

2. (a) Critically discuss Marxist approach to the analysis of Indian Nationalism. 20
- (b) Discuss the impact of Bhakti movement on the Indian society. 15
- (c) Compare M.N Srinivas and Louis Dumont's understanding of Indian caste system. 15
3. (a) Critically analyze the changing caste-class nexus in the agrarian social structure. 25
- (b) 'Modernization in the Indian context is a complex phenomenon involving both continuity and change'. Comment 25
4. (a) The colonial rule engendered various movements as a reaction to it. Discuss the nature of these movements and its impact on Indian society. 25
- (b) What evidence would you offer against the view that tribes are primitive communities living isolated lives untouched by civilization'? 15
- (c) Give a brief analysis of G.S Ghurye's understanding of Indian Civilization. 10
5. (a) Write a short note on each of the following in not more than 100 words. 10 x 3 = 30
- I. Dominant Caste
- II. Village studies in Indian sociology
- III. Indological approach to the study of Indian society
- (b) "Are Tribal protests and movements an indication of limitation of the policy of integration in the independent India". Comment 20
1. (a) Sanskritization and structural changes
- (b) Caste among Muslims in India

(c) Social differentiation among Tribes.

(d) Land reforms and transition in the agrarian relations

30th Sep

Name - Ila Tripathi

Reg. # - 13203

2(a) Marx and Engel said in book 'Asiatic mode of production' that oppression of the British can only be removed by socialism not Nationalism.

Indian Marxist thinkers like Rajni Patle Dutt, VI Panlov and AR Desai believed that Indian nationalism was a class movement which was led by the upper class which controlled the mass interest. They were educated and mobilised the masses to suit their own interest. They mention works of Dattabhai Naoroji - Economic Drain of India and R.C Dutt to advocate that bourgeoisie of Indian Nationalism exploited the masses (proletariat) of colonial India.

Marxist say colonial India was a class stratified society with peasant forming the proletariat and lawyers and landlords being the bourgeoisie. The Indian press was owned by the bourgeoisie who published partisan content to further their own cause.

Indian bourgeoisie wanted to remove colonial rule as they wanted sole ownership of resources.

However, Sumit Sarkar criticises this view by stating Indian society as not polarised at time of national movement.

Bipin Chandra adds that Indian nationalists

had the common goal of throwing away British.

18 (2) Surendranath Banerjee criticises Marxists for being economic deterministic and seeing economic life as the base of society.

Marxist approach links nationalism with economic life. It does account for atrocities of British inflicted in economic terms but fails to emphasise the unity in nationalist leaders of all ranks.

2(b) Bhakti movement was a 12th century movement that had secular and simple themes. Its basic tenets were - devotion to god leads to salvation, practice brotherhood, discarded 'ritualisation' of religion, equality of mankind. There were Nayanars in South India that followed Shiva's ideology while Alvars were Vishnu followers.

Bhakti Movement spread in various parts of India providing respite from rituals. In Maharashtra, Tukaram preached oneness of mankind. This provided relief from disability of caste system - like untouchability and rituals.

In Bengal, Chaitanya Mahaprabhu preached the Gaudiya cult which emphasised on devotion over rituals. This presented brahmanical supremacy.

Saints like Kabir and Ramdas belonged to backward castes. Their works created fraternity in a highly fractured society. Pg ③

In Assam, Shankaracharya preached true devotion through simple prayers devoid of pompous prayers. This was effective in sensitising masses against superficial rituals.

In several parts of South India, Bhakti saints emphasised equality of men and women. This led to upliftment of women. Also, the concept of purity and polluted was discarded and exploitation of Shudras and Ati-Shudras was contained.

Nirgun Saint Guru Nanak preached no idol worship. This made religion a gateway to divinity instead of Sanskritisation.

In sum, Bhakti saints bolstered every aspect of social life. Culturally they led to development of vernacular languages, folk music (Abhangas). They also ushered an egalitarian society ensuring social justice.

210 Srinivas was a structure-functionalist who pg 4
saw caste system as reciprocity based. In his
work 'Society and Religion in the Coorgs of Mysore',
Srinivas highlights the role of caste system in
fostering 'solidarity'.

Louis Dumont in his book 'Homo Hierarchus'
sees caste as a system particular only to India
and as a handicap. Unlike Srinivas, he did not
see caste as reciprocity based but coercive.

Srinivas' caste system derived authority
from 'dominant caste' that was numerically
predominant and economically well-off. Dumont
based caste system on basis of 'purity and pollution'.
The lower class does defiling activity considered
polluting by upper caste.

Srinivas believed caste system did have
provision for mobility through sanskritisation-
process of ritual practicing by inter-mediate caste
to get a higher social rank. Dumont considers
caste system is a 'hierarchy' based unequal
system with little room for mobility.

Srinivas propagates a structural
universalistic approach by identifying caste
role in all societies while Dumont has
a culturally particularistic approach towards
Indian caste system.

Srinivas as an Indologist studied India as a nationalist and diffusionist while Dumont studied as an Orientalist criticising primitive and oppressive Indian society.

Though different, Both explains general dimensions of Indian caste system to provide a holistic view.

3(a) The village studies in India derived that caste system in India has two components - ritual and secular - this pertained to ownership of land by the dominant/higher caste.

However, Louis Dumont opined that ownership of land and status were not linked. Status was decided by ritual rank.

Andre Beteille in his book 'Inequality among men' believed status was dependent on class and not caste.

With changing times, the relation between caste and class has fused. In case of agrarian society this has resulted from ownership of land.

Rajni Kothari in his book Caste in Indian Politics notes on increasing participation of intermediary castes in polity. The Yadavs, Reddys, Kommams have risen to become political leaders who in turn own land and are the new upper class.

Apart from political mobilization, policy of reservation in education and jobs have led to rise of what Sachidanand Sinha calls as 'Hawiyam Elites' in Bihar.

Pg 6
The caste and class boundaries have diffused as the ritually high rank caste may no longer command the same class.

Rudolph and Rudolph noted that with change in ownership of political wealth and constitutional safeguards the Shanmams (now Nadars) of Kerala command respect due to high class status.

Additionally, government initiative like Community Development Programme, decentralisation of power through Panchayati system have led to rise of intermediary caste.

However, a criticism of this fusion of caste-class boundary comes in the form of rising caste conflicts. Jats and Rajputs - different in caste status - demand equal class due to ownership of land. Case study of Jats of Agra by Lynch in his book 'Untouchability of Politics' shows violence from upper caste to command respect while Jats defer.

The ritually high caste may no longer be the high class as well in an agrarian set up. This has led to decreased exploitation and brahmanical supremacy but has led to caste conflicts. Sociologists believe Meeker's trinitarian model of class, status and party is the way ahead for Indian agrarian society.

3b) Yogendra Singh describes modern social changes in terms of additive, synthetic, disruptive and disjunct changes.

While additive and synthetic have provided impetus to existing traditional practices, disjunct has had no impact and disruptive has changed the entire system.

Indian workforce today works on computers, this has been an additive change that has improved over traditional working while business process outsourcing (BPO) industry has been disruptive as it ushered IT revolution and brought jobs in service sector migrating from agriculture.

The Liberalisation-Privatisation-Globalisation & changes under New Economic Policy brought change. The rise of Indian Middle class and increased consumerism were the changes.

But modernity in the form of Green Revolution continued our dependence on agriculture as we applied technology for better production.

Homener the process of modernisation in Indian context has suffered cultural lag. Ogburn and Nimkoff opine that material and non-material things change at different rate. While material changes like technology change rapidly, non-material things like culture

are unable to keep pace with the changes.

⑧ Durkheim calls it a state of anomie where our traditional values are not worthy of continuity.

Merton believes in modernity, continuity causes deviance resulting from Anomie.

The Lancet, a British medical journal, has termed India the most depressed nation.

Sociologists see this as a social change brought by modern values which has not percolated in our traditional set up.

Modernization that has proposed change has questioned established authority. Religion fundamentalism is a by-product of modern changes that challenge secular forces.

Democracy however has been a continuity in modern times. We ~~have~~ ^{are} moving from caste based to development based politics.

Modernization is an Indian mix of the incumbent and the emerging. It has led to conflicts but has also brought prosperity. It has fostered bonds, brought equity and reduced exploitation. We hope to overcome our baggage that hinders our progress through modernization.

4(a) Indian colonial rule was criticised for 'Colonial Imperialism' where Christian missionaries were ^{pg 19} accused of eroding Indian culture. Western clothing and education was criticised by Burukul system. The policy of 'Divide and Rule' created fissures in Indian society.

In reaction to these policies, the Indian intelligentsia organised peasant, tribals movements. Kathleen Gough classifies these movements as reactionary, political, conservative, secessionist and separatist.

The 1857 revolt was a reactionary movement where fat greased cartridge became immediate cause of a long precipitating oppression.

Political movements resulted in the form of Khilafat and Non-Cooperation Movement where foreign goods were boycotted and taxes were not paid.

Conservative movements sought to preserve Indian culture from British encroachment. Deoband movement was led by Muslim Ulemas in United Province against westernisation of Islam. Kondh tribe of East Bengal and Bihar reformed movement against colonial prohibition of their traditional practice

Pg 10) The Ahoms of Assam started a secessionist movement against British construction of road through Imphal as a way to conquer North-East. The tribe under Tulok Singh started a tribal movement to secede from British India.

The greatest of all this was the separatist movement led under the idea of Pakistan - Punjab, Kashmir, Baluchistan, Sindh - as independent state away from Indian dominion. The Partition Movement led to division of West Punjab and East Bengal into Pakistan and Bangladesh (then East Pakistan) respectively.

The movements organised under retaliation to British brought positive as well as negative change. Some brought wide spread violence while other preserved distinct Indian culture. In sum, they showed to British that Indians will not be mute spectators to colonial atrocities.

As Winston Churchill noted 'Indians retaliated not for their purse but preservation (of) their culture?'

4(b) India is home to 700 tribes, second only to Pg 111 Africa. However, as primitive inhabitants, they are considered devoid of mainstream influence. Verrier Elwin suggested policy of isolation to preserve their distinct culture.

However, these tribes have not been untouched by civilisation. Indologist G.S. Ghurye quotes Ramayam where Nishad, a tribal, considered himself an integral part of Ayodhya kingdom and helped Rama cross the river.

L.P. Vidyarthi in his study of Mangli tribes noted a political system present in the tribes.

Surajit Singh in his study of tribes in Odisha presence of administrative units, much like city like civilisation,

G.S. Ghurye studied the Khasi of Western Ghats and concluded tribes as backward Hindus. He advocated a policy of assimilation.

T.N. Madam and D.N. Mahandae cited practice of 'beude peice' as similar to dummy of civilisations.

However, there are distinct features too. F.C. Bailey notes practice of Animals Animism instead of Hinduism.

Anil Aggarwal notes very low education level and overwhelming dependence

on agriculture among tribals.

Pg (12)

Louis Dumont and Beteille refute claims of tribals being a 'caste' in Hindus since they vary in religious and cultural practices.

Primitive tribes have had distinct culture, economy and religion. But it is inappropriate to term them as completely isolated from mainstream civilisation.

4(c) G.S. Ghurye was an Indologist who wrote 'Caste and Race in India' to present a picture of Indian culture that refuted orientalist claims of India being oppressive.

His approach was of cultural unity where he identified India under common culture.

Ghurye based on ancient texts for basing his studies. He sought supremacy of the Vedas. He considered caste system as the subject matter forming occupational division of labour.

He considered Aryans as the natural successors of Indian civilization.

According to him, Indians are born from 8 Rishis of Rig Vedic times

Ghurye believed in Purushsukta for defining varna system in modern civilisation where different castes/varna originated from different body parts. Pg 13

Ghurye believed that as society evolved caste s/m would change gradually and not disintegrate completely.

Ghurye refuted Orientalist claims that Indian civilisation was non-egalitarian 'by mentioning female Vedic scholars like Chanda, Apsara.

However, Srinivas criticises Ghurye's view as 'text-view'

Yogendra Singh and A R Desai doubt the empirical authenticity of ancient texts.

5(a) I. Dominant Caste was defined by M. N. Srinivas as numerically dominant caste that wielded economic power and was ritually high ranked. However, in modern times, ritual high rank is not a prerequisite.

Due to Panchayati system and Land Reforms new dominant castes have arisen from intermediary castes like Yadav, Reddy. Policy of reservation has made Dalits as dominant caste in parts of Uttar Pradesh. Bachchanand

Sinha notes rise of Kaaryain elites as dominant caste due to reservation in Bihar.
Pg (14)

Louis Dumont criticises the definition of Dominant class since numerical majority not necessary.

Dominant class concept has led to caste conflict but helped Indology in understanding caste system through field view.

5(ii) Village studies were proposed by Malinowski in Anthropology

Indian village studies studied caste system through a field view - F. O. Bailey in his study of

Bisipara village of Odisha concluded ritually high rank demanded his status irrespective of their eating habits.

Maciell in his study of Kudromgarhi noted disparity between ranking of caste mentioned in ancient texts and the one actually practiced

Mayer studied Komkheri village and concluded 'commensality' - dining practice formed basis of caste system

Andre Betelle concluded through his study in Tanjaver district that caste system is not a closed one as claimed by Chunye.

MN Srinivas studied Kompura village and devised concept of dominant class.

19 (15) Though comprehensive, village studies were biased towards studying the structure instead of change. Also researchers were treated as higher caste and responses were biased.

(iii) Indological approach to Indian society based on cultural unity by propagating a common culture. Indologists like DN Mazumdar and RS Ghurye based on ancient texts to prove contemporary social evolution.

They refuted claims of Orientalists that claimed India to be an oppressive, non-egalitarian society.

Irawati Karve as an Indologist wrote 'Kinship Organisation in India' to show such traditional Indian joint family.

Swami Vivekananda as an Indologist refuted Max Mueller claims of Western supremacy. He claimed western culture was materialistic, hence had limited scope for happiness.

Indologists are criticised for a 'Brahminical view of Indian culture.

They are criticised for text/book view by Srinivas who proposes a field view.

Yogendra Singh doubts ancient texts as being relevant empirical sources.

Indologists presented a non-partisan, nationalist picture of Indian culture.

5(b) In Independent India, policy of integration was sought as an amalgamation of Nesher Elinin's policy of isolation and Ors Gruyer's policy of assimilation. It works on the Panchsheel doctrine of Jawaharlal Nehru that advocates skill building, minimal cultural encroachment of tribals. Pg 16

India houses second largest tribal population after Africa with 700 tribes. Post independence tribal movement home focused around encroachment of land for development projects and decreased autonomy in administration.

Recently the Supreme Court ordered quashing of Nedanta's bauxite mining in Odisha's Niyamgiri hills at plea of Kondh tribes. This was possible under the provision of Forest Right Act, 2006 that ensures no mining project started without consent of Gram Panchayat.

These tribal movements are not primarily out of integration but unsustainable use of land. Policy of Integration has increased people to people contact of tribals with mainstream which makes them vulnerable to exploitation. B.S. Guha notes a 'maladjustment' in tribes as they become materialistic.

Pg 17 Integration to mainstream has led to influx on non-tribals in tribal area. Recently, Kuki and Nagas revolted against dominance of Meitis in Namipur over employment and land.

However, policy of integration has increased literacy level among tribals, as reported by NSO's 68th round data.

Schemes like Van Bandhu Kalyan envisage infrastructure development in 10 tribal blocks in 10 states.

Isolation would have increased exploitation of tribes and assimilation would have eroded their cultural distinctiveness. Hence integration is the best possible answer.

Recent tribal movements should be seen through improved legislation and decentralisation.

2(a) Sanskritisation was defined by Srinivas as the process by which ritually lower caste gain mobility to higher rank through rituals. Pg (18)

This was however not applicable to shudras. This mobility brought social change as new castes rose to dominance.

However, with modernisation bringing drastic social change, westernisation is preferred over sanskritisation. People resort to secular means to gain economic status instead of ritual rank.

Srinivas earlier saw sanskritisation as a prelude to westernisation but later corrected himself. But he still believes that even in a changing society, westernisation and sanskritisation are inter-linked.

Milton Singer agrees with Srinivas as sanskritisation brings structural changes.

While Myrdal criticises that structural changes are a greater degree of change and does not mere envisage hierarchy. He believes technology responsible for structural change.

Andre Beteille feels structural change, unlike process change, is caused by class and not caste.

Marxist believe structural changes are brought by means of production and not caste. A.R. Desai refutes

Sanskritisation's claims to cause change in structure
Pg (19) Sanskritisation is a powerful tool of social
mobility in a caste system but it has limited role
in bringing structural changes.

(b) Although Quran - the holy book of Islam, - claims
equality of mankind, in practice Muslims are
divided into caste. The Ashrafs are considered
superior most and consist of Khans, Pathans
They are of Iranian descent and considered
pure 'Musalmeena'. They are mostly land owners.

The Azabs are considered next in
hierarchy and are mostly middle class - their
descent is of Indian origin.

The Annals are considered the lowest
in caste hierarchy. They are mostly Dalit
converts from Hinduism.

These groups are endogamous and
untouchability exists in lower status.

In 2007, Dalit Aid Foundation published
'India Untouched' and concluded untouchability
and caste system present in Indian Muslims
is as virulent form as in Hindus.

11c) Tribals were defined by W.J. Perry as group of families that have distinct culture in given geographic boundaries.

eg (20) However with constitutional safeguards and legislation some tribes have developed differentiation

Naturally, tribes can be differentiated on basis of religion. Tribes of North like Lepcha are followers of Buddhism while Nagas and Kukis practice form of Hinduism in North east. Primitive tribes of Jouna and Shompen were reported to practice animism by Ridcliffe. Brown in his study 'The Andaman Islanders'

Due to reservation in jobs and education, some tribes have become prosperous over others. Meena of Rajasthan are very prominent in civil services. While tribes like Buxa and Mishing report low education.

Economically, while North east tribes remain particularly agnation while North and central tribes have switched to craftsmanship.

Also, most tribes are patriarchal in kinship while Garo and Seima Nag are matrilinal.

Social differentiation based on religion, economy, occupation have developed in recent times as we integrate tribals in mainstream.

1(d) In colonial times, land reforms were a moot point between peasants and British. Lord Cornwallis introduced Permanent Settlement Act in 1773. P (1921)

Since then Zamindars emerged as the oppressors taxing the peasant. With independence, the government brought phased reforms with the principle of 'land to the tiller'

This changed agrarian feudal relations. Absentee landlordism was removed hence peasants were freed from middle-men. However in some cases it also led to patrilinal support from Zamindar household to peasant.

W H Muser in his book 'The Hindu Jajmani system' noted 'kamin' was given agricultural share by the Jajman - This discontinued in new land reform relations.

But the reforms of Zamindari Abolishment Act, Land Ceiling Act, Tenancy reforms reduced agrarian poverty as landless labourers were distributed surplus land.

Robert Redfield noted that Indian peasant had an emotional bonding with the land. The Land reforms ensured that the connect was changed to ownership.

Pg (22) Theodor Shamin in his description of Ideal peasant state describes domination of peasants by landlords. Land reforms have disrupted this dominance.

The recent verdict of Supreme Court to return Singer Land (West Bengal) to peasants is also a welcome step where judiciary protected interest of peasantry.

NITI Aayog has recommended legalising leasing of land to give muscle to land reforms. This would safeguard rights of tillers from unassisted eviction (bedakhi) and also ensure land owners right.

Land Reforms in India have come a long way. DN Dhanagare notes it as a major step towards agrarian empowerment.