent to crime has surged lately, as seen in shaming of sex offenders, offenders of corruption, etc, and has risen because of a pro-active Media

Issues involved

1. Shaming ~~reduces~~ disincentivises crimes to occur & thus upholds Rule of law.
2. Shaming helps community to identify potential perpetrators & enhances their own Preventive checks.
3. However, it violates Right to Privacy (Article 14) of individual.

4. It may sully even an innocent individual,
5. It punishes a person disproportionately more than requirement.
6. Family members of perpetrator get victimised too.

Hence, it creates a situation of dilemma and can't alone check against rising crime.  
Public Shaming should thus be used only in heinous crime cases so as to act as a preventive check.  
Shaming should ensure that family members are not victimised.  
 And use in more everyday cases like Shaming of Open Defecation be minimised.

Media should have screening best mechanism to ensure

Innocents are not a hamper.

This ~~is~~ due balance would reduce crime while maintaining Dignity.

4. (a) Why did Gunnar Myrdal use the term 'soft state' in the context of South Asia? Do you think such a characterisation is still relevant in the case of India today?

(a) गुनार मिर्डल ने दक्षिण एशिया के संदर्भ में 'मृदु राज्य' का प्रयोग क्यों किया है? क्या आप मानते हैं कि इस प्रकार का विशेषीकरण आज के भारत के संदर्भ में भी प्रासंगिक है?

Myrdal's 'soft state' assessment may indicate the following :-

- i) Inadequate use of force and hard bargaining by the state, like use of Military <sup>especially against developed countries</sup>
- ii) Softness in terms of ~~the~~ limited pro-activity of state which can ~~not~~ lead to magnification of crime by the people
- iii) Acceptance of social evils in society

Overall, he denotes the limited authority and credibility of government in power both to the local & foreign countries

India still uses Soft Diplomacy in International relations, instead of relying on military. We use Culture, Economic grants, Diplomacy & ethics in our relations. However, gradually, we have learnt to bargain hard on issues like Climate, Trade so that interests of poor and vulnerable are not compromised.

As far as pro-activity of state is concerned, it still suffers from issues like Inadequate infrastructure, manpower, high & etc among others in growth.

However, there is a growing capacity of state as measured by our improving new economic indicators.

They softness is declining.

4. (b) Intolerance can be linked both to prejudices and value judgments. Elaborate with relevant examples. Also discuss how intolerance can be countered in a multicultural society like India. 10

- (b) असहिष्णुता को पूर्वाग्रह और मूल्यानुमाना (value judgments) दोनों से जोड़ा जा सकता है। प्रासंगिक उदाहरणों के साथ सविस्तर वर्णन कीजिए। साथ ही बर्बा कीजिए कि भारत जैसे बहुसांस्कृतिक समाज में असहिष्णुता का प्रतिकार कैसे किया जा सकता है।

Intolerance means a refusal to hear and accept someone else's viewpoints and behaviours.

Intolerance stems from prejudice because it creates a biased viewpoint in us, and counters any tendency to see the world in a different way.

e.g. a Hindu may see a Muslim as violent inherently. Hence, he/she may object to inclusion of a Muslim leader in government.

Similarly, we make instantaneous judgements about others because of a

(Value Judgment)  
Regressive attitude. Hence, Pakistan is ~~not~~ intolerant to ~~had~~ any proposal of India on ~~Kashmir~~ <sup>terrorism</sup> because of its inherent regressive attitude against us.

To reduce intolerance:-

1. Govt should urge community leaders to bridge divide
2. Ideals of our great leaders like Sulh-i-Kul of Akbar & Sarva Dharma Sambandh & Upanishads be spread
3. Punitive measures against politicians indulging in parochial interests of vote bank politics, in consonance with RPA Act, 1951
4. Greater community level activities like Happiness Day of Mal.

Call us : 8468022022

Visit us : [www.visionias.in](http://www.visionias.in)

5. Common interests like Patriotism be promoted.

All this would create a more vibrant society.

5. Social attitude towards corruption has become more forgiving with time leading to a view of illegal gains and misappropriation of public assets as a "rightful" individual prerogative. Analyse in the context of India. 10

समय के साथ भ्रष्टाचार के प्रति सामाजिक दृष्टिकोण अधिक क्षम्य बन गया है जिसमें "उचित", व्यक्तिगत विशिष्टाधिकार के रूप में गैर-कानूनी लाभों और सार्वजनिक परिसंपत्तियों के दुर्विनियोग का मार्ग प्रशस्त हुआ है। भारत के संदर्भ में विश्लेषण कीजिए।

Social attitude is the way society evaluates any institution or idea. In this respect, the attitude towards corruption has seen a rise in Accepting the trend as seen by 'Chalta Hai' attitude.

It is believed that public officers have inadequate salary & this acts as a tool to compensate them.

More importantly, the acceptability has risen because people tend to 'gain' from

it is bribing a traffic policeman prevents ~~it~~ that checks against a criminal liability and people willingly pay in form of collusive corruption.

Finally, it is believed that corruption is all powerful in society and fighting against it has limited utility & the litigant can himself/herself be victimised.

Nonetheless, there is a growing cell against corruption as seen by 50 lakh annual filing of RTI, & support of common people in lokpal agitation.

Hence, we need to

Call us : 8468022022

Visit us : [www.visionias.in](http://www.visionias.in)

Page 18 of 56

make more such role models to help change the social attitudes. De-criminalising corruption to Bribe giving can be a way to start.

This document is unclassified. All rights reserved. © Vision IAS (P) Ltd. All rights reserved. (www.visionias.in)

6. What are the factors which draw people to public service? Suggest measures to keep public servants motivated. 10

लोगों को लोक सेवा की ओर आकर्षित करने वाले कारक क्या हैं? लोक सेवकों को प्रेरित रखने के उपाय सुझाएँ।

Public service is any act that ~~is~~ promotes the interest of society. In this broad interpretation, people are drawn due to :-

1. Self fulfillment that acts of kindness & companions provide. It satisfies conscience of individual. e.g. Mother Teresa, Baba Amte
2. For some, ~~the~~ public service helps in spiritual fulfillment. e.g. in Gurdwara.
3. For others, it's a way to enhance credibility (e.g. some NGOs).

However, if we define public service as Govt service then usually ~~the~~ people ~~do~~ join

because of desire for service,  
employment opportunities (stability),  
respect and dignity & challenge,  
diversity of jobs

To keep them motivated :-

1. Payband linked promotion should be upheld in a Hierarchy like system
2. Incentives like more awards for Honest Officers, praising dedicated officers, linking non-monetary benefits like foreign travels
3. Challenging tasks be provided to reduce Monotony
4. Some stability in transfers in common with 2nd ARC recommendation
5. Involving all officers in policy making
6. Reducing Indiscipline in

Call us : 8468022022

Visit us : [www.visionias.in](http://www.visionias.in)

departments by other which

All these steps would help to form a conducive work environment & ultimately help people.

7. Corporate Governance provides a framework that defines the rights, roles and responsibilities of various groups within an organization. (a) Elaborate the need to incorporate the principles of Corporate Governance to enhance the effectiveness of the public sector enterprises. (b) Identify the challenges specific to the public sector when it comes to the application of good practices of corporate governance. 10

कॉर्पोरेट गवर्नेंस वह ढांचा प्रदान करता है जो संगठन के भीतर विभिन्न समूहों की भूमिकाएं, अधिकार और उत्तरदायित्व परिभाषित करता है। (a) सार्वजनिक क्षेत्र के उद्यमों की प्रभावशीलता बढ़ाने के लिए कॉर्पोरेट गवर्नेंस के सिद्धांतों को समाविष्ट करने की आवश्यकता का सविस्तार वर्णन कीजिए। (b) जब कॉर्पोरेट गवर्नेंस की अच्छी प्रथाओं के अनुप्रयोग की बात आती है तो सार्वजनिक क्षेत्र के लिए विशिष्ट चुनौतियों की पहचान कीजिए।

### PSEs Corporate Governance

norms like those enshrined in Companies Act, 2013 are needed for PSEs because :-

1. It helps to maintain Professionalism in conduct
2. It upholds transparency in financial propriety & reduces abuse of power.
3. It would minimise intrusion & interference by govt, the largest stakeholder & minority interests would be conserved.
4. It ~~best~~ protects interest of

Employees, Environment & Unions

Challenges in application

1. In public services, oath of Secrecy & Official Secrets Act, 1923 reduces checks against transparency.
  2. ~~Trade Unions~~ Employee unions are more powerful & may limit a change.
  3. Inadequate ~~no~~ accountability measures, due to Article 371
  4. File-culture & a Weberian system has created multiple veto points and delays in incorporating any new practices.
- Some ~~pro~~ restructuring may be needed here, as overall

Call us : 8468022022

Page 22 of 56

Visit us : [www.visionias.in](http://www.visionias.in)

before incorporating such norms.

8. Emotions, earlier considered as an irrational factor in decision-making, are now recognised as a critical factor of judgement. In this regard, answer the following questions: (a) How can Emotional Intelligence help in coping with the intense pressure and occupational stress faced by police officers and armed forces in discharge of their duties? (b) What are the some of the concerns in incorporating and assessment of emotional intelligence skills in public service?

10

भावनाओं को, जिन्हें निर्णय लेने में पहले एक अराजक कारक माना जाता था, अब निर्णय का महत्वपूर्ण कारक माना जाता है। उस संदर्भ में, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों का उत्तर दीजिए:

- (a) अपने कर्तव्यों का निर्वहन में पुलिस कर्मियों और सशस्त्र बलों द्वारा सामना किए जाने वाले तीव्र दबाव और कार्य सम्बन्धी तनाव (occupational stress) का मुकाबला करने में भावात्मक प्रज्ञा (Emotional Intelligence) किस प्रकार सहायता कर सकती है?
- (b) लोक सेवा में भावात्मक प्रज्ञा को समाविष्ट करने और आंकलन सम्बन्धी कुछ चिन्ताएँ क्या हैं?

Emotional Intelligence (EI) refers to intelligence about emotion, i.e. perceiving emotion of ourselves and others, channelising & managing it effectively.

- a) EI helps to reduce pressure because it ~~manages~~ keeps one motivated with an optimistic attitude. It helps to calm oneself and reduce anger. It's a tool to self-control oneself and

to check against abuse of power. And it helps to keep other motivated & a better team work can be ensured.

Thus, a police officer with EI is unlikely to indulge in Human Rights Violation &

would be willing to serve at all times with Motivation

& a better Team Spirit & Empathy for citizens while having Leadership skills.

b)

i) Public officials may resist any change

ii) EI training is rigorous & may divert the resources & time in training

iii) EI is subjective and intangible and assessing it is difficult.

iv) EI has a cultural context and is relativistic. Hence, what

Call us : 8468022022

Visit us : [www.visionias.in](http://www.visionias.in)

Page 24 of 56

in right standard of EI may vary & thus assessment differ

v) Also EI can be misused to hide one's true personality.

9. You, a manager in one of the top IT firms in the country, are tasked with hiring new recruits for an upcoming project. You find that the company has given tacit instructions of not hiring female candidates in view of the new maternity law passed by the Government. You find this highly objectionable and lodge a protest with people in the higher management but they are firm as they want to cut down all the unnecessary costs. Based on this information, answer the following questions:

- Identify the stakeholders and their interests in the situation.
- What are the dilemmas that a recruiting manager may face in such a scenario?
- What are the different options available to you? Which one will you pursue and why?

20

आप देश की एक शीर्ष आईटी कंपनी के प्रबंधक हैं। आपको आगामी परियोजना के लिए नई भर्तियां करने का उत्तरदायित्व सौंपा गया है। आप पाते हैं कि सरकार द्वारा पारित किए गए नवीन मातृत्व कानून के आलोक में कंपनी ने महिला अभ्यर्थियों की भर्ती न करने का अकथित निर्देश दिया गया है। आप इसे अत्यधिक आपत्तिजनक पाते हैं और प्रबंधन के उच्च अधिकारियों से विरोध जताते हैं, लेकिन वे दृढ़ हैं क्योंकि वे सभी अनावश्यक व्यय में कमी करना चाहते हैं।

इस जानकारी के आधार पर, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों का उत्तर दीजिए:

- इस स्थिति में हितधारकों और उनके हितों की पहचान कीजिए।
- वे धर्मसंकट क्या हैं जिनका ऐसी परिस्थिति में भर्ती प्रबंधक द्वारा सामना किया जा सकता है?
- आपके पास उपलब्ध विभिन्न विकल्प क्या हैं? आप किसका अनुसरण करेंगे और क्यों?

Ethics in corporate sector is an important as ethics in public sector, especially due to growing influence of private sector.

a)

Stakeholders  
i) Me and my Professional and Personal Values

- ii) The higher management of the firm
- iii) Shareholders of the company
- iv) Government and the Rule of law
- v) Potential women candidates
- vi) ~~Male~~ candidates Employing women employees

### Interests

- i) Me → Upholding my personal values while promoting interest of firm.
- ii) Higher management → cut costs
- iii) Shareholders → maximise returns
- iv) Government → promote interests of women while

maximum Base 1 Doing Business

- v) Women candidates → equal employment opportunities
- v) Women employees → create a congenial work environment that helps them as Mothers

### b) Dilemmas faced

→ The biggest dilemma is between Personal / Human values and Professional values.

While personal values desire gender justice, professional values of cutting costs are against it.

→ Constitutional values of Women empowerment vs Private Interests.

→ Short term profits vs long term credibility of firm

→ Order of seniors vs creating congenial working environment.  
→ My career vs social interests

c)

Options available

- i) Talk to the shareholders of the firm, and Women Director
- ii) Re-request higher management
- iii) Incentivising women employees & working mothers to raise voices
- iv) Taking help from external agencies like National Commission of women
- v) Resigning & revealing the details on Social Media
- vi) Appointing women candidates

In this light, I'd follow a step by step approach.

I'd first ~~seek~~ re-  
request and would point on  
the benefit of having women  
employees on credibility of a  
firm and long term profits.

In case, they are unwilling,  
I'd try and talk to the  
shareholders at the AGM.

Then after, I'd try and  
persuade women director,  
independent director and women  
employees to take up the  
issue. If I am empowered, I'll appoint  
the women candidate.

In case they are unwilling,  
I'd left with no choice but to  
call for support of NCA and  
to reveal the modus operandi

an social media resigning.  
This may not be in the best  
interest of firm, but it would  
uphold the ideals of gender justice &  
benefit company in long run.

10. There has been a perceptible rise in the cost of healthcare services provided by private hospitals. In absence of adequate and quality government hospitals, people are forced to opt for private hospitals, especially for life threatening diseases and injuries. You recently visit one of your friends admitted in a famous private hospital. You found out that the hospital is charging a huge amount of money, which seems to be unreasonable. You confront the staff and ask them to explain the rationale behind such high charges.

Their response is that the charges are fair for the kind of services they are providing.

- (a) What are the ethical issues involved in this situation?
- (b) Given how other professions price their services, discuss the feasibility of capping the amount of fees charged by doctors and private hospitals.
- (c) How can the provision of quality services and need for profit be reconciled with society's interests in this case? 20

निजी अस्पतालों द्वारा प्रदान की जाने वाली स्वास्थ्य सेवाओं की लागत में सुस्पष्ट वृद्धि हुई है। पर्याप्त और गुणवत्ता पूर्ण सरकारी अस्पतालों के अभाव में, लोग निजी अस्पतालों का विकल्प चुनने के लिए विवश हैं, विशेषकर जीवन के लिए खतरनाक बीमारियों और चोटों हेतु। आप हाल ही में एक प्रसिद्ध निजी अस्पताल में भर्ती अपने मित्र से मिलने जाते हैं। आपको पता चलता है कि अस्पताल बड़ी धनराशि वसूल रहा है जो आपको अनुचित या आवश्यकता से अधिक प्रतीत होता है। आप कर्मचारियों से बातचीत करते हैं और उनसे इस प्रकार के उच्च शुल्क के पीछे का तर्क समझाने के लिए कहते हैं। उनकी प्रतिक्रिया यह है कि उनके द्वारा जिस प्रकार की सेवाएँ प्रदान की जाती हैं उसके लिए यह शुल्क उचित है।

- (a) इस स्थिति से जुड़े नैतिक मुद्दे क्या हैं?
- (b) यह देखते हुए कि अन्य व्यवसाय अपनी सेवाओं का मूल्य कैसे तय करते हैं, चिकित्सकों और निजी अस्पतालों द्वारा आरोपित शुल्क की राशि पर सीमा निर्धारित करने की व्यवहार्यता पर चर्चा कीजिए।
- (c) इस प्रकरण में गुणवत्ता परक सेवाओं के प्रबंध और लाभ की आवश्यकता का समाज के हितों के साथ सामंजस्य कैसे स्थापित किया जा सकता है?

The case highlights the  
growing inequitable growths  
in our country.

- a) Ethical issues involved
- i) Public welfare and <sup>required</sup> provision of cheap essential services
  - ii) Right of a private company to price it appropriately to maximise profits
  - iii) Inadequate facilities in govt hospitals, prevalance of corruption & public doctors private practises
  - iv) The growing value crisis in society where self benefits are prioritised over social goals, and apathy to others is shown
- b) Freedom to price items from Right to freedom

of Profession (Article 19) & freedom to engage in trade & commerce (Article 301) of the constitution. However, no right is absolute & state may take up such efforts for public welfare. As the capping of stent prices now, it can lead to significant price cuts and help poor people. It enhance right to life (Article 21) goals of constitution increasing welfare.

At same time, capping may cause :-

1. legal hurdles → as seen over stent capping
2. May curb Ease of Doing Business & rift with

Private may grow.

3. May lead to exit of private companies and cut ~~up~~ on R&D expenditure

4. It could eventually cause unemployment especially of low value addition jobs like Nurses.

Hence, a total cap may not be fair

c) Ways to Reconcile

1. Some services should be categorised as Essential in nature, eg. those saving life and their price can be capped under Deer Price Control Order, 2013, whereas Private should be given pricing

- freedom wrt others.
- ii) State should increase expenditure on Public Hospitals & improve their infrastructure.
  - iii) Public Doctors engaging in private practice need to be penalised.
  - iv) Setting up of Generic Medicine centers & prescribing doctors to recommend such medicines.
  - v) Private should be encouraged to set up CSR facilities & provide free services.
  - vi) State should provide for Open-source R&D expenditure with private help to reduce costs of certain techniques.

This way, divergent interests can be reconciled.

11. You are the District Magistrate in a district where a significant number of transgenders reside. While discrimination against the community is well known, commuters increasingly complain of harassment at their hands, especially at traffic junctions where transgenders are mostly involved in begging. This, at times, also leads to traffic management issues. You have received a number of complaints in this regard and have to act quickly to resolve it. However, a group of transgender associations argue that begging is their only source of livelihood.

Given the situation, answer the following questions:

(a) Describe the ethical issues involved in this case. Discuss the attitude of people towards transgenders in general and reasons for the same.

(b) What possible courses of action can be undertaken in such situations? Discuss their merits and demerits. 20

आप ऐसे जिले में जिला मजिस्ट्रेट हैं जहां ट्रांसजेंडर की बड़ी संख्या रहती है। यद्यपि इस समुदाय के विरुद्ध भेदभाव सुविद्यत है, तथापि यात्री उनके हाथों, विशेषकर यातायात जंक्शनों पर, अधिकाधिक उत्पीड़न की शिकायत करते हैं, जहां ट्रांसजेंडर अधिकांशतः भीख मांगने में शामिल होते हैं। कभी-कभी, इससे यातायात प्रबंधन की समस्या भी पैदा होती है। इस संबंध में आपको कई शिकायतें मिली हैं और इसे हल करने के लिए शीघ्र कार्रवाई करनी है। हालांकि, ट्रांसजेंडर संघ के एक समूह का कहना है कि भीख मांगना उनकी आजीविका का एकमात्र स्रोत है।

इस स्थिति को देखते हुए, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों का उत्तर दीजिए:

(a) इस प्रकरण में जुड़े नैतिक मुद्दों का वर्णन कीजिए। ट्रांसजेंडर लोगों के प्रति जनसामान्य के सामान्य दृष्टिकोण और उसके कारणों पर चर्चा कीजिए।

(b) ऐसी स्थिति में क्या संभव कार्रवाई की जा सकती है? उनके गुणों और अवगुणों पर चर्चा कीजिए।

a) Transgenders are a vulnerable and disadvantaged community of India. However, their interests should go with the overall societal aims.

- a) Issues involved
- i) Discrimination faced by Transgenders & Regressive attitude of society towards them
  - ii) Economic hardships faced by them
  - iii) Right of Transgenders to undertake a profession (Article 19)
  - iv) As well as Rule of the law which currently bans begging.
  - v) Privacy (Article 21) of common people is at stake and they face Harassments and Abuse.
  - vi) ~~There~~ Smooth traffic movements are in disturbed creating a loss to entire society.

The general attitude towards Transgender is regressive in nature. They are evaluated as 'Impure', are seen as an interference in private lives of people & people are unsympathetic.

The reasons are  
multifold :-

- i) Rigid view on gender notion
- ii) Religious norms which often discriminate against them
- iii) Intrusion of Transgender and 'forced begging' or train & roads
- iv) Fear from Transgender because of their general involvement in sexual slavery.

b) This, situation, now needs reconciliation of both interests

Options

i) Skilling & ~~Emp~~providing jobs to Transgenders (y. reservation)

Merits

It provides economic empowerment, enhances dignity & reduces begging related issues

Demerits

Societal attitudes may still be regressive & some may continue to beg

ii) Rehabilitating Transgenders ~~and~~ to a different location of ~~work~~ work

i) Short term problem can be cured

Demerits

May proliferate the issue in another area.

ii) Restricting Beggings on  
Important roads by active Monitoring

Merits  
Improves traffic  
wors & reduces  
harassment

Demerits  
Economic  
conditions can  
worsen of  
transgender.

ii) Organising Community level  
meetings involving both  
transgender, locals as well  
as NGOs, to ~~to~~ reduce friction

Merits  
Repressive  
attitude may  
change

Demerits  
People may not  
comply.

Thus, in short run,  
banning of begging on <sup>input-</sup> roads  
is required, but, in long  
run, focus on community level

12. Mr. X is the head of an NGO working in the field of environment conservation and protection. He is in dire need of funds for the NGO's operations and payments to his staff. He is approached by an official of a large infrastructure company, who is ready to provide the required funding for the NGO. But, in a quid pro quo, he asks Mr. X to raise objections over the bypassing of Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) norms in an ongoing PPP project through his NGO. This project is being implemented by a rival infrastructure company. Mr. X knows that there have been instances of high level corruption in the process of granting EIA to mega projects and the information provided by the official seems to be authentic. Hence, he accepts the money and agrees to raise the objection.

(a) Considering the circumstances of the case, is Mr. X correct in accepting the money? Give appropriate reasons for your answer.

(b) If you were in place of Mr. X, what would have been your course of action? Give reasons for it.

श्री एक्स पर्यावरण संरक्षण और सुरक्षा के क्षेत्र में कार्यरत एक NGO (गैर सरकारी संगठन) के प्रमुख हैं। उन्हें NGO के संचालन और कर्मचारियों को भुगतान करने हेतु धन की अत्यन्त आवश्यकता है। एक बड़ी इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर कंपनी का एक अधिकारी उनसे संपर्क करता है। कंपनी NGO के लिए आवश्यक फंड उपलब्ध कराने को तैयार है। लेकिन उसके बदले वह कंपनी यह चाहती है कि श्री एक्स अपने NGO के माध्यम से चल रही PPP परियोजना में पर्यावरण प्रभाव आकलन (EIA) मानदंडों की अवहेलना पर आपत्तियां उठाएं। यह परियोजना प्रतिद्वंद्वी इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर कंपनी द्वारा कार्यान्वित की जा रही है। श्री एक्स को पता है कि बड़े प्रोजेक्ट्स के लिए EIA प्रदान करने की प्रक्रिया में उच्च स्तरीय भ्रष्टाचार के मामले सामने आए हैं और अधिकारियों द्वारा दी गई जानकारी प्रामाणिक प्रतीत होती है। इसलिए, वह धन स्वीकार कर लेते हैं और आपत्ति उठाने के लिए सहमत हो जाते हैं।

(a) प्रकरण की परिस्थितियों को ध्यान में रखते हुए, क्या श्री एक्स का धन स्वीकार करना सही है? अपने उत्तर के लिए उचित कारण दीजिए।

(b) यदि आप श्री एक्स के स्थान पर होते, तो आप क्या कदम उठाते? इसके कारण बताइए।

a) No, Mr X is not correct in accepting the money.

The quid-pro-quo nature  
converts the exchange of  
money into a bribe.

Also merely on allegations  
and past trends, Mr X  
has come to a conclusion  
which may not be  
correct. In the process,  
~~as~~ he may end up  
sullied the image of  
~~the~~ an honest person.

And the development  
goals may be subverted  
if the PPP undergoes  
unnecessary delays.

Moreover, his NGO  
gets meddled in corporate  
politics.

that could eventually harm  
him and his MCO.

~~The intention~~  
At the same time,  
the intention of Mr X to  
increase transparency,  
check corruption <sup>in PPP</sup> appears  
novel.

b)

~~I would have~~  
~~requested~~  
I would have requested  
the infrastructure company  
not to provide money  
on a quid-pro-quo  
basis, explaining him/her  
that in this way we  
both ~~we~~ would be violating  
laws of the country of

would get in trouble.

Instead as a  
dedicated Environmental NCD,  
I would have gladly  
received his inputs on EIA.

And would have used  
it for further investigation  
~~and~~ to ensure that  
environment does not  
get degraded & corruption  
does not. ~~how me a~~  
now. Then after ~~as I~~  
would have taken the  
help of tools like RTI  
to increase transparency  
in the project. And only  
if I find sufficient

widener, would I have  
agitated.

As far as financial  
issues are concerned,  
it is always possible to  
get it from other  
companionate individuals  
or organisation or govt

Even the industrial  
firm's money can be taken  
provided I clearly warn  
them that there will be  
no quid-pro-quo basis

~~and~~ Money is temporary.  
But, integrity is permanent  
and must be protected  
by all means.

13. You are a civil servant posted in a state where elections were recently held. The newly elected Chief Minister had promised to ban alcohol in several of his election campaigns as well as his election manifesto, which was widely praised and supported by women of the state. Fulfilling his electoral promise, the Chief Minister has ordered a blanket ban on the sale of alcohol in the state. Following the ban, concerns have been raised about the feasibility of the ban and whether the government should interfere in what is considered by many to be a matter of personal choice.

- (a) Who are the stakeholders in this case and how are they affected by the ban?
- (b) Is blanket ban on alcohol a feasible action?
- (c) Identify the issues that may arise while enforcing the ban and the steps you will take to handle them, as a civil servant. 25

आप एक गैरे राज्य में सिविल सेवक के रूप में तैनात हैं जहां हाल ही में चुनाव हुए थे। नव निर्वाचित मुख्यमंत्री ने अपने कई चुनावी अभियानों के साथ-साथ चुनाव घोषणापत्र में शराब पर प्रतिबंध लगाने का वादा किया था, जिसकी राज्य की महिलाओं ने व्यापक रूप से प्रशंसा की थी और समर्थन दिया था। अपने चुनावी वादे को पूरा करते हुए, मुख्यमंत्री ने राज्य में शराब की विक्री पर पूर्ण प्रतिबंध का आदेश दिया है। प्रतिबंध के बाद, प्रतिबंध की व्यवहार्यता पर प्रश्न उठाए गये हैं और क्या सरकार द्वारा शराब पर प्रतिबंध जिसे कई लोगों द्वारा व्यक्तिगत पसंद का विषय बताया गया है, उस मुद्दे पर हस्तक्षेप करना चाहिए।

- (a) इस मामले में हितधारक कौन हैं और प्रतिबंध से वे किस प्रकार प्रभावित हैं?
- (b) क्या शराब पर पूर्ण प्रतिबंध एक व्यवहार्य कार्रवाई है?
- (c) एक सिविल सेवक के रूप में इन प्रतिबंधों को लागू करते समय उत्पन्न होने वाली समस्याओं की पहचान करें और उनसे निपटने हेतु आप क्या कदम उठाएंगे।

→ a) Stakeholders | How affected

i) Women | May reduce Domestic violence & empower women

ii) Government | Benefit from reduced Crime, reduced

<u>Stakeholders</u>	<u>How affected</u>
ii) <u>C.P.M</u>	<p>traffic accidents (as seen in Bihar). But, its <u>revenue declines</u></p> <p>gains electoral advantage &amp; his conscience may <del>benefit</del> be rewarded due to upholding of <u>Democratic ethos</u>.</p>
iv) <u>Alcohol drinkers</u>	<p>May suffer from <u>Addiction syndrome</u> in short run. But in long run, health benefits &amp; higher savings.</p> <p>However, their <u>right to Privacy</u> could be 'infringed'</p>
v) <u>Administrators (including me)</u>	<p>Are discharged with <u>duty of better</u></p>

checks & need to be vigilant.

b) Blanket ban upholds democratic ethos, (women concern), improves gender justice & helps to fulfil Directive Principles of Constitution (Article 47) & ~~increases~~ reduces crime rates.

However, its feasibility is ~~restricted~~ limited due to Alcohol trade from other border states, alcohol manufacturing moving underground and, legal travellers (Panna HC suspended the ban) ~~and~~ possibility of widespread opposition. ~~and the role~~

Plus, a ban culture may not be the most desired alternative in a Democratic State that values Individual liberty. Also, Alcohol manufacturers suffer economically

c) Issues that can arise:-

i) Hooh trade & manufacture may multiply & could lead to greater casualties.

ii) Alcohol may move underground & would function in an opaque way

iii) Trade from neighbouring States could increase in way of smuggling

iv) Rise in alcohol prices

in black market may  
rise need of volume

- v) Opposition from status quo may increase.  
vi) De-addiction syndromes would rise
- Steps to handle

i) ~~the~~ Better border checks using CTV cameras & scanners to reduce smuggling

ii) Establishing a Feedback Mechanism where people can anonymously identify & locate hoax manufacturing zone.

iii) ~~the~~ setting up of De-addiction centers

taking help of NGOs  
like Anonymous International

- iv) Involving women to  
help in de-addiction
- v) Sensitising people  
vi) Coordinating with crisis departments
- However, if I  
also involved in  
Am Policy making,  
I would try and make  
policies to provide economic  
incentive to the ~~de~~ addicted  
to act as a nudge, would  
coordinate with other states  
to minimise smuggling  
and would set up convert  
alcohol shops into other  
employers productive use,  
y. setting of Milk booths.

Overall, this would help  
in smooth transition

14. Regulation and procedure of human clinical trials vary from nation to nation. Stem cell research, as an emerging biomedical field, requires approval for human trials and encounters multiple challenges. You are the head of a team of scientists who developed a new Tissue Engineering system, which appears to be a promising means of regenerating heart tissue. Trials of the system have already been conducted on animals and yielded good results. Millions of people suffering from critical heart diseases would benefit immensely if this medication is immediately made available to them. However, you need to conduct human clinical trials before it could be commercialised. It is also known that the stringent regulatory environment in the country will mean that human trials and final approval will take many years before it is made commercially available. On the other hand, regulation of clinical trials in many poor countries is weak and quick approval is possible. Many of your competitors also resort to human trials in these countries, often bribing the officials for getting quick approvals.

Given this situation, answer the following questions:

- (a) Identify the ethical issues which arise during clinical trials.  
(b) Given the above situation, would you prefer to shift human trials to a third country where regulations are lax? Give reasons in support of your choice.  
(c) Suggest a framework of standard procedure to minimise ethical conflicts and speed-up the approval process of new medicines.

25

मानव पर नैदानिक परीक्षण (clinical trials) के विनियम और प्रक्रियाएं राष्ट्र-दर-राष्ट्र भिन्न हैं। एक उभरते बायोमेडिकल क्षेत्र के रूप में स्टेम सेल शोध के लिए मानवीय परीक्षणों हेतु स्वीकृति की आवश्यकता होती है और इसे चुनौतियों का सामना करना पड़ता है। आप वैज्ञानिकों के एक दल के नेतृत्वकर्ता हैं जिन्होंने एक नई टिशू इंजीनियरिंग सिस्टम विकसित किया है जो हृदय के उत्तकों (टिशूज) को पुनः पैदा करने हेतु आशावादी साधन नजर आता है। इस सिस्टम का पहने ही जानवरों पर परीक्षण किया जा चुका है और उसके अच्छे परिणाम मिले हैं। गंभीर हृदय रोगों से जूझते लाखों-लाख लोगों को इसे अत्यधिक लाभ होगा यदि यह इलाज उनके लिए शीघ्र उपलब्ध करा दिया जाता है। हालांकि इसके वाणिज्यीकरण से पूर्व मानव पर नैदानिक परीक्षण करने की आवश्यकता होती है। यह भी ज्ञात है कि इसके वाणिज्यिक रूप से (बाजार में) उपलब्ध होने से पूर्व देश में विनियमन संबंधी कठोर वातावरण के कारण मानवीय परीक्षण और अंतिम स्वीकृति में वर्षों लग जाएंगे। वहीं दूसरी ओर बहुत से गरीब राष्ट्रों में नैदानिक परीक्षण सम्बन्धी विनियमन ढीले हैं और शीघ्र स्वीकृति संभव है। आपके बहुत-से प्रतिद्वंदी भी नैदानिक परीक्षण हेतु प्रायः ऐसे राष्ट्रों का रुख करते हैं जहां वे अधिकारियों को रिश्वत दे कर शीघ्र स्वीकृति प्राप्त कर लेते हैं।

दी गई परिस्थिति के अनुसार निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों के उत्तर दीजिए:

- (a) नैदानिक परीक्षण के दौरान उभरने वाले नैतिक मुद्दों की पहचान कीजिए।  
(b) दी गई उपर्युक्त परिस्थिति में, क्या आप मानवीय परीक्षणों को किसी तीसरे देश में स्थानांतरित करना पसंद करेंगे जहां विनियमन ढीले हैं? अपने चयन हेतु कारण दीजिए।  
(c) नैतिक संघर्ष को कम करने एवं नई दवाइयों हेतु स्वीकृति की प्रक्रिया को तीव्र करने के लिए मानक प्रक्रिया का एक प्रारूप सुझाइए।

a)

Issues

- i) Clinical trials are a pre-requisite to ~~set up~~ ~~the~~ ~~inventive~~ R&D in health.
- ii) They enable availability of novel situations, <sup>medicines</sup> as the case suggests
- iii) However, Clinical trials are often conducted without Adequate Transparency ( without making the human undergoing trials aware about the Complications.)
- iv) Can violate Right to Life of these patients due

to generation of unnecessary  
undesired complications.

v) Clinical trials on animal  
raise issue of equality  
and ~~fair~~ of handling  
of all species

vi) ~~Prevalence of~~

vii) Unnecessary delays during  
clinical trial that  
reduces the scope of  
treatment of wounded  
patients

b) ~~Shifting~~ Shifting to a 2<sup>nd</sup>  
country may allow me  
to commercialise faster and  
help to save more lives.  
It would also benefit my

team / group / firm that  
I am part of.

But, in spite of it  
I'd not shift the checks  
because :-

- i) Such a step, where bribing  
takes place, always involves  
uncertainty
- ii) ~~It~~ It would reduce the  
credibility of the group/  
company and may harm  
long term interests
- iii) ~~It~~ An regulation may  
ultimately harm the  
patients, if a spurious  
product gets an approval

b) Such a step may not provide legal sanctity in the home country.

Hence, it is better to have delays instead of having a system that is fast but is Opaque & can be injurious in long run.

c) Basics of the framework should focus on: —

i) Conducting virtual clinical trials ~~or~~ using computer simulations, first of all. This would provide fast and pretty accurate results.

ii) Some tests which are not

life threatening can be expedited while stringent checks on others should be maintained.

ii) ~~patient~~ consent should be made mandatory. This should be explained unambiguously to those offering for trials.

10) Video Recording Procedure  
 11) Patients suffering from life threatening diseases may be given an alternative/choice to consume ~~rather~~ <sup>medicines</sup> ~~installation~~ a ~~device~~ still undergoing clinical trials.

vi) International Cooperation under the aegis of WHO should expand to allow exchange of data & faster ~~the~~ verification & R&D ~~in area~~ cooperation

Call us : 8468022022

Visit us : [www.visionias.in](http://www.visionias.in)

ii) Using Single Window framework such steps would

increase speed while maintaining regulatory checks.